

whatspace

Spatial precarity, gentrification,
and the arts

Part 3

Annotated Bibliography

Jessa Agilo, Series Editor



ArtsPond / Étang d'Arts
225-38 Abell Street
Toronto, ON M6J 0A2
Canada
<https://artspond.com>
hello@artspond.com

© 2020 ArtsPond / Étang d'Arts.
Licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0
International License, [CC BY 4.0](https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).

Preview edition (Sep 12, 2020)

CITATION

Agilo, J. (Series Ed), Part 3: Annotated Bibliography. In *What Space: Spatial precarity, gentrification and the arts*. Preview edition.
Toronto: ArtsPond / Étang d'Arts, 2020. <https://artspond.com/whatspace>

CONTRIBUTORS, FUNDERS, PARTNERS



An agency of the Government of Ontario
Un organisme du gouvernement de l'Ontario



Preface

What Space: Spatial precarity, gentrification, and the arts is a research series summarizing insights from **Groundstory Phase 1 (2017-2020)**. For more information about this series, please visit <https://artspond.com/whatspace>.

Incubated by ArtsPond, **Groundstory** is a collective impact effort seeking to boost spatial justice for the arts in the Greater Toronto to Hamilton Area in Ontario, Canada.

Rooted in Davenport's West Queen West (one of the fastest gentrifying areas in Toronto), the mandate of **ArtsPond** is to nurture healthy human ecosystems that promote social, spatial, economic, digital, and equity justice in Canada and beyond by fostering cooperative actions fusing values and practices of social innovation and the arts.

Groundstory Phase 1 was funded by Ontario Trillium Foundation's Collective Impact Fund, Employment and Social Development Canada, and Canada Council for the Arts' Sector Innovation and Development Program in association with **Roseneath Theatre**, a theatre company for young audiences.

Capturing stories and solutions to the effects of spatial precarity and gentrification on the arts, Groundstory Phase 1 research featured an international literature review, national survey, regional human-centered design workshops, focus groups, educational podcasts, and more. Major goals were to better illustrate the root causes, ripple effects, and responses to gentrification in the arts in the Greater Toronto to Hamilton Area plus other rapidly gentrifying communities in Ontario, Canada, and internationally. Reports in this series include:

Groundstory: Round the Block (Part 1)

Prepared by ArtsPond and Groundstory Founder **Jessa Agilo** in Spring and Summer 2020, Part 1 provides an overview of the stories, activities, resources, and knowledge gathered on spatial precarity, gentrification, and the arts as a part of Groundstory Phase 1 research (pre-coronavirus pandemic) from Spring 2017 to Winter 2020.

Groundtrust: Primer on Community and Cultural Land Trusts (Part 2)

Prepared by ArtsPond Associate Youth Researcher **Niko Casuncad** in Summer 2020, Part 2 explores pre-pandemic concepts and examples of social purpose real estate solutions to gentrification and spatial precarity for equity-seeking groups in the arts. This youth-led resource serves as an introductory guide to creative and cultural community land trusts for Black, Indigenous, and other racialized groups in arts and culture.

Annotated Bibliography (Part 3)

Part 3 provides summary annotations for prioritized resources selected from Part 4 Bibliography. Annotations were prepared by ArtsPond Associate Youth Researchers **Felicity Campbell, Cheryll Case, Michael Pereira, Monique Cheung**, and others, edited by **Jessa Agilo**. Most annotations were written between Fall 2018 and Summer 2019. They are grouped according to Groundstory's three overarching research themes: uncovering root causes, ripple effects, and responses to spatial precarity and gentrification in arts and culture.

Bibliography (Part 4)

Gathered by **Jessa Agilo, Felicity Campbell, Cheryll Case, Michael Pereira, et al**, Part 4 is a compendium of 2,000 public and academic resources applicable to spatial precarity and gentrification in arts and culture communities in Canada and internationally. Two separate bibliographies are provided: rated by relevance to Groundstory research themes (selected sources), and alphabetical (all sources). While older sources have been included for comparison, most were published between 2015 to January 2020. All sources were accessed between Spring 2017 and Winter 2020. The complete bibliography with interactive filtering by category is also available online as a free Zotero public archive. New resources will also be added to the Zotero library on an ongoing basis, accessible at: <https://www.zotero.org/groups/1784394/groundstory/library>.



Groundstory.ca



ArtsPond.com



Roseneath.ca

Acknowledgements

Team

Founder, Research Lead
Youth Associate Researchers

Jessa Agilo (ArtsPond)

Felicity Campbell

Cheryll Case

Niko Casuncad

Michael Pereira

Researchers

Kelly Hill (Hill Strategies Research)

Alix MacLean (Hill Strategies Research)

Interns

Aylin Akyol, Brenlyn Bauer, Monique Cheung,

Sheriza Anne De Guzman, Vicki Hargreaves,

Natasha Iqbal, Matt Learoyd, Katrina MacKew,

Kendra Miller, Kamila Seitkhanova, Rachel Vrecic,

Megan Wilk

Translators (English to French)

Alma Boukhaled

Francesco Spagnolo

Ayesha Veerasuntharam

Design

Agilo Arts

Research Volunteers

Anonymous

Roundtable Participants

Anonymous

Groundtrust Youth Circle

Anonymous

Fiduciary Partner

Roseneath Theatre

Special thanks to Andrew Lamb, Annemieke Wade (Roseneath Theatre), Jeremy Freiburger (Cobalt Connects), Michael Vickers, Oliver Pauk (Akin), Kendra Fry (Creative Collisions, Faith & the Common Good), Groundstory's 85 research volunteers, 150 roundtable and survey participants, Yolanda Ferrato, Patrice Mitchell, Elise Antoniadis, Darian Razdar (Reflex Urbanism, Bricks & Glitter), Joshua Brandt (Parkdale Neighbourhood Land Trust), Yves Blais, Gordon Seabright (Creative Land Trust), Anne Frost (Humber College Institute of Technology & Advanced Learning), WorkInCulture, Mass Culture, 221A, Ryerson University, and University of Toronto. Additional thanks to ArtsPond's staff Parul Pandya, Margaret Lam, Jean Macpherson, Lynn Briand, Cynthia Lickers-Sage, Jai Djwa, Inga Petri, Cate Proctor, Perry Vulgaris (DigitalASO), Katerina Fuller, and Rob Boyd, Jose Gutierrez, Kate Hollett, Daniel Kligerman, Arthur Yeung (ArtsPond board of directors).

Land Acknowledgement

ArtsPond is rooted in Toronto, the traditional territories of the Huron-Wendat, the Anishnabek Nation, the Haudenosaunee Confederacy, and the Mississaugas of the Credit First Nation.

Tkaronto (Mohawk word meaning "the place in the water where the trees are standing") is home to many First Nations, Métis, Inuit, and Afro-Indigenous people from across Turtle Island.

With regards to land use, housing, and urban planning, it is vital to acknowledge the necessity for non-Indigenous people to recognize and uphold Indigenous sovereignty and Land Back.

The arts and culture sector has an important role to play in reconciliation and decolonization in so-called Canada through engagement, practices, compensation, and programs. It will be crucial for non-Indigenous people to avoid the tokenization of Indigenous arts and culture. Instead, the arts and culture industry must prioritize meaningful relationship-building with Indigenous artists, and to respond to the historical, local, and systemic realities and struggles with the impact of settler colonialism on our cities and communities.

We must continuously reflect on our role to play as settlers on Indigenous land. It is essential to consider how we foster and take care of the land, how we live together, and to help those who are underrepresented and underprivileged due to settler colonialism, capitalism, and white supremacy.

Equity, Access, and Inclusion

In Canada, there are systems of power that grant privilege and access unequally such that inequity and injustice result, and that must be continuously addressed and changed. Cultural equity is critical to the long-term viability of the arts sector to thrive.

At ArtsPond, we believe we must all hold ourselves accountable through acknowledging and challenging our inequities and work with our community partners to make collective change. Everyone deserves equal access to a full, vibrant creative life, which is essential to a healthy and vibrant society. Through social, cultural, economic, physical, and digital spaces and platforms, artists can challenge inequities and encourage, imagine, and realize positive alternatives.

ArtsPond + Groundstory aim to embody equity in our values, policies, and practices to ensure all people are represented; including, yet not limited to, those who have been historically underrepresented based on age, ancestry, colour, ethnic origin, race, citizenship, creed (religion), disability, sexual orientation, gender, gender identity, and socioeconomic status.

We value and prioritize the voices of Indigenous, 2SLGBTQ+, Black, Brown, and other racialized people, people with disabilities, youth, elders, women, New Canadians, official and other language minorities, rural-remote communities, and other equity-seeking groups. We do so with the intention of developing more equitable arts policy, to better empower underserved artists and cultural workers, and to nurture more accessible spaces and the fair distribution of social, physical, economic, cultural, digital, and informational resources.

Addressing Anti-Black Racism

At ArtsPond, we believe the arts and culture sector has an important role to champion anti-racist practices in solidarity with the Black Lives Matter movement and in response to the growth of anti-Black racism and police brutality in Canada and around the world. As Toronto-based placemaker Jay Pitter states in her [Call to Courage](#) (June 2020) to Canadian urbanists, “urban design is not neutral, it either perpetuates or reduces social inequities”.

Current and future work by the arts and culture industry must center equity and actively minimize and eradicate power imbalances and struggles faced by Black communities in Toronto through equity-based placemaking in both real (IRL / on-the-ground) and virtual (URL / in-the-cloud) communities.

In real spaces, Jay Pitter defines equity-based placemaking as “community knowledge and vision to the forefront of public realm design processes, historically going beyond the urbanism status quo and hierarchy. Equity-based placemaking builds on pluralism and recognizes power relations within communities and the place-based histories of exclusion and socio-spatial dynamics that shape the character of public spaces”.

Artists and arts and culture workers must stand against white supremacy, racism, and police brutality.

Youth-led Social Change

At ArtsPond, we believe youth play a vital role in both enabling and leading positive social change. We are forever inspired by youth who are actively fighting for healthy, sustainable, equitable human ecosystems in brick and mortar neighbourhoods on-the-ground, and in digital communities in-the-cloud. We dedicate ourselves to empowering the dreams of young Canadian changemakers including artists, creators, designers, producers, entrepreneurs, technologists, thought leaders, urban planners, sustainability practitioners, architects, environmentalists, economists, politicians, researchers, educators, and more. Listen well to our youth and be changed. We are, for the better, every day.



COVID-19 Pandemic

The first edition of *What Space* was published during the global coronavirus pandemic in September 2020. However, most of the activities and resources featured in this series stem from Spring 2017 to Winter 2020, prior to the emergence of COVID-19 pandemic.

What Space, therefore, may be most effectively applied as a baseline review of pre-pandemic issues on spatial precarity, gentrification, and the arts. Further research is required to examine whether, and how, the themes and topics discussed in this series may be thwarted, transformed, or sustained by the ripples of COVID-19.

Queen West @ Dovercourt, Toronto
Pandemic café street closures, Aug 2020

Contents

- Preface..... 3
- Acknowledgements..... 3
- Scope..... 8
- Appendix 1: Short Annotations..... 9
 - ROOTS..... 10
 - RIPPLES..... 23
 - RESPONSES..... 32
- Appendix 2: Full Annotations 59
 - ROOTS..... 60
 - RIPPLES..... 78
 - RESPONSES..... 91
- Profile..... 131

Scope

What Space: Part 3 consists of a literature review with 127 annotated summaries of public and academic resources relevant to gentrification and the arts. All annotated sources were selected from 2,000 sources listed in Full Bibliography available in Part 4.

Research questions for the literature review were focused on three central themes:

- **Roots** (root causes)
What are the root causes of gentrification (social, cultural, economic, political, etc.)?
What are the role(s) of the arts in gentrification and neighbourhood change?
- **Ripples** (ripple effects, impacts)
What are the adverse effects of spatial precarity and gentrification on arts and culture?
- **Responses** (reactions, interventions)
How do arts and culture communities respond to the adverse effects of gentrification and spatial precarity?

The literature review was focused on three geographic regions:

- Greater Toronto to Hamilton Area in Ontario, Canada
- Other rapidly gentrifying areas in Ontario and across Canada
- Other international regions, cities, and neighbourhoods impacted by gentrification.

Annotations on selected bibliographic sources are provided in two formats. The same set of bibliographic sources are cited in both formats:

- **Appendix 1: Short Annotations**
Brief tabular summaries with resource comparisons by theme (roots, ripples, responses) and category (arts-led gentrification, culinary arts, etc.)
- **Appendix 2: Full Annotations**
Detailed narrative descriptions including connections to core themes, content categorization and tagging.

The sources were reviewed, and the full narrative annotations written, between Fall 2018 and Summer 2019. As a youth-led effort, the majority of the full narrative annotations were written by young urban planners, urban designers, and arts and culture workers under 30 years of age from Toronto, edited by Jessa Agilo. The short annotations were prepared as an overall synopsis by Jessa Agilo in Summer 2020.

For an executive summary of key insights and learnings from this review, please see **What Space: Part 1**.

Appendix 1: Short Annotations




Prepared by Jessa Agilo

The following are short summary annotations for bibliographic sources described in [Appendix 2: Full Annotations](#). See Full Annotations for fuller narrative details on the same bibliographic sources. All sources were selected from the full bibliography of 2,000 sources listed in [What Space: Part 4](#).



Short Annotations are displayed alphabetically in tabular format by author, grouped according to three primary themes (roots, ripples, and responses to gentrification) and multiple sub-categories (i.e., arts-led gentrification, culinary arts, etc).



Format


The format for each annotation is as follows:



ID	Resource type
	 Website page or article
	 Journal or print article
	 Book
#	Annotation reference number with hyperlink to full narrative annotation
Source	Resource title and bibliography citation
Region	Neighbourhood, city, region, state, or country
Roots	What are the root causes of gentrification? *
Ripples	What are the ripple effects of gentrification? *
Responses	What are responses to the more adverse effects of gentrification? *



* As identified by the cited resource or as commentary on the resource provided by the reviewer.



TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
ROOTS					
Arts-led gentrification					
 A1	How Graffiti Became Gentrified (Alioto, 2019)	5Pointz (Long Island City, NY USA)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cultural production • Commodification • Revitalization • Investment 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Graffiti on derelict warehouse created cultural attraction that brought visitors and investors to surrounding neighbourhood • Graffiti is coopted by capitalist developers, whitewashed without permission prior to demolition for luxury condos • Demolition of graffiti is called a "crime against the culture of the city" 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Graffiti artists resist commodification of art by developers in lawsuit • Artists awarded \$6.75 million in legal fight (\$150,000 in damages each for 45 artists) • Recommend establishing "public paint parks" in each borough to provide a more permanent space to displaced artists
 A2	Resisting the creation of forgotten places: Artistic production in Toronto neighbourhoods (Bain, 2006)	Yorkville, King Street, The Junction (Toronto, Canada)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Revitalization • Social distancing • Wealth disparity 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Historical narratives of "forgotten places" where artists tend to move into may be oversimplified or exclusionary • Social distancing between artists (often from middle income roots) and original residents (homeless, social welfare households, sex trade workers, immigrant families) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Artists can help prevent creation of "forgotten places" by using their own economic marginalization to mediate between middle and working class groups • Use art to communicate forgotten urban narratives and experiences to a more diverse audience



TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 A3	Arts, gentrification, and planning for creativity (Grodach, 2016)	USA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Creative cities • Investment • Disinvestment • Complexity 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Arts are cited as driver of gentrification due to its visibility • Reality is far more complex with speculative investment and disinvestment being clear forces, not the arts • Commercial arts (film, design, music) most likely to locate in places that undergo gentrification • Visual, performing arts, museums, attracted to already gentrified areas due to wealthy audience base 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Arts can mediate and subvert adverse effects by promoting community development, building social networks, providing public space forums, and working to shift from city planning agendas to arts-led dialogues on inequitable urban development
 A4	Are Artists to Blame for Gentrification? (Davis, 2013)	New York City, USA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cultural production • Creative cities • Reinvestment • Deindustrialization 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Arts are used to create highly valued neighbourhoods that force out disadvantages communities to make room for upper class • Publicity stunts using art to promote luxury residencies strengthen this view • Artists create cooperatives that deindustrialize communities and force out manufacturing workforce (primarily Puerto Ricans, African Americans) • Arts not always to blame for increased gentrification, but developers seize on economic opportunities they provide 	



TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 A5	<p>The New Middle Class and the Remaking of the Central City</p> <p>(Ley, 1997)</p>	Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cultural production • New Middle Class • 1960s Youth Movements • Knowledge economy • Standardization, conformity, under-stimulation of suburbs • Loss of rental housing stock due to renovations, demolitions, conversions, deconversions from joint owner-tenant to owner occupation alone • Low vacancy rates • Anti-democratic, exclusionary communities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Artists move to the inner city in search of “authentic places”, affordable housing and workspaces • Artists play significant social role as “broker of fashionable middle-class taste... expeditionary force for inner-city gentrifiers” • New Middle Class (youth from 60s movements, employed in knowledge economy) follow artists to inner-city spaces • Low-income and working class residents are displaced or put at risk of displacement with introduction of middle class newcomers • Net loss of 18,000 units and almost 54,000 displaced in major Canadian cities from mid-1970s to mid-1990s 	



TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 A6	<p>Aestheticizing Space: Art, Gentrification, and the City</p> <p>(Mathews, 2010)</p>	Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cultural production versus consumption 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Governments, investors, developers see value in public art for economic purposes 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Map early waves of gentrification including where artists located, how they change locations and what attracts others, how agency of artists in the process is constructed • Art as a powerful tool for social commentary that challenges economic forces • Future research to explore the art world beyond economic measures • Address arts' implications in gentrification through local expression and debate surrounding "where art is placed, how it is selected, who selects it, and what meanings are attached to the works and their producers"
 A7	<p>What Role Do Artists Play in Gentrification?</p> <p>(Moskowitz, 2017)</p>	Bushwick, New York City, USA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Capitalism • Cultural production • MFA training programs • Tax policy • Zoning policy 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Viscous cycles emerge when art is intertwined with capitalism • Artists and MFA training programs focus more on producing art for the wealthy as cost of cities rise, contributing to gentrification • Tax breaks for developers and changes in zoning policies by government make gentrification possible • Once state-led gentrification has generated a certain momentum, artists are no longer necessary for initial stages 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Fuller account of government, state-led gentrification is necessary





TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 A8	To the Footsoldiers of Gentrification (O'Rourke, 2010)	Hamilton Toronto, ON Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cultural production • Capitalism 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Displacement and replacement of immigrants, poor, working class people in low-income neighbourhoods • Arts can be complicit in displacement by demonizing already-marginalized individuals • Artists are not villains of gentrification but convinced to believe governments, property owners, capitalists share their interests 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Call to action to artists • Describe language and euphemisms for gentrification in more detail • Undertake artistic projects that support marginalized people and counter aims to replace marginalized communities with affluent people • i.e., Sketch Working Arts (Toronto), Purple Thistle Youth Collective (Vancouver)
 A9	Made in Brooklyn: Artists, Hipsters, Makers, Gentrifiers (Wasielewski, 2018)	Morgantown Brooklyn, NY USA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Economics • Technology • Cultural production • Revitalization • Neoliberalism • Maker movement 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Maker movement strives to revitalize derelict spaces into centres of small-scale creative production but often falls short of utopian ideals • Maker movement natural successor to artist-entrepreneurs that brought neoliberalism (individualism, freedom, personal fulfillment) together with art world • Makers more compatible (or less oppositional) to gentrification than left-wing/avant-garde arts groups of the past 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Makers attraction to and "colonization" of low-income communities seeking places of "perceived danger, otherness, and authenticity that offer conceptual distance from homogeneous middle-class life" • Gentrification and high costs of living have pushed artists to become more outward-facing and entrepreneurial



TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
Culinary arts					
 B1	Foodies Gentrify Vancouver's Downtown Eastside (Hyde, 2018)	Downtown Eastside Vancouver, BC Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cultural production • Culturewashing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Restaurants enter low-income area to access lower rents, allocate more money to high quality experience long-time residents cannot afford • Upscales area and displaces or excludes more affordable retail • Foodies excited to experience "authentic", "exotic" foods, see their consumption habits as inclusive, restaurant owners see themselves as caring by fundraising for community 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Community members who organize against higher-end restaurants for gentrifying the neighbourhood are vilified • Other members of public see protesters as "overbearing" as restaurants are "not too fancy" and trying to help neighbourhood • Protestors have interest in broader process of gentrification, but intent is overshadowed by the restaurants
 B2	Food fuels Hamilton's gentrification (Stanley, 2019)	Barton Village Hamilton, ON Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cultural production • Population growth • Investment 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 6-seat restaurant with \$100+ seasonal tasting menu four nights a week located in low-income neighbourhood steps away street mission where homeless go for help 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Vandalism spree by anti-gentrification anarchists




TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
Gentrification theories					
 C1	Gentrification Glossary (Druka et al., 2019)	Hamilton, ON	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Investment • Wealth disparity • Vacancy decontrol • Incentivization • Business incubators • Co-working spaces • Development charges • Artwashing • Restoration • Policing • Transit-oriented development • Speculative development 	Problems with gentrification and urban development: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Beautification • Co-option, appropriation • Placemaking • Revitalization, urban renewal • Vibrant neighbourhoods • Creative economy, creative city • Monopoly rent • Displacement, renoviction, demoviction • Mega-landlord • Food desert • Greenfield development 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Affordable housing • Co-operatives • Public housing • Right to housing • Rent control • Community land trusts • Community benefits agreements • Broad public consultations • Neighbourhood associations • Protesting • Dollar voting • Lobbying • Harm reduction • Land use and city planning • Inclusionary zoning
 C2	The Art of Rent (Harvey, 2012)		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Commercialization • Commodification • Pacification • Economics • Monopoly rent 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • All rent is based on monopoly power of private owners over space • Urbanization and gentrification results in pacification, commodification of art, culture, daily life, including urban spaces • Monopoly rent spaces become harder to trade when overly commercialized and lose marks of distinction 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Uniqueness, authenticity, and specialty of cultural spaces encourages monopoly rents but also opens space for oppositional, political thought and action by cultural producers


TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 C3	Gentrification and the Arts on Mississippi Ave.: Creating Two Communities and Making Them Whole (Petruziello, 2010)	Bosie Portland, OR USA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • “Artist-pioneered gentrification” • Cultural production • Revitalization • Urban restructuring • Disinvestment • Neoliberalism 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Influx of artists and wealthier residents have made neighbourhood safe and more economically prosperous • Displacement, economic exclusion of original, low-income residents in historically African-American neighbourhood • To dominate social environment, wealthier newcomers set agenda and directs opportunities for arts involvement • Neoliberal urban restructuring a process of chronic underinvestment in a neighbourhood before being gentrified 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Repair divisions between original low-income and new arts/wealthier residents • Improve understanding of the role of urban planning and development in community change • Improve active community participation through training and support for personal expression on their own terms
 C4	Gentrification: What It is, Why It Is, and What Can Be Done about It (Shaw, 2008)		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Culture choice theory • Ecological urban ideology • Neo-Marxism • Neoliberalism • Post-industrialism • Economics • Migration 		

TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 C5	The New Urban Frontier: Gentrification and the Revanchist City (Smith, 1996)	New York City, NY USA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Disinvestment Rent gaps Middle class “Revanchist” cities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> “Revanchist” cities where middle- and ruling-class “take back” city from those with less privilege, power, social standing “Frontier” discourse depicts cities as wilderness, poor and working class as “uncivil” Artists in Lower Eastside of New York offered artificially low rents to “tame” neighbourhood and make it more attractive for real estate buyers Disinvestment precursor to gentrification, with lower than market rents (rent gap) helping developers capitalize on properties with potential beyond costs of development 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Rent gaps not natural or inevitable, but intentionally brought by developers who seek to increase profit rates Uncover where disinvestment is happening by showing frontier lines of gentrification through tax arrears data mapping
 C6	Gentrification, Displacement, and the Role of Public Investment (Zuk et al., 2017)		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Reinvestment 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Undervalued land is revalued through reinvestment by wealthier residents Residential displacement of the poor or working class follows reinvestment Three types of displacement: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Direct (physical) Evictions or deterioration in housing quality Indirect (economic) Condo conversion or rent increase Exclusionary Zoning policies, unaffordable housing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Clearly describe type of displacement in studies to better understand complexities of process and solutions


TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
Deindustrialization, neighbourhood change					
 D1	Stories from a shifting city, told by 8 Hamilton artists (Bennett, 2017)	Hamilton, ON Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Population growth Commercialization Business competition 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Mixed income housing Reduced bureaucracy Preserving architecture (balancing old buildings with new developments)
 D2	A City on the Cusp: Neighbourhood Change in Hamilton since 1970 (Harris et al., 2015)	Hamilton, ON Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Deindustrialization Revitalization Wealth disparity 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Decline in lower city since 1970s due to concentration of welfare recipients and deindustrialization, rise in west suburbs including Burlington Decline in inner suburbs to east and south since 1980s Downtown revival and increased housing prices since 2010 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Mapping impact data to illustrate neighbourhood changes (7 key measures, including income distribution, immigrant status, Rental Housing Disadvantage Index, refugee landing quotients, increase in real estate prices)
 D3	Arts-Based Gentrification in Hamilton, ON (Ryan, 2017)	James St North Hamilton, ON Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Deindustrialization Wealth disparity Creative cities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Economic displacement Cultural shifts Erosions of civic rights and freedoms Rising unaffordability Disproportionate adverse effects on racialized populations, immigrants, and the poor 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Artist protests parallel with punk movement More research is needed to influence policy change
Colonialism					
 E1	Gentrification and Displacement in Toronto's Downtown East (Spring, 2015)	Toronto, ON Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Colonialism Toronto purchase treaties 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Diminished access to housing for Indigenous peoples Demolition of shelter beds on Toronto's Eastside in favour of long-term care housing for seniors Indigenous homelessness (16% of homeless, 1% of population) 	


TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
Urban planning, policy, zoning					
 F1	Gentrification, suburban decline, and the financialization of multi-family rental housing: The case of Toronto (August & Walks, 2017)	Toronto, ON Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Financialization • Deregulation • Public policy • Inequality • Real Estate Investment Trusts • Urban planning policy 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Financialization of housing partly driven by government policies for Real Estate Investment Trusts (REITs) • Deregulated tenant protections, decontrol rent, and decreased funding for social housing allowed REITs to flourish with over 350 buildings of this type in Toronto • Affordable rentals in inner suburbs experience above guideline rent increases and underinvestment in infrastructure • Buildings expected to gentrify are upgraded aggressively to appeal to middle class • “Financialized landlords” work to “squeeze” and evict tenants to collect higher rents from newer tenants 	
 F2	How to Fight Gentrification’s Real Culprit: Political Privilege (Hengels, 2017)		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Politics • Inequality • Lack of housing supply 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Higher income or wealthier residents exercise political clout to prevent new housing development near them • Higher income residents move into lower income areas because of lack of housing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Adapt land use policies to permit new housing developments in higher income areas • Will lessen displacement in lower income neighbourhoods

TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 F3	Inside and Outside: A Meditation on the Yellowbelt (Kramer, 2019)	Toronto, ON Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Urban planning policy • Zoning • Missing middle 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Yellowbelt is an area where land use policy restricts housing to detached structures instead of multi-family options like semis, townhouses, small apartments • Shapes geography and contributes to affordability crisis • 1.8 times larger than all other residential zones, 3 times larger than Manhattan but no formal acknowledgement of Yellowbelt on City website • Housing divisions and inequities are shaped by planning policies • Questions whether up-zoning for the missing middle will solve housing crisis 	
 F4	The risks of the financialization of housing (Perks, 2019)	Toronto, ON Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Financialization • Deregulation • International land speculation • Digital economy • Income and wealth polarization • Urban planning policy 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Housing affordability crisis • Nature, scale, and impact of land speculation has changed via financial deregulation, growing concentration of wealth, digital economy, and fast transfers of money 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increase government owned and operated housing
 F5	Castles in Toronto's Sky: Condo-ism as Urban Transformation (Rosen & Walks, 2015)	Toronto, ON Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Neoliberalism • Financialization • Deindustrialization • Disinvestment • Condo-ism • Development charges • Section 37 • Urban planning policy 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Condo-ism transformed character of Toronto's central business district by channeling capital investments and young residents to residential growth in urban core • Condo development has filled lack of new purpose-built rental housing construction which has vanished since early 1990s 	

TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 F6	Houses and Homes: Housing for Canadians (Sewell, 1994)	Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Financialization Deindustrialization Urban planning policy 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> “Semi-filtering” policy helps upper income households move into more desirable housing while lower income households move into properties vacated by upper income households At same time, government financialized housing through funding from private sector instead of public sector Success of policy is questioned First home ownership programs began in 1950s, by 1986 only one third of suburban homes were bought by first-time buyers Homes were traded by those who already had property, and owned by small handful of developers as an oligopoly, which helped push prices up 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Look to institutions, not individuals


State-led gentrification




 G1	The changing state of gentrification (Hackworth & Smith, 2001)	Clinton Long Island City DUMBO SoHo Tribeca Lower East Side New York City, NY USA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Disinvestment Reinvestment Deregulation Zoning 	<p>Three waves of gentrification</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Disinvested inner city targeted for reinvestment with public funds (prior to 1973) Surging gentrification led by private developers and arts groups targeted investment in new areas (to late 1980s) Deregulation and zoning changes increased gentrification after recession and creation of large projects by developers with the State 	
---	---	--	---	--	--



TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 G2	Why there's no help on the horizon for Toronto's housing crisis (McGrath, 2019)	Toronto, ON Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Urban planning policy Public policy 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Families making more than \$100k/year struggle to afford homes in the city Regulatory status quo at all levels of government has allowed housing crisis to grow Toronto lost 30,000 people per year to more affordable housing markets between 2016 and 2018 (Ryerson University study) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Liberalize housing rules in more ambitious ways like in USA Strengthen debates on laneway homes, which has had only 12 building permits since 2018


RIPPLES

Spatial precarity, displacement


 H1	How real Estate Trends and Zoning bylaws are Threatening Canadian Nightlife	London, UK Toronto, ON Vancouver, BC Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Zoning 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Loss of 50% of nightclubs, 40% music venues in 8 years (London, UK) Locations close due to high real-estate values and zoning bylaws do not support their relocation Competition for land with residential uses, increases value of land, residents complain about noise, which pressures site to close No plans in Toronto to expand where sites can be located Vancouver needs additional licenses on sites already permitting use 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Relocate to abandoned strip malls in inner suburbs Reuse of large underground parking garages
--	---	--	--	--	--




TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 H2	I will not be pushed out: 40-year-old Parkdale dance school faces uncertain future	Parkdale Toronto, ON Canada		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Demoviction of dance school after 40-year history in Parkdale New building proposal that retained space for the School (14-storeys) is lost due to local opposition + resistance from City 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Municipality and province provide better funding of mid-sized arts organizations
 H3	How Toronto landlords use renovictions to force out tenants	Toronto, ON Canada		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Renovictions are increasing Vacancy rate less than 1% 	
 H4	Root Shock: How Tearing Up City Neighborhoods Hurts America, And What We Can Do About It	USA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Revitalization Racism Classicism 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Mass displacement of 1,600 black communities demolished across the United States “Root shock” profound traumatic stress reactions on the body, ruptures community bonds, ramifications across generations 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> “Community Burn Index” identify neighbourhoods at risk of displacement Healing strategies for root shock Design cities through “Aesthetics of Equity” (Michael Cantal Dupart): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Respect the common life the way you would an individual life Treasure the buildings history has given us Break the cycle of disinvestment Ensure freedom of movement




TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 H5	Another art gallery leaves James St. North-closing Saturday after rent soars	James St North Hamilton, ON Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Public policy • Arts-led gentrification 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Art gallery (b contemporary) displaced from James St North • Pattern of displacement that sees artists drawn by cheap rents but priced out as costs soar as artists make the neighbourhood trendy • Neighbourhood has become entertainment district with soaring rents, fewer daytime customers, more transient clientele who are less likely to browse 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Incentivize building owners to maintain arts spaces • Create new property tax bracket for cultural spaces
 H6	3 signs that gentrification is coming to your neighborhood	Oakland Bay Area, CA USA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Racism • Policing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Signs of gentrification in low-income areas include shifts in demographics, infrastructure, and safety measures • Gentrification in low-income or dangerous neighbourhoods adds social problems related to racism, violence, poverty • Safety measures can make residents feel unwelcome or unsafe, such as new forms of surveillance and policing • Residents lose cultural identity over time • Demographic diversity is lost as residents are forced out due to increased cost of living • New infrastructure projects target low-income neighbourhoods while government housing demolished 	



TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 H7	Toronto development threatens to scatter artist community	Davenport Toronto, ON Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Redevelopment • Revitalization 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Demoviction of 40 artists from planned redevelopment of warehouse • Loss of income • Limited guarantee of space in future at a similar cost • Scattering of artists from core artistic neighbourhood 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Petitions to lengthen eviction period with support from local councilor and provincial MPP

Artwashing


 J1	Neighbourhood artistic disaffiliation in Hamilton, Ontario, Canada	Lansdale Hamilton, ON Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cultural production • Classicism • Artwashing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Spatial politics of cultural production can damage social fabric of low-income neighbourhoods • Cultural producers align themselves with middle class, practice “artistic disaffiliation”, and assert power to control neighbourhood change • Artists exhibited photos of sex workers without permission, organized cleanups, patrols, established neighbourhood association with agenda often centered on removal of undesirable people • Over time, neighbourhood has become wealthier, while lower income people are displaced 	
 J2	Gentrification, street art and the rise of the developer-sponsored block party	Brunswick East Melbourne Australia	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Artwashing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Real estate companies/developers host block parties and distribute magazines to sell properties • Block parties include live music, street artist, food trucks 	




TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 J3	Our Place, Our Home: Belvedere Tenants Fight to Remain in Mount Pleasant	Vancouver, BC Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Culturewashing • Artwashing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Personal story of how city's international mural program suppressed voice of tenants and supported their displacement • Evicted 2 years after completion of mural • Methods included not responding to requests for service, renovictions, offering cash payouts to move 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Protest evictions with support of municipal tenants' union and government relationships
 J4	Condos Love Culture: New Arts Development Brings "Creative Placemaking" to Chinatown	Regent Park Toronto, ON Chinatown Vancouver, BC Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Artwashing • Creative placemaking • Revitalization 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Development of creative hub in gentrifying, low-income neighbourhood highlighted as positive spin on revitalization even though social housing reduced from 100% to 25% • Exclusion of marginalized voices to realize the vision for a new creative hub in another revitalized neighbourhood with loss of affordable retail 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Support community consultations through steering committee, hiring a program developer
 J5	From Affordability to Artwashing: An Inquiry	Mirvish Village Toronto, ON Vancouver, BC Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Artwashing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Developer of luxury apartments uses artwashing to appear more ethical and community focused • Depict immigrants and low-income families in murals and promote accessibility when only wealthier people can afford the properties 	


TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
Artists' precarity					
 K1	For those left behind: Hamilton's arts renaissance isn't working for everyone	Hamilton, ON Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Revitalization • Deindustrialization 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Struggling manufacturing provide City alternative identity and path to prosperity through culture • Tripled population growth in creative industries from 2001 to 2016, but arts funding is the same • Artists face economic precarity, working multiple jobs • Doubling of rent in six years • Revitalization and economic development narrative not matched with needs for housing, security, living wages 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Gaged Forum, a series of events across the city to talk about gentrification and the arts, hosted by Hamilton Artists Inc.
 K2	Environmental Scan of the Culture Sector: Ontario Culture Strategy Background Document	Ontario, Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Globalization • Austerity / fiscal restraint • Digital transformation • Demographic changes 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Precarity • Low wages 	
 K3	An Overburdened Promise: Arts Funding for Social Development	Toronto, ON Mississauga, ON Canada		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Youth arts funding was increased in Toronto in 2006 after a year of many shootings • Strived to combine creative city strategies with poverty reduction strategies • Funding distributed to neighbourhoods with most poverty and need for investment • Jane-Finch culture producers describe it as offloading of social services onto non-profits who hire youth at lower wages • Creative cities strategy is about marketing cities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Cities need to solve systemic issues causing poverty • Do not create funding programs with aims to change how 15-year old's think • Aims should be to change how policy makers think • Policy makers have influence over systemic issues, while 15-year old's do not (they cannot even vote)

TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 K4	Fair Pay for Artists	USA		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Precarity • Low wages • Lack of pay for time, ideas, labour (written off as opportunities for exposure) • Lack of employment benefits • Lack of means to save for retirement • Lack of superannuation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Set benchmarks for artists fees • Implement superannuation • Provide tax exempt grants and awards to artists
 K5	MakingItWork: Pathways toward sustainable cultural careers	Ontario Canada		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Precarity • Low income • Barriers to training • Difficulty communicating the value of artists' work 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Explore new HR tools and management models • Expand support for diversity and inclusion in the culture sector • Expand support for culture sector advocacy • Explore capacity for continuous presence in culture sectors


Social costs


 L1	Double trouble? How big cities are gentrifying their neighbours	Bordeaux, France Leipzig, Germany Hastings, UK Hamilton, ON Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Double gentrification • Deindustrialization • Depopulation • Revitalization 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Double gentrification = cities gentrify when more expensive cities are nearby • Congestion • Displacement • Rental increases • Social unrest 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Government developments like Rock House in Hastings that are mixed-use, combining affordable living, capped-rent working areas, collaborative creative space • Create affordable places to live and work, and protect them in perpetuity
--	---	--	--	--	---

TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 L2	Experts say Vancouver must prepare for a new kind of emergency — gentrification	Vancouver, BC Canada		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Trauma is akin to natural disasters • Displacement • Forced moves • Loss of neighbourhoods • Social problems • Global migration • Geopolitical strife • Densification • Neighbourhood change 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Address gentrification the same way natural disasters are • Prepare for social problems in the same way as environmental ones • Be tolerant, inclusive, culturally competent, and supportive
 L3	Gentrification Prime	Brooklyn, NY USA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Redevelopment • Technology • Commercialization • Creative industries 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Massive tech warehouse development places pressure on working class employment sites and workers • Industrial sites are targeted for redevelopment where low-income jobs are lost, and housing prices rise in surrounding areas 	
 L4	Toronto's South Parkdale neighbourhood: a brief history of development, disinvestment, and gentrification	Parkdale Toronto, ON Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Disinvestment • Slum rhetoric • Transportation mega projects • Housing conversions • Closure of health care facilities • Middle class • Culture production 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Displacement of long-time, low-income residents • Artists and middle-class move in drawn by affordability and perceived "edginess" of the neighbourhood • Middle-class advocate for removal of permanent affordable housing (rooming houses, bachelorette buildings) • Social tension between long-time and new residents 	

TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 L5	Why is Gentrification a Problem?	USA		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Increased displacement or housing turnover is associated with 52 to 75% decrease in community improvement expenditures Residents at risk of displacement are less likely to be involved in community improvements and require significant time or monetary investments Reduced community involvement impacts all neighbourhood residents, such as less programs for youth, neighbourhood cleanup, and business training opportunities Gentrification impacts entire communities not only individual households 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Increase government assistance for community improvement actions Support affordable housing to limit involuntary displacement and thus encourage residents to invest in their communities

Creative placemaking




 M1	Creative Placemaking	San Francisco, CA USA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Creative placemaking 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Creativity is making, not the place itself Creative placemaking is thus open to engagement from the arts Its success should be measured by ability to support achievement of community outcomes by artists, creative interventions, formal and informal arts spaces 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Harness private capital Manage permanent funds Build private-public partnerships Utilize planning tools to make arts-led zones more ubiquitous Strengthen and improve local artists and arts organizations Increase community attachment Improve quality of life Invigorate local economies
--	----------------------	--------------------------	--	---	--





TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 M2	Place Guarding: Activist art against gentrification	USA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Creative placemaking • Creative class • Neoliberalism • Revitalization • Capitalism • Exploitation • Disempowerment 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Creative placemaking is about creative class remaking cities for wealthier residents • Creative placemaking is dominant vehicle for gentrification due to pursuit of creative class models, social capital theory, and new urbanist principles = a way to prime land and communities • Wealthy implement neoliberal policies while making use of language that signals creativity and inclusivity • Housing is a key battleground • Assumptions marginalized people suffer from lack of social capital rather than disempowerment, domination, exploitation • This enables third sector to intervene with pursuit of neighbourhood regeneration 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Place-guarding, guard places from the forces of capital • Artistic acts of resistance deny compliance, invoke/embody spirit of disobedience, harness power of art to claim back the city, resist appropriation by policy platforms like creative placemaking • Examples of activist art with context of housing protests that could become place-guarding: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Balfron Social Club ○ Southwark Notes Archive Group ○ Boyle Heights



RESPONSES




Art and artists


 N1	'It's a fiasco': Hamilton shuts down 'City of Music' website as criticism mounts	Hamilton, ON Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Creative cities 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Municipality's music marketing budget was in lieu of direct support to musicians 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Artists protest marketing budget and shutdown the website
--	--	------------------------	---	--	---

TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 N2	Rivers and Bridges: Theater in Regional Planning	New River Valley, Virginia USA			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Livability Initiative, 3-year regional planning effort brought community planners and performing artists together • Demonstrated theatre can be effective medium for expression of community concerns and encourage deliberation among residents to address those issues • Artists from Building Home use story circles to collect stories of local citizens at community festivals • Forum Theater invited participants to solved staged conflicts and address community concerns through improvisation • Image Theater asked participants to physically construct common issues and concerns using their collective bodies
 N3	Education for Socially Engaged Art: A Materials and Techniques Handbook				<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Socially-engaged artistic practices like collective mural-making have the potential to foster more inclusive, community-led engagement in response to divisive urban development practices
 N4	We Are the Scene: Alternative Art Economies in Bushwick	USA			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Artists work out of their tiny apartments and display art in their windows when excluded from traditional gallery system • These practices push the boundaries of public and private, demonstrate artists adapting to gentrification


TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 N5	One House and the Life of an Arts Based Research Project	Canada			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Producing artwork about families that lived in the same house over different periods of time Narrative analysis communicated through visuals and text quotes Prompts observations about how meaning is built into homes with heritage planners
 N6	Art as Research: Opportunities and Challenges				<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Using artistic intelligence to promote healing transformation
 N7	Reaction to Gentrification from the Artist Community	USA			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Artists collaborate with long-time residents to create plans for affordable workspaces for artists alongside low-income housing and commercial spaces for local community Example: Project Row House (Houston)
 N8	An Artists' Guide to Not Being Complicit with Gentrification	Boyle Heights Los Angeles, CA USA		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Founders of Los Angeles Tenants Union fight for the right to housing for all, strengthen political power of working class and poor communities Ask artists to consider what roles they play in gentrification and to challenge that complicity to create positive change Place in the context of artwashing in Boyle Heights, with galleries calling the police on protestors expressing concerns about arts-led gentrification 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Artists become more involved in housing struggles Learning about renter's rights Find alternative ways to dealing with conflict other than the police Be more aware of locations chosen for arts activities and events – will they raise value of properties for developers or will they benefit the community Make choices whether individual careers or dismantling oppressive structures are a priority Ask about power of arts to determine who or what is included, given practices of galleries to show diverse artists only temporarily




TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 N9	Creating Change through Arts, Culture, and Equitable Development: A Policy and Practice Primer	USA			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Bring together community development and the arts and culture sector to expand community development initiatives • Restructure public investments in the arts to support more capital projects and operations • Produce more programming that supports underserved communities <p>Foster interconnected growth of arts, culture, and equitable development by:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mapping arts and culture assets • Evaluate economic conditions • Identify barriers for equity-seeking groups and work with artists • Culture leaders and young people engage the community • Expand equity-focused arts and culture investments • Ensure governance and staffing are representative
 N10	The art of gentrification: city data made beautiful	Various			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Artistic visualizations of impact data including income inequality, segregation, evictions • Demonstrate positive correlation between house prices and employment in arts and culture in Los Angeles




TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 N11	A Creative Placemaking Field Scan: Exploring the Ways Arts and Culture Intersects with Housing: Emerging Practices and Implications for Further Action	USA			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Utilize creative placemaking practices where community development must be locally informed, human-centric, and holistic <p>Six community-engaged practices that use art in intersection with housing issues:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Articulate invisible housing challenges Nourish individuals and communities who have experienced trauma through housing Organize housing campaigns Bridge disparate neighbourhood residents Stabilize vulnerable communities Generate economic development for communities that are structurally barred access to capital
 N12	How Can Artists Help Us Tackle Gentrification?	UK		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Social cleansing Displacement 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Immediacy of photography keeps record what has happened in cities
 N13	The role of art and artists in contesting gentrification in London and New York City	London, UK New York, NY USA		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Artists are involuntary participants in the onset of gentrification Artists are victimized by gentrification 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> In-depth interviews with artists to correct urban studies literature where artists are cited as passive instigators of gentrification Describe artists intentions and interventions related to gentrification in artworks, anti-gentrification activism


TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 N14	Making Space for Culture	Global		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Displacement • Loss of performance, exhibition, production, administrative cultural spaces • Conflict in the need to attract investment while preserving and inventing cultural spaces 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Develop mix and spaces and facilities for cultural production and consumption • Municipalities best tier of government to address issues with power over land use, planning, economic development • Design cultural facilities as a catalyst for local investment • Utilize arts and culture as the “golden thread” tying planning and economic development • Contribute to affordable housing and space movement • Building knowledge, capacity, and leadership • Create metrics to measure indicators • Conduct research, create and share toolkits to help cities and partners develop and maintain cultural spaces

Mapping

 O1	The hidden pockets in Toronto where gentrification is really happening	Toronto, ON Canada		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 14 Census dissemination areas (neighbourhoods) in Toronto defined as gentrified between 2006 and 2016 (primarily in Leslieville, Queen West, and The Junction) = 0.4% of the city • 768 dissemination areas (20.8% of the city) transitioned from bottom 40th percentile to above average income city-wide from 2006 to 2016 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Map where gentrification has occurred • Define gentrified areas as those where the average household income increased from bottom 40th percentile to top 60th percentile • Use Census dissemination areas at the most granular levels (neighbourhoods) • Provide qualitative data to frame the economic data
--	--	-----------------------	--	--	---




TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
Networking					
 P1	Grounded Solutions Network	USA			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Connect local experts with the networks, knowledge and support they need to understand and implement affordable housing solutions • Generate \$320 million housing trust fund, preserve and improve 20,000 units
 P2	PUSH Buffalo Annual Report 2018	Buffalo, NY USA			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mobilize residents to create strong neighbourhoods with quality, affordable housing • Expand local hiring opportunities • Advance economic and environmental justice • Include artists in the inception of organization (People United for Sustainable Housing) • Art screenings on housing issues • Advocating for affordable housing policies
 P3	Taxed Out	Toronto, ON Canada			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Online exhibit in response to commercial property values and taxes, which are assessed on “highest and best (potential) use” rather than actual current use • Included case studies, statistics, infographics, photographs related to impact of tax policy on main streets of Toronto • Protests and organizing of resistance to tax increases


TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 P4	Akin Collective buys artists space and time	Toronto, ON Canada		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lack of affordable studio space for artists Underutilized warehouses that are temporarily not ready for commercial redevelopment Precarious employment Unstable housing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Affordable temporary meanwhile leasing of underutilized studios for the arts 19,000 square feet across 4 buildings for 160 members
Policy change					
 Q1	Toronto council backs 50 per cent property tax reduction for culture hubs	Toronto, ON Canada			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Creative co-location facility property tax class provides 50% tax reduction to cultural organizations that share spaces Municipality created tax class to help save 401 Richmond creative hub but applies to less than 20 properties, so its impact is limited
 Q2	Gentrification & Neighbourhood Change: Helpful Tools for Communities	Chicago, IL USA			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Toolkit to address gentrification in three stages: <i>Before gentrification:</i> Coalition building; Right to purchase; Community land trusts; Inclusionary zoning; Limited equity co-op housing; Community benefits agreements <i>Mid stage gentrification:</i> Strengthened rental protections; Tax abatement policies; Protections against condominium conversion; Rehabilitation and preservation <i>Late stage gentrification:</i> Employer assisted housing; Affordable housing trust funds; Housing levies; Dealing with NIMBYism

TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 Q3	Ensuring Equitable Neighborhood Change: Gentrification Pressures on Housing Affordability (Insights into Housing and Community Development Policy)	USA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Revitalization 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Displacement • Poverty concentration • Poor neighbourhood conditions 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Preservation of affordable housing • More housing development not limited to affordable • Engagement with current community residents • Regional rather than local strategies • This resource does not deal with financialization of housing which will not be solved with more supply


Protesting, advocating



 R1	Why opponents of gentrification have taken to the streets of Hamilton	Hamilton, ON Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Inequality • Exploitation • Economic migration • Revitalization 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Deep frustration with economic inequalities • Higher rents for low quality properties • Increasingly exploitative work conditions • Business associations lobbying for more policing • “Economic refugees” priced-out of real estate in Toronto contribute to gentrification in Hamilton by increasing competition for housing • Gentrification has displaced many to nearby Brantford or St. Catharines 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Extreme vandalism as protest from anarchist communities • Retail and car owners targeted claim to understand concerns surrounding gentrification but believe the methods of protest are not effective to promote dialogue
--	---	------------------------	--	---	--



TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 R2	A Space for Us: Resisting gentrification and artist displacement	Peterborough, ON Canada		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Demolition of culturally significant properties, housing, in favour of unaffordable housing before their heritage status can be secured Artists play significant role in erasing stigma of ghettoization by offering initially cheap rents and large spaces Economic precarity makes artists susceptible when gentrification moves in Gives rise to monoculture by pushing artists and arts spaces away 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Governments utilize municipal cultural plans to manage development Establish bylaws and special tax zones that promote and preserve artists' spaces Value arts spaces as assets to the city
 R3	Resisting the Politics of Displacement in the San Francisco Bay Area: Anti-gentrification Activism in the Tech Boom 2.0	San Francisco, CA USA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Technology Commercialization Investment Ellis Act Buyouts Condo conversions 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Two activist collectives fight gentrification from tech boom: Eviction Free San Francisco, Anti-Eviction Mapping Project Protests, rallies, public denouncements of landlords and speculators Tech activism through mapping projects, investigations, an oral history project with stories of evicted tenants
 R4	Evans Contemporary: Arts, Commerce, and the Downtown Core	Peterborough, ON Canada			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Gallery shutdown and art crawl cancelled as a political act due to exploitation of art for commercial purposes and its contribution to gentrification of the city




TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 R5	Art, Design & Gentrification: A Primer	Parkdale Toronto, ON Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Speculation • Investment • Rent gaps 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Activist design studio produces zine on art and gentrification in three sections: • Introduction to gentrification and the role of artists and designers in the process of gentrification • Examples of artful resistance to gentrification • Toolkit with short and long-term strategies for artists and designers to organize against gentrification • Decolonial, abolitionist, intersectional approaches • Do not blame artists for gentrification, but call on to show more accountability to the communities they work within





Protesting, advocating (2SLGBTQ+)



 S1	Queers against gentrification	Moss Park Toronto, ON Canada		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Inclusivity as a gateway for gentrification • Marketing the poor, homeless, drug involved residents in the neighbourhood as other • New developments for sports and recreation are encroaching on key services and resources used by poorer residents 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Podcast protesting of Queer Trans Community Defence
--	-------------------------------	------------------------------------	--	---	---





TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 S2	Here's How Queer and Trans People of Color Are Resisting Gentrification and Displacement	Seattle, WA USA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Rising housing costs • Influx of high-income technology professionals • Institutional racism 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Anti-gentrification organizing takes a toll on mental and physical health of activists 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reclaim land and space by purchasing entire buildings and small plots of land for community gardens. • Tenant group organized, raised funds, and partnered with local community land trust to purchase building after landlord said it would be sold • Those who commodify housing need to learn empathy for communities on the margins who are devastated by the process of gentrification <p>Examples:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Queer the Land, Sustaining Ourselves Locally, Afrikatown Community Garden, Oilomobo, Displacement Stops Here
 S3	Queers in the hood: How LGBTQ2SI+ folks can stand up to gentrification in Hamilton neighbourhoods	Hamilton, ON Canada			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Support tenant rights organizations like Hamilton Tenant Solidarity Network • Know neighbourhood history • Recognize impacts on racialized groups • Acknowledge colonization • Support queer and trans housing activists like Core Collaborative Learning (Cole Gately) • Watch for harmful language • Be wary of marketing/branding of neighbourhoods • Direct energy/support to services for displaced marginalized groups




TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
Predicting					
 T1	Forewarned: The Use of Neighborhood Early Warning Systems for Gentrification and Displacement	USA			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Map where gentrification is anticipated and where it has occurred using ten root variables: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Shift in tenure; Increase in down payments; Increase in high-income serving amenities (coffee shops, galleries); Historic architecture and others Three predictors of vulnerability to be displaced <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Tenure; Number of employed people per household; Occupation Produces high volume of false positives, deeper data is required to produce better predictions, from crowdsourcing and smart city infrastructures Smart cities most efficient but lacks equitable outcomes at present and input from community organizations
 T2	Can We Predict Gentrification?	California, USA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Availability of public space and public transit Income diversity Places where renter (but not owner) burden is high Places where there are more non-family households 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Increased business investment Crime reduction Improvements in test scores 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Identify gentrifying neighbourhoods through Census data where household incomes have increases, home values have increased, and residents have gone to college, best for historic trends but can predict future changes along with crime rates and social media Relationship between transit investment and neighbourhood change successfully used to predict future gentrification a decade later



TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 T3	Case Studies on Gentrification and Displacement in the San Francisco Bay Area	San Francisco, CA USA		<p>Three groups:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Undergoing pressures of gentrification and displacement for many years and have limited its magnitude to years of strong responses (community organizing, tenant protections, zoning restrictions) • Places that are undergoing active redevelopment or speculation • Not yet experiencing but have anticipated gentrification due to proximity to affluent neighbourhoods but still has large supply of public housing or weaker housing markets 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Community-engaged research • Define gentrification and displacement more accurately as long-term regional process with investment and disinvestment • Stress importance of recognizing neighbourhood variability rather than taking a blanket approach • Five factors mitigate negative effects of gentrification, including weak housing markets; large and stable subsidized housing stock; strong community organizing; tenant protections; restrictive zoning
Building					
 U1	Parkdale Community Hub: Preliminary Feedback, Insights & Directions	Parkdale Toronto, ON Canada			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Create a community hub joining public library, community centre, arts and culture centre • Provide space for those without or at risk of losing what now exists • Shared visions of hub described by artists, ensure it be designed with their needs in mind • Manage expectations to grow and retain existing services to avoid community opposition
 U2	The art of the (condo) deal	Davenport Toronto, ON Canada			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Artscape first new condominium development with 68 live-work units for arts and culture workers


TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 U3	What do we lose when spaces for artists disappear? Rosina Kazi tells us what it means for our communities	Sterling Road Toronto, ON Canada		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Urgent loss of spaces that are accessible and safe for 2SLGBTQ artists of colour Artists spaces are overlooked as cities gentrify Lack of spaces with soundproofing for musicians At risk of losing entire artistic community 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Unit 2, a shared live-workspace for concerts, workshops, events, and practising where musicians and artists can be themselves Government become more involved in displacement Pressure developers into providing affordable spaces for artists Art can help with organizing and igniting hope in the face of hopelessness
 U4	Garage becomes a working art studio		Toronto, ON Canada		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Convert garage into a studio and exhibit space including ventilation, insulation, and heating
 U5	Cities for People				<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Architecture scale, edges, facades, and diversity of uses attract activity from pedestrians and encourage to linger longer in public space Toolkit on how to build vibrant public spaces
 U6	Inside Regent Park: Toronto's test case for public-private gentrification	Regent Park Toronto, ON Canada		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Regent Park is test case for public-private gentrification Developer claims community of nothing but social housing is "not normal" Academic literature however remains inconclusive on the benefits of "socially mixed" redevelopments on low-income tenants Wealthier residents destabilize political organizing of housing tenants by having more political clout and social power and taking up space engaging neighbourhood associations 	

TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 U7	Regent Park Redux: Reinventing Public Housing in Canada	Regent Park Toronto, ON Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Redevelopment 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Temporary displacement of low-income social housing residents during redevelopment • Resettlement of first cohort of displaced residents with Right to Return policies • Stress, frustration, friction experienced by residents • Daniels Spectrum arts and culture hub generally seen favourably but activities are too expensive for returning low-income social housing tenants, question corporate events becoming more numerous • Little social interaction between high and low-income residents suggests true goal of building economically mixed communities (social/tenure mix) in public-private redevelopment is gentrification which displaces low-income residents, not identified advantages of wider social networks, better community services, amenities, and safer streets 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Interviews with 52 households to critically examine consultation process, effectiveness of Right to Return policies, experiences with displacement and redevelopment
 U8	Rising rents, noise, and health issues: Is Artscape failing its tenants who seek affordable live-work studios?	Toronto, ON Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Revitalization 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Property tax hikes • Increased rents • Lead paint and noise complaints • Quality of life concerns from tenants 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Developer focused on expansion instead of being a good landlord • Increase number of developers delivering affordable, subsidized housing and workspaces for the arts

TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 U9	Artscape Weston Common brings artists to the community through housing	Weston Toronto, ON Canada		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Affordability is biggest threat to culture Trauma in low-income neighbourhoods outside the downtown core with few artists 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Build affordable spaces outside downtown core to keep artists in Toronto instead of moving to Hamilton, including housing, meeting, and performance space
 U10	Gentrification Response: A Survey of Strategies to Maintain Neighbourhood Economic Diversity.	USA			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> New supply is necessary, but new housing supply is not enough to protect lower income households Toolkit to build more affordable housing and protect low-income households at risk of/facing displacement (i.e., "linkage fees, equivalent to Ontario's Section 37)
 U11	Project Row Houses	Houston, TX USA			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Purchase and revitalize derelict housing with volunteers for affordable housing, free housing for single mothers, public art programs, workshops, summer programs for youth, art studios, installations
 U12	Affordable-housing project in Regent Park envisioned just for musicians	Regent Park Toronto, ON Canada		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 90,000 on affordable housing waitlist in Toronto, growing everyday 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Proposal to develop 100 units of affordable housing to musicians, include shared studios, strict guidelines for tenants including financial need and artistic production





TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 U13	Artscape 5.0: Strategic Plan 2018-2022	Toronto, ON Canada		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Strategic plan points to rapid expansion and increased scope of arts community developer using creative placemaking practices • Unclear if vision acknowledges critiques of creative placemaking for prioritization of economic benefits of arts and culture to communities over the artists themselves • Developer dominates the industry rather than incubating alternative models of affordable housing for artists 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Transition of affordable studio provider to creative placemaking community developer that strives to improve collaboration, proximity to services and amenities, connections to local communities, access to markets • New efforts to help artists become empowered, connected, and prosperous including Thriving Artist initiative, Launchpad hub, revenue-generation opportunities, tenant community card
 U14	Affordable housing for artists aims to keep them in Toronto	Toronto, ON Canada		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Affordable housing supply for the arts is not meeting demand • Current developers have a monopoly 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Affordable housing for artists based on Canadian Mortgage and Housing standards of 30% of income on rent • Non-profit artist housing cooperatives like Beaver Hall and Arcadia • Foster more developers to break monopoly of current provider of arts spaces
 U15	As Rents rise, Artists are Reviving the Idea of the Medieval Guild	Europe			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Co-working spaces in abandoned buildings as revival of European medieval guild, where artists control production, qualities, support apprenticeship and obtain local influence




TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
Research					
 V1	King-Spadina Cultural Spaces Retention Study: Strengthening the Creative Economy in Toronto's Downtown Core	King-Spadina, Toronto, ON Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Population growth • Revitalization • Redevelopment 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 25,000 new residents into neighbourhood from 2017 to 2018 • Industrial buildings have offered affordable and flexible workspaces for arts and culture • Increased demand for development has led to redevelopment of industrial buildings for other uses than arts • Pressure of rising housing prices displaces artists and arts spaces currently in the neighbourhood • Mix of culture, employment, residences a draw for people to downtown Toronto 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Policy directions to reduce displacement • Partnerships with real estate development projects for cultural institutions • Grant programs for cultural spaces from government • Targeted outreach • Use of municipally owned properties for cultural purposes • Incentives for new cultural space development
 V2	Housing in Focus	Etobicoke Scarborough Weston Toronto, ON Canada		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Average attendee to urban planning consultations are white, male homeowners 55 years of age or older (City of Toronto, 2015) • Older white attendees are more likely to support policy decisions or oppose or limit the ability to produce affordable housing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Community planning consultations to reflect and include the interests of lower income and underserved residents, including more co-op and non-profit housing • Land use maps created by 140 residents if housing was treated as a human right, from "Housing in Focus" workshops for Weston, Etobicoke Lakeshore, Danforth Village, Maryale-Wexford




TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 V3	By the Square Foot: Initial Findings Report	Hamilton, ON Canada		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 93% of emerging artists, 56% of mid-career artists, 45% established artists make less than \$20,000 per year 10% of artists without dedicated access to studio space earn over \$20,000 per year 71% of artists feel their current space is limiting their success 62% of emerging artists have no access to studio space Other impacts outlined for non-profit for-profit organizations 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Arts and culture impact survey regarding lack of spaces Questions asked include what makes a great studio environment, what kind of space would help you succeed




Governing


 W1	Gentrification and Displacement Study: Implementing an equitable inclusive development strategy in the context of gentrification	Portland, OR USA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Investment Demographic changes Rising housing prices 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Mapping gentrification and neighbourhood change Market-conscious approaches with inclusive racial and equity lens Recognize how public investments affect the private market Methods to anticipate housing demand and market changes Public regulations to engage diverse partners, minimize effects Risk Assessment framework to assess susceptibility or risk of gentrification (displacement vulnerability, demographic change, housing market conditions, equity analysis) Equity development toolkit (community impact policies, community benefit agreements, inclusionary zoning, educational and technical assistance)
--	--	---------------------	--	--	--

TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 W2	SF cultural districts gain footing in preserving neighborhoods' heritage	San Francisco, CA USA			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Cultural district designations by municipality to preserve heritage and high concentration of arts and culture assets May help organizations within its bounds to play a more integral role in development due to the designation
 W3	'More Yuppy Stuff Coming Soon': Gentrification, cultural policy, social inclusion and the arts	Maribyrnong Melbourne Australia		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Field of cultural policy is more contested than academic literature assumes Local governments have agency to be active mediators of complex problems like gentrification, displacement, socio-economic polarization Existing literature says public policy is part of the problem Case study suggests cultural policies support negotiation between complex issues of gentrification, displacement, and the arts 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Case study of local issues Municipalities and governments create strong, compelling, well-supported arts and cultural strategies that acknowledge gentrification as an issue Develop capacity to predict and plan for change Develop actions that respond to opportunities and threats from gentrification
 W4	In Defense of Housing	USA		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Housing affordability as an international issue 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Right to the city that implements transformational change, de-commodifying of housing, expanding public housing, supporting alternative housing forms, democratizing housing management
 W5	Council unanimously votes to make Toronto a Music City	Toronto, ON Canada			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Municipal music strategy explicitly links access to affordable housing and a strong music sector City must mitigate loss of artistic talent to neighbouring cities Create music hub

TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 W6	Housing by People	Global	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Centralization of housing management 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Centralization of housing management helps limit decision-making to a few powerful members 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Decentralize housing management better reflect human values Permit more homeowners to decide what happens to their property Lessen regulation on what materials can use De-packing housing types, management systems, location Move away from prescriptive to proscriptive planning
 W7	Culture Urban Future: Global Report on Culture for Sustainable Urban Development	Global		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> North American culture trends in urban renewal and support of culture to economic development Widespread replacement of historic neighbourhoods (dense, mixed-use, low-rise) with denser mid to high-rise construction Increased immigration, cultural diversity, emergence of social justice and participatory democracy movements Culture at core of urban regeneration strategies since 1960s, especially a part of post-industrial decline reversal strategies 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Policy framework for 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Urban Development and New Urban Agenda Combine heritage, contemporary design, environmental awareness
 W8	Skyrocketing commercial rents purge reluctant artists from Toronto's west end	Toronto, ON Canada	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Lack of rent controls Powers of Ontario Municipal Board to supersede City of Toronto decisions 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Increased commercial rents to \$26.44 per square foot in 2016 compared to \$15.89 in 2006 for spaces under 1,000 square feet Displacement of artists from Wallace Avenue after video game company from France received \$263 million grant from Ontario Lack of rent controls 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Active 18 artists' organizing and advocating on space issues Ontario government Section 37 funds for cultural spaces




TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 W9	A Plan for Preserving and Expanding Affordable Arts Space in Portland	Portland, OR USA			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • City declaration that role as a creative hub is not inevitable and will be lost without immediate action • 24 strategies created by community members and City staff, including building, preserving, funding, zoning, advocating, mapping
Community wealth-building					
 X1	Can community land trusts slow gentrification?	USA		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Extensive research on the benefits of community land trusts but little empirical data to confirm these claims 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Study to confirm benefits of community land trusts, including: • Preservation of long-term affordable housing in neighbourhoods by removing houses, buildings, and lands from the market • Enhance neighbourhood stability by increasing length of residency, preventing displacement of low-income households, ensuring security of tenure • Contribute to building of community assets based on regular interactions of owner-occupants based on shared interests
 X2	Reallocating Equity: A Land Trust Model of Land Reform		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Land speculation • Financialization • Perpetuation of private property 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Community land trusts disrupt capitalist housing market • Benefits to residents, communities, society at large • Extend privileges and advantages of property to those who are otherwise denied access • Contribute meaningful community development through local control of financial and spatial capital




TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 X3	Community Benefits Agreements			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Precarity • Inequality 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Grow community wealth • Potential of an arts-based Community Benefits Agreement through local procurement for public art or development of arts spaces/hubs • These agreements negotiated between public or private development agents and community groups • Three primary elements for the Agreement: employment opportunities, affordable housing, community and environmental improvements • Four phases: negotiation and coalition formation, development of platform for negotiation, implementation planning, focus on outcomes
 X4	7 Paths to Development That Bring Neighborhoods Wealth, Not Gentrification	USA		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Inequality • Poverty concentration 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Increase community wealth through anchor institutions, social enterprises, and local partnerships focused on needs of low-income families, people of colour, those with barriers to employment • Seven drivers for working together, including place, ownership, multipliers, collaboration, inclusion, workforce, system
 X5	More than Money: How social finance can build resilience in the arts sector	UK Toronto, Hamilton, ON Canada		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Economic precarity 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Build resilience in the arts through social finance • Overview of Arts Impact Fund (UK), Artscape Daniels Launchpad, Centre 3 for Print and Media in Hamilton and The Harbourfront Centre

TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 X6	Parkdale Community Planning Study: Building a foundation for decent work, shared wealth and equitable development in Parkdale	Parkdale Toronto, ON Canada		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Urban decay • Regeneration • Rebranding of West Queen West and Liberty Village 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Participatory action planning for decent work, shared wealth building, equitable development using Community Economic Development framework • Focus on collective ownership and democratic control of land, money, and labour in Parkdale • Wellbeing indicators including learning, accessibility and inclusion, housing and land use, economic opportunities for decent work, health and food security, social and natural infrastructure, participatory democracy • Seven priority community development areas include social infrastructure, affordable housing and land use, decent work and inclusive economic opportunities, food security, community financing, participatory local democracy, and cultural development

Protesting (responses)

 Y1	Anti-Gentrification Groups Push for Community-Centered Spaces	Lachine Canal Montreal, QC Canada			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Community protests to reclaim abandoned industrial sites for community benefits • Calls to create a tax reserve for social housing and community development, zoning to protect against large tax increases, support for reclamation of warehouses like 2012 takeover of Building 7 by community organizations in Pointe-St-Charles
--	---	---	--	--	--

TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 Y2	Art in the Face of Gentrification	Bronx Manhattan Brooklyn, NY USA			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Artist protests by sharing tools and information in townhalls • Fighting landlord harassment by locating legal services • Leave visual legacies for communities • Form intergenerational bridges through art • Sharing spaces and resources, hiring people of colour, hiring within the community • Making community outreach intentional and conscious • Co-leading programming with community
Toolkits					
 Z1	Beyond Gentrification: Finding a Balance	New York USA			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Study of four cities for advantages and disadvantages of gentrification • Surveys and interviews with residents • Public policy toolkit to mitigate displacement and preserve affordable housing
 Z2	Tactical Urbanism: Short-term Action for Long-term Change				<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Tactical urbanism examples and toolkit for small-scale actions to serve a larger purpose in new, temporary, permanent public space • Requires local work, little time, low cost, scalable, and require little policy intervention • For example, using empty stores, parking lots and spaces, use of public streets and posts, and use of traffic islands

TYPE / ID	SOURCE	REGION	ROOTS	RIPPLES	RESPONSES
 Z3	9 Principles of Ethical Redevelopment	Chicago, IL USA			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Ethical redevelopment creates mindful city-building Use cross-city networks and cross-sector innovation to conscientious development instead of profit driven Nine principles including repurpose and re-propose, engagement participation, pedagogical moments, the indeterminate, design, place over time, stack, leverage and access, constellations, platforms
 Z4	Square Feet: The Artist's Guide to Renting and Buying Creative Space	Toronto, ON Canada			<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Toolkit assisting artists, producers, and board members with purchasing and leasing workspaces Sections include getting ready, leasing, buying, the hunt, and when things go wrong Alternative models of ownership are explained including sole ownership, joint tenancy, tenancy in common, condominium, and cooperatives
 Z5	Keeping the Neighborhood Affordable: A Handbook of Housing Strategies for Gentrifying Areas				<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Three affordable housing strategies: housing production, housing retention, asset building Housing production methods include trust funds, inclusionary zoning, tax credits) Creative methods to free up land for development include code enforcement, rent control, tax relief Help residents build wealth through education and counseling, limited equity co-ops, homeownership support

Appendix 2: Full Annotations

Displayed alphabetically by author, the annotations are grouped according to three primary themes (roots, ripples, and responses to gentrification) and multiple sub-categories [i.e., arts-led gentrification (roots), artwashing (ripples), protesting, advocating (responses)].




Format

The format for each detailed annotation is as follows:

THEME

Category

Resource type


-  Website page or article
-  Journal or print article
-  Book


Annotation number


A1

Resource Author (Date). *Resource Title.* Resource Publisher.

Resource URL

 **Resource Category**

 Resource Tags

 **Annotation Author**

- CC** Cheryll Case
- FC** Felicity Campbell
- JA** Jessa Agilo
- MP** Monique Cheung
- MP** Michael Pereira
- NI** Anonymous

Description.

ROOTS

Arts-led Gentrification



Alioto, D. (2019, June 19). How Graffiti Became Gentrified. *The New Republic*.

<https://newrepublic.com/article/154220/graffiti-became-gentrified>



Arts-led Gentrification



United States, New York, 5Pointz, Graffiti, Workspaces, Cultural Revitalization, Investment, Reinvestment, Commodification, Lawsuits, Gentrification Roots, Gentrification Ripples, Gentrification Responses



MP

The derelict 5Pointz warehouse in Long Island City, New York is a "legendary" graffiti venue. In Alioto's article, 5Pointz is used as a case study to suggest linkages between the use of graffiti as an attraction in low-income neighbourhoods (or otherwise derelict spaces) and gentrification. In this case, the work of graffiti artists made the 5Pointz warehouse a cultural attraction that brought new visitors to the site along with investors to the surrounding neighbourhood.

A legal haven for graffiti for years, the derelict warehouse was christened 5Pointz in 2002. In 2013, the warehouse and graffiti were set for demolition, with luxury condos proposed in its place.

Graffiti artists with work at 5Pointz took a legal fight to the site's developers and were awarded \$6.75 million in total damages after the graffiti was whitewashed at night without a permit (a decision presently under appeal). Meres One, the lead plaintiff in the suit, recognizes that "real estate and art go hand in hand now," and proposes that one way that displaced artists may be given more permanent space to create is to establish public paint parks in each borough of New York. Alioto tracks how art may be coopted by capital while documenting how artists can resist commodification of their art while they participate in the process.



Bain, A. L. (2006). Resisting the creation of forgotten places: Artistic production in Toronto neighbourhoods. *Canadian Geographer / Le Géographe Canadien*, 50(4), 417–431.

<https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1541-0064.2006.00155.x>



Arts-led Gentrification



Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Yorkville, King Street West, The Junction, Cultural Revitalization, Placemaking, Urban Revitalization, Suburban Revitalization, Social Distancing, Marginalization, Wealth Disparity, Gentrification Roots, Gentrification Ripples, Gentrification Responses



MP

In this article, Bain argues that an artist's role in urban placemaking is their unique ability to revive and revitalize "forgotten places."

Bain looks at three Toronto neighbourhoods to illustrate her thesis: Yorkville, King Street West, and The Junction. Similar processes of artist-led gentrification are outlined in each.

First, artists move into neighbourhoods with low-cost homes or industrial spaces that have fallen out of use. These areas are typically also mostly populated by working class and poor residents. Bain suggests that by this turns these places into neighbourhoods of artistic production. This conversion sees artists rewrite the urban

narratives that surround them, which in turn attracts new investment. As a result, the same artists who improved the neighbourhood experience housing insecurity or are displaced due to gentrification.

Bain proposes that a process of social distancing occurs between the artists, often of middle-class roots and relations, and the original residents of the neighbourhoods they now occupy (the homeless, social welfare households, sex trade workers, and immigrant families).

There is, thus, potential that the historical narratives artists produce may be over-simplified or exclusionary. Bain insists, however, that artists can use their artwork to communicate forgotten urban narratives and experiences to a diverse audience.

This is described as their ability to mediate between the middle class and the working class—an ability afforded to them by their own socioeconomic marginalization and relatively weak position in the labour market. Through this ability, artists can prevent the creation of forgotten places.



Grodach, C. (2016). Arts, gentrification, and planning for creativity. *Carolina Planning Journal*, 41, 22–29. https://issuu.com/carolinaplanningjournal/docs/2016_carolina_planning_journal_v41?e=4690398/44375684

Arts-led Gentrification

United States, Equitable Land Development, Urban Development Policy, Inclusion, Creative Cities, Creative Consumption, Complexity, Gentrification Roots, Gentrification Ripples, Gentrification Responses



In this article, Grodach asks whether the arts are inevitably intertwined with gentrification and displacement, and whether planning for arts and cultural activity must be synonymous with creating consumption precincts for the wealthy?

Grodach reviews debates around the connections between the arts and gentrification and suggests that the dominant and alternative theories have complex relationships. Grodach traces the history of creative city planning where the emphasis is increasingly placed on creative consumption. In such cases, this emphasis takes precedence over production for the sake of economic development or place-based revitalization.

The author's analysis reveals that while arts-based gentrification is often cited as the driver of gentrification due to its visibility, the reality is far more complex. For instance, the type of industry matters. Commercial arts industries related to film, music and design are most likely to locate in places that undergo rapid gentrification, while visual and performing arts companies, museums, and fine arts schools are often attracted to wealthy areas because of a rich audience base.


Grodach is clear that the real forces behind gentrification are the joint processes of speculative investment and disinvestment, not the arts. In fact, he states that the arts can mediate and subvert the negative effects of gentrification by promoting community development, building social networks, and providing public space forums. The author argues that communities must shift away from the creative city planning agenda ("which treats the arts as amenities to catalyze land development and lure upscale consumption") and concentrate more on how arts might play a role in starving off some of the more inequitable outcomes of contemporary urban development. While this is a useful perspective, Grodach provides very few avenues to accomplish this.



Davis, B. (2013, October 15). Are Artists to Blame for Gentrification? *Slate*.

http://www.slate.com/articles/life/culturebox/2013/10/are_artists_to_blame_for_gentrification_or_would_soho_chelsea_and_bushwick.html

Arts-led Gentrification

 United States, New York City, Sheep Station, SoHo, Creative Cities, Deindustrialization, Publicity, Reinvestment, Wealth Disparity, Gentrification Roots, Gentrification Responses

 NI

This article examines the belief that artists are causing gentrification. It looks at how arts are being used to create neighbourhoods that are highly valued. This results in many disadvantaged communities being forced out to make room for the upper class. There is also the idea that artists come into these neighbourhoods and influence the more affluent with their lifestyles, accelerating this shift.

The reason why there is a belief that artists are causing gentrification is due to well-known examples such as Sheep Station and SoHo. "Sheep Station" was created by Michael Shvo, a real estate broker. This was viewed as a public relations stunt to promote luxury residences in the area.

An earlier example was SoHo. Artist George Maciunus deindustrialized the neighbourhood by creating artist cooperatives, but this did push out the manufacturing workforce (made largely of Puerto Ricans and African Americans).


There are responses that both support and deny this belief. Policy Analyst Jenny Schuetz did a study on if the opening of arts galleries accelerated development. While they did not, Schuetz did consider that other arts venues might accelerate development. A lot of this belief is also pushed by Richard Florida, who mentions that if you can lure the "creative class" you will prosper.

Artists are not always to blame for the increase in gentrification. Many artist communities still live in poverty. In many cases, gentrification happens even without the arts. Developers seize the opportunities that artists provide, as they are an economic vitality. However, the article makes note that, even if these artists do not exist, developers will continue doing their job, which is developing.



Ley, D. (1997). *The New Middle Class and the Remaking of the Central City* (1st edition). Oxford; New York: Oxford University Press.

Arts-led Gentrification

 Canada, Ontario, British Columbia, Ontario, Quebec, Toronto, Vancouver, Montreal, Housing, Middle Class, 1960s Youth Movements, Gentrification Roots

 MP

Who is gentrifying Canadian cities? Ley's seminal book proposes that the "new middle class" is at the center of the gentrification of Canadian inner cities. The new middle class has its roots in the youth movement of the '60s. This class is extending the period spent as inner-city residents beyond student and young adult life, sometimes indefinitely.

Much of this class is employed in knowledge-based parts of the economy, the growing quaternary sector—one that represented 12.6 per cent of all jobs in 1961 compared to nearly 30 per cent in 1991. The tertiary sector also saw significant growth during this time, while the primary sector lost ground and the secondary sector suffered considerable losses through the '80s and '90s.

These new jobs often required a high level of qualifications, offered above-average salaries, and concentrated in large metropolitan areas. These jobs effectively attracted and retained the new middle class to locate within inner city neighbourhoods.

Ley argues that the artist plays a significant social role for the new middle class, serving "as a broker of fashionable middle-class taste, demarcating the new frontier of cultural distinction" (189). Where the artist moves in search of affordable housing and workspaces in the inner city, the new middle class would follow, Ley explains, as artists ultimately emerged as the "expeditionary force for inner-city gentrifiers, pacifying new frontiers ahead of the settlement of more mainstream residents" (191).

Ley finds that census data supports this assertion. The presence of artists in 1971 in Toronto, Montreal, and Vancouver was among the top five independent variables coinciding with gentrification of specific neighbourhoods through the decade. For artists, inner city neighbourhoods represent "authentic places."

Ley claims these places provide social and cultural distance from the under-stimulation, standardization, and conformity of the suburbs. Through this process, pre-existing low-income and working-class residents are displaced or put at risk of displacement as costs of housing rise with the introduction of middle-class newcomers, who may also show anti-democratic or exclusionary tendencies.

Ley notes that the loss of rental housing stock across major Canadian cities throughout the late 20th century has also played a significant role in the gentrification of the inner city. For example, City of Toronto data shows over a thousand rental units a year lost between the mid-70s and mid-90s due to demolitions, renovations, and conversions. Additional losses occurred due to the deconversion of joint owner-tenant occupancy to owner-occupation alone, amounts to a net loss of almost 18,000 units. This represents the displacement of almost 54,000 people. Consistently low vacancy rates in major Canadian cities (except Montreal) have made the situation for displaced individuals even more precarious.



Mathews, V. (2010). Aestheticizing Space: Art, Gentrification, and the City. *Geography Compass*, 4(6), 660–675. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1749-8198.2010.00331.x>



Arts-led Gentrification



Canada, Cultural Policy, Gentrification Roots, Gentrification Responses



FC

This article provides a summary and analysis of relevant literature surrounding the relationship between art and gentrification in urban areas. It traces the debate on whether gentrification is driven through cultural consumption or production. Mathews defines gentrification and describes its key historical trends.

For example, Matthew describes three elements which map out of the "first and second waves" of gentrification:

- Where artists locate
- How artists change locations and what attracts other users
- How agency of artists in the process is constructed.

The article describes how incorporations of public arts continue to rise as governments, investors and developers see the value in aestheticizing space for economic purposes. Yet, the author also points out how art can be a powerful social commentary that challenges hegemonic state and economic forces. Finally, Mathews argues that it is critical that future research explore the art world beyond its economic measures.

Through this direction, pressure can be placed to ensure the incorporation of art in urban spaces provides an opportunity for local expression and debate surrounding where art is placed, how it is selected, who selects it, and what meanings are attached to the works and their producers. This would help address the arts' implications in gentrification.



Moskowitz, P. (2017). What Role Do Artists Play in Gentrification? *Artsy*.
<https://www.artsy.net/article/artsy-editorial-role-artists-play-gentrification>



Arts-led Gentrification



United States, New York, Bushwick, State-led Gentrification, Gentrification Roots



CS

In 2015, a conflict between a crochet artist and a tenants' rights activist in Bushwick, New York, captured public attention and revived the longstanding accusation that artists are gentrifiers whose presence creates rent increases and displacement. Moskowitz's contention, however, is that artists are not the sole drivers of gentrification. Instead, it also a process that involves state intervention at crucial points.

After World War II, government policies gave birth to a white middle and upper-middle class in the suburbs. In the 1970s, the children of this class migrated into cities and took their upscale values with them. Subsequently, the professional artists that sprung up in the cities primarily desired economic success in the art market.

While art intertwined with capitalistic activity, a vicious cycle emerged: as the cost of cities rose, artists created art that reflected the values of the wealthy, which drove MFA programs to churn out more market-oriented artists, who then moved to cities to produce more art for the wealthy.

Thus, a fuller understanding of gentrification's roots must account for the state's role. Government continues to make the process possible through tax breaks for developers and changes in zoning policy. Furthermore, once gentrification has generated a certain momentum, artists are no longer necessary for the initial stages; in some cases, ironically, art may only be commissioned as a retrospective measure for providing nostalgic aesthetics of a past where artists were more important to gentrification.



O'Rourke, D. (2010, November 10). To the Footsoldiers of Gentrification. *Toronto Media Co-op*.
<http://toronto.mediacoop.ca/story/footsoldiers-gentrification/5103>



Arts-led Gentrification



Canada, Ontario, Hamilton, Toronto, Gentrification Roots, Gentrification Responses



MP

This 2010 article is a call-to-action addressed to artists. The resource clarifies language around gentrification. Specific phrases such as "economic development," "revitalizing the core," and "cleaning up" are described as euphemisms for gentrification.

O'Rourke argues that artists are at the frontlines of gentrification in Hamilton. They move into affordable spaces to work and live in neighbourhoods populated by immigrants, poor, and working-class people. This results in a process of displacement and replacement that breaks down pre-existing social networks as original residents are pushed out.

Artists who need to make money from their work, are incentivized to attract higher income people to these spaces, and over time, the business community caters to this new market. As a result, people with access to more money begin to settle in the downtown core and costs of living rise.

O'Rourke notes that the arts community can become complicit in this process of displacement by demonizing already-marginalized individuals. Over time the arts community finds itself unable to keep up with rising costs and is slowly driven out, too.

O'Rourke suggests that the arts community are not the villains of gentrification, and rather, are convinced to believe the municipal government, property owners, and other capitalists share their interests. O'Rourke

suggests these groups and wealthy individuals are more interested in profit, while artists' interests are more in line with the poor and working-class folk displaced by gentrification.

It is imperative then, O'Rourke argues, that artists undertake projects that look to support marginalized people and counter the aims of gentrification to replace marginalized communities with affluent people. Toronto's Sketch Working Arts and Vancouver's The Purple Thistle Youth Collective are offered as examples of arts organizations successfully doing this kind of work.



A9

Wasielowski, A. (2018). *Made in Brooklyn: Artists, Hipsters, Makers, Gentrifiers.*

Charlotte, NC: Zero Books.



Arts-led Gentrification



United States, New York, Brooklyn, Morgantown, Economics, Technology, Cultural Production, Maker Movement, Revitalization, Neoliberalism, Gentrification Roots, Gentrification Ripples



MP

Made in Brooklyn is a sharp critique of the "Maker Movement" that considers the changing economic conditions artists face in the United States, including those spurred by gentrification, with a focus on Morgantown in Brooklyn where artists occupy former factory buildings as makers. The author discusses the origins of the Maker Movement from the nineteenth century to its current impact on labour and neoliberal economic practices in the technology industry.

Wasielowski sees the Maker Movement as one that supports neoliberal business models with the utopian rhetoric of individuality, freedom, and personal fulfillment, and suggests that the "maker" is the natural successor of early "artist-entrepreneurs" that brought neoliberalism together with the art world. It is thus more compatible with gentrification, she suggests, or less willing to oppose it, than the left-wing artistic avant-garde groups of the past.

While the Maker Movement strives to revitalize the city and its derelict industrial infrastructure by transforming these areas into centres of small-scale creative production, the Maker Movement often falls short of its utopian ideals. Through her critique, the author explores broader questions around the nature of artistic work in a digital world, as well as definitions of "hipster" in the context of youth culture, gentrification, labour, and the influence of technology on the development of artistic practice and urban space.

Wasielowski explores how and why artists are attracted to low-income communities, identifying several problematic aspects of the "colonization" of these neighbourhoods by artists seeking places of perceived danger, otherness and authenticity that offer conceptual distance from homogenous middle-class life.

This resource offers more insight into the roles that artists play in gentrification and proposes that gentrification and rising costs of living have pushed artists to become more outward-facing and entrepreneurial.



Hyde, Z. (2018, May 15). Foodies Gentrify Vancouver's Downtown Eastside. *The Tyee*.
<https://thetyee.ca/Opinion/2018/05/15/Foodies-Gentrify-Downtown-Eastside>



Culinary Arts



Canada, British Columbia, Vancouver, Downtown Eastside, Culturewashing, Gentrification Roots, Gentrification Ripples, Venues



CC

This article describes how new waves of restaurants and 'foodie' culture gentrifies neighbourhoods and public discourse in Vancouver's Downtown Eastside:

- Restaurants enter the neighbourhood to access lower rents
- These lower rents allow the restaurant to spend more money to provide a higher quality dining experience
- While their offerings are cheaper than the typical higher end restaurant, they are not affordable to the long-time residents of the neighbourhood they enter
- These new restaurants upscale the neighbourhood, displace more affordable retail, and exclude other affordable retail from entering the neighbourhood.

Those who participate in foodie culture are described to be excited by the ability to experience a wide variety of 'authentic' and 'exotic' foods. The article describes foodie culture as a new form of status seeking that conceals exclusivity.

Foodies tend to have a higher cultural and economic capital than others. In this dynamic, foodies see their consumption habits as inclusive and restaurant owners see themselves as caring. Restaurants further lean into their identification as 'caring' by hosting fundraisers or donating to local panhandlers.

As a result, community members who organize against higher end restaurant owners for gentrifying the neighbourhood are vilified. Other members of the public see the organizers as 'overbearing' because the restaurants they organize against are not "too fancy" and are trying to help the neighbourhood. The organizers, however, are described as having interest in action on the broader process of gentrification; this intent is overshadowed by their protest of higher-end restaurants.



Stanley, A. (2019, July 2). Food fuels Hamilton's gentrification. *The Globe and Mail*.

<https://www.theglobeandmail.com/business/industry-news/property-report/article-food-fuels-hamiltons-gentrification/>



Culinary Arts



Canada, Ontario, Hamilton, Culture-washing, Protesting, Vandalism, Venues, Gentrification Roots, Gentrification Ripples, Gentrification Responses



MP

This article reports on how the rise of fine dining restaurants in Hamilton contributes to the gentrification of the city. While this connection is not thoroughly explored, the author does point to some of the other causes of gentrification in Hamilton and shares an example of how high-end restaurants can exist in low-income neighbourhoods.

For example, the author focuses on The Heather, a 6-seat restaurant in Barton Village. "It serves a seasonal tasting menu, north of \$100 per person, four nights a week yet it's located just steps away from the Helping Hands Street Mission, where homeless go for help."

The author points to other factors that contribute to the changes in Hamilton's landscape, including population-growth, and an increase in public and private investment. Jason Thorne, general manager of the City of Hamilton planning and economic development department, points to the arts and culture scene as a driver of this change as well, and a precursor to the rise of the city's food scene.

Some adverse ripples to gentrification in Hamilton are outlined, primarily a vandalism spree led by anti-gentrification anarchists.

Gentrification Theories



Druka, K., Kamgari, A., MacNevin, J., Orasch, A., Peters, C., & Porter, M. (Eds.). (2019). *Gentrification Glossary*. Hamilton Artists Inc / GAGED Hamilton. http://www.theinc.ca/wp-content/uploads/2019/06/HAI_GAGED_Gentrification-Glossary-Web.pdf

Gentrification Theories

 Glossary, Gentrification Roots, Gentrification Ripples, Gentrification Responses



This pocket-sized glossary summarizes concepts and key resources to respond to gentrification and the arts in Hamilton, Ontario in simple, easy to understand language. With similar terms used liberally throughout this report, issues and terms discussed and defined in the glossary include:

- 1) Theories, strategies, mechanisms of gentrification (i.e., root causes)
 - Gentrification and gentrification cycles
 - Investment, working class, wealth disparity
 - Vacancy decontrol
 - Incentivization
 - Business incubators, co-working spaces
 - Development charges
 - Artwashing
 - Restoration
 - Policing
 - Transit-oriented development
 - Speculative development

- 2) Problems with gentrification and urban development (i.e., ripple effects)
 - Beautification
 - Co-option / appropriation
 - Placemaking
 - Revitalization / urban renewal
 - Vibrant neighbourhood(s)
 - Creative economy / creative city
 - Monopoly rent
 - Displacement (renoviction, demoviction)
 - Mega-landlord
 - Food desert
 - Greenfield development

- 3) Responses to gentrification
 - Affordable housing
 - Co-operatives
 - Public housing
 - Right to housing
 - Rent control
 - Community land trusts
 - Geared to income
 - Community benefits agreements
 - Broad public consultations
 - Neighbourhood associations
 - Protesting
 - Dollar voting
 - Lobbying
 - Harm reduction
 - Land use planning / city planning
 - Inclusionary zoning



Harvey, D. (2012). *The Art of Rent*. In *Rebel Cities: From the Right to the City to the Urban Revolution* (pp. 89–115). London; New York: Verso Books.

Gentrification Theories

 Arts, Culture, Commercialisation, Economics, Rent, Monopoly Rent, Gentrification Roots

 FC

“The Art of Rent” is a chapter in *Rebel Cities*. The author, David Harvey, coins the term “monopoly rent,” which arises when social actors monopolize and leverage control over some directly or indirectly tradable item which is unique and non-replicable. This occurs when actors control a commodity, land, or a resource that is traded upon.

Essentially, Harvey suggests all rent is based on the monopoly power of private owners of certain portions of the globe. Harvey uses the idea of monopoly rent to explain the commodification of daily life, including that of urban spaces. He argues that the ability to capture monopoly rents from cultural artifacts and practices and special environmental characteristics is based upon claims of characteristic uniqueness, authenticity, and specialty for the spaces.


Yet, Harvey also outlines the contradiction of monopoly rents: i.e., when items or places become overly commercialized and lose their marks of distinction, they become harder to trade. This is where the author draws upon the processes of urbanization and gentrification as results of the pacification and commercialization of art, culture and daily life.

Another critical point Harvey makes is that, by seeking to trade on values of authenticity, locality, history and tradition, capitalists open a space for political thought and action within which socialist alternatives can be both devised and pursued. Oppositional movements can embrace cultural producers and cultural production as key elements in their strategies. This chapter is theoretically useful in explaining the political economic backbone of gentrification as a global phenomenon and strategy.



Petruziello, M. (2010). *Gentrification and the Arts on Mississippi Ave.: Creating Two Communities and Making Them Whole*. Saarbrücken: LAP LAMBERT Academic Publishing.

Gentrification Theories

 United States, Oregon, Portland, African-American Communities, Neoliberalism, Restructuring, Revitalization, Disinvestment, Gentrification Roots, Gentrification Responses

 CC

In this book, the author draws upon insights from the Mississippi Ave cultural district in Portland, Oregon’s Boise neighbourhood.

Historically an African-American neighbourhood, the region has seen rapid change since the 1980s when an influx of new residents and grassroots involvement made the neighbourhood safer and more economically prosperous.

Historic residents have not benefitted as much as newcomers have, resulting in two separate communities sharing the same space. The book examines the role that the arts and culture played in emphasizing this process while considering the traditional narrative of “artist-pioneered gentrification” and arts and culture in equitable community development.

In an effort to achieve revitalization without gentrification, the author suggests an effective, equitable, and sustainable solution is needed to repair the division that may occur in a neighbourhood when one culture, often the wealthier newcomers, dominates the area's social environment. To dominate the area's social environment, the wealthier newcomers set the agenda and directs opportunities for arts involvement. The cycle of higher income residents moving into otherwise lower income neighbourhoods is described to be part of the neoliberal urban restructuring. Neoliberal urban restructuring is described to be a cycle where neighbourhoods experience chronic underinvestment before being gentrified.

Petruziello argues that the achievement of this goal requires understanding of the role of planning and development in community change. Ideally, planning and development would be applied in a way that results in an effective, equitable, and sustainable solution. The author describes community participation as essential to the achievement of these goals. With active participation, the participants actively shape the product and are taught to wield the cultural tools for the creation of personal meaning. This allows them to express themselves on their own terms.



Shaw, K. (2008). Gentrification: What It Is, Why It Is, and What Can Be Done about It.

Geography Compass, 2(5), 1697–1728. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1749-8198.2008.00156.x>

Gentrification Theories

 Neo-Liberalism, Neo-Marxism, Culture Choice Theory, Economics, Migration, Gentrification Roots



This article uses a variety of social theories to investigate and describe gentrification and displacement. Culture choice theory, ecological urban ideology, neo-Marxism, post-industrial, and neo-liberal are a sample of the theories used in this article.


Cultural choice theory is used to explain why cultures around the world experience the same trends of gentrification and migration to urban centres (after a period of migration to suburban settlements). Neo-Marxism is used to explain the flow of capital between urban and suburban regions. The article is a literature review of popular analysis by other social studies researchers.



Smith, N. (1996). *The New Urban Frontier: Gentrification and the Revanchist City* (1st edition).

London: Routledge.

Gentrification Theories

 United States, New York, Displacement, Disinvestment, Tax Arrears Mapping, Gentrification Roots, Gentrification Responses



This book is among several foundational gentrification studies referenced by scholars today. Smith argues that gentrification is a product of the "revanchist city", as middle- and ruling-class white residents who seek to "take back" the city from those with less privilege, power, and social standing. Smith identifies the later as minorities, the working class, homeless people, the unemployed, women, gays and lesbians, and immigrants.

The author argues the "frontier" discourse used in gentrification processes depicts cities as wilderness, and poor and working-class residents as "uncivil". This view serves to rationalize and legitimize a process of conquest that uproots and displaces residents of the late-twentieth-century inner city. In a discussion on the Lower East

Side in New York City, Smith suggests that artists were offered artificially low rents in a developers' effort to "tame" the neighbourhood and make it more attractive to real estate buyers.

Smith proposes a theory of gentrification that sees disinvestment as its precursor. Such disinvestment allows for the emergence of a "rent gap" in which the ongoing rent is below the potential rent that can be achieved with some investment. This "rent gap" enables developers to capitalize on properties with income potential beyond the costs of redevelopment. Smith suggests that the disinvestment in property is neither an inevitable nor a natural occurrence. He finds it to be intentionally brought by developers who seek to increase their profit rates.

As an example, he uses tax arrears data to map the frontier line of gentrification in New York City by uncovering where disinvestment is occurring.



Zuk, M., Bierbaum, et.al. (2017). Gentrification, Displacement, and the Role of Public Investment. *Journal of Planning Literature*. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0885412217716439>



Gentrification Theories



Residential Displacement, Classification, Housing, Rental, Gentrification Roots



CC

This journal article highlights the methodological limitations of understanding displacement. Gentrification is described as a process where undervalued land is revalued through reinvestment by wealthier residents who move in to enjoy the amenities of the neighbourhood. Residential displacement, a central concern of gentrification, often follows this process. Residential displacement occurs when households are forced to move out for reasons outside of their control. Vacancy due to displacement provides an opportunity for higher income residents to move in. The authors identify three types of displacement:

- Direct/physical: Eviction or deterioration in housing quality
- Indirect or economic: Condo conversion or rent increase
- Exclusionary: Zoning policies or unaffordable housing.

The authors advocate that future studies on gentrification and displacement should clearly describe which type of displacement is examined. The clarity is important to understand the complexities of the process and what solutions are needed to maintain or improve access to adequate and affordable housing.

Deindustrialization, Neighbourhood Change



D1

Bennett, K. (2017, February 24). Stories from a shifting city, told by 8 Hamilton artists. *CBC.ca*. <http://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/hamilton/stories-from-a-shifting-city-told-by-8-hamilton-artists-1.3996991>



Deindustrialization/Neighbourhood Change



Canada, Ontario, Hamilton, Gentrification Roots, Gentrification Ripples, Gentrification Responses



NI

This article from CBC News looks at how the changes occurring in Hamilton are impacting artists. Hamilton reporter Kelly Bennett interviews 8 artists (writers, photographers, musicians, and a furniture maker), who share their perspectives on the shifting city, both the good and the bad. Topics discussed include increased

population (especially a younger generation showing greater appreciation for the arts), growth in business, and the rise in housing and studio costs. Additionally, the author mentions the tight-knit community that exists in Hamilton and how many artists/residents would like to see it continue even after the changes.

Many of the artists that were interviewed mention the rising housing costs and how unaffordable the city is becoming. One artist (Andrew Baulcomb) mentions that he does not want to see families "...get left behind."

In addition, gentrification has resulted in a lot of competition in business. This increase tends to negatively impact smaller creators and business owners trying to make a living. One artist (Kojo Dampsey) believes that the city has not really changed and that minority groups such as people of colour face the same issues today as they did in the past.


Some ideas proposed to solve these issues include mixed income housing, less bureaucracy, and preserving architecture (balancing old buildings with new developments).



Harris, R., Dunn, J., & Wakefield, S. (2015). A City on the Cusp: Neighborhood Change in Hamilton since 1970 (No. 236). *Neighbourhood Change Research Partnership*.

<http://neighbourhoodchange.ca/documents/2015/04/neighbourhood-change-in-hamilton-since-1970.pdf>

Deindustrialization / Neighbourhood Change

 Canada, Ontario, Hamilton, Burlington, Mapping, Revitalization, Wealth Disparity, Housing Costs, Gentrification Roots



This two-part resource is from the University of Toronto's Neighbourhood Change Research Partnership. It contains 17 graphs and maps which outline various demographic changes in Hamilton and Burlington from 1970-2010, as well as an analysis of what these trends signify.

Specifically, the data visualizes Census Tract information such as:

- Changes to neighbourhood income distribution
- Percent of income from government transfer payments
- Percent of recent immigrants by census tract
- Average individual income in 1970, 1980, 2000, and 2010
- Rental Housing Disadvantage Index
- Refugee landing quotients
- Percent increase of real estate prices in Hamilton from 2002-2013.


The graphs outline three trends:

- Since the 1970s, there has been the decline of the lower city due to deindustrialization and concentration of people on welfare, and the rise of western suburbs including Burlington
- Since the 1980s the decline of the inner suburbs to east and south
- Since 2010, downtown revival and increased house prices.



Ryan, J. R. S. (2017). Arts-Based Gentrification in Hamilton, ON. *Journal of Undergraduate Studies at Trent* (JUST), 5(1), 61–67. <https://ojs.trentu.ca/ojs/index.php/just/article/view/93>

Deindustrialization / Neighbourhood Change

 Canada, Ontario, Hamilton, James Street North, Gentrification Roots, Gentrification Ripples

 FC

This resource is from an undergraduate journal at Trent University. It is an exploration of arts-based gentrification in Hamilton, Ontario. The article is informed by local city discourse, news media, activist publications, demographic studies, as well as other academic theories of gentrification.

The author groups the consequences of gentrification into three categories: economic displacement, cultural shifts, and erosions of civic rights and freedoms. Rather than argue that change is inherently negative, Ryan argues that gentrification has disproportionately negative effects on racialized populations, immigrants, and the urban poor. He states that more research is needed to influence policy change.

This article traces the history of Hamilton, the decline of industrial development, and the movement towards creative class planning. The author points out the key geographical concentrations experiencing gentrification- James Street North Arts District- and explains how activists have resisted clear manifestations of gentrification and rising unaffordability. In this description, the author draws parallels with the punk movement.


This article is a useful overview of arts-based gentrification in Hamilton. It points out key trends, patterns, and forms of resistance. At times it lacks a nuanced perspective on the regional forces that are contributing to Hamilton's gentrification – such as Toronto's unaffordability crisis and Provincial Plans/legislation.

Colonialism



Spring, C. (2015, November 13). Gentrification and Displacement in Toronto's Downtown East. *The Media Co-op*. <http://www.mediacoop.ca/story/gentrification-and-displacement-toronto%E2%80%99s-downtown/34119>

Colonialism

 Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Downtown Eastside, Homelessness, Indigenous Peoples, Toronto Purchase Treaties, 1700s, 1800s, Colonialism, Gentrification Roots, Gentrification Ripples

 CC

This article illustrates that gentrification is expected, largely because of its relationship with colonialism. It describes that city planning is an extension of colonialism. In 1787 the Mississauga's agreed to sell 6,400 acres to the British government. In 1805, the Crown took it upon itself to draft a new agreement, for 250,800 acres, without further compensation to the Mississauga's. These purchases, and most notably the unfair claim over Toronto were grounds for colonizers to dictate use of land in Toronto.

With these powers, colonizers have diminished the ability for Indigenous peoples to adequately access housing. The author sees a direct link to what is now happening in Toronto's downtown east side. Here, 500 shelter beds will be demolished to make way for long-term care housing for seniors. There are currently no plans to replace the demolished shelter beds. Due to their history on this land and with colonizers, Indigenous peoples are particularly vulnerable to being homeless. While 1% of Toronto's population is Indigenous, 16% of the homeless are Indigenous.

Urban Planning, Policy, Zoning



August, M., & Walks, A. (2017). Gentrification, suburban decline, and the financialization of multi-family rental housing: The case of Toronto. *Geoforum*.

<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoforum.2017.04.011>



Urban Planning / Policy / Zoning



Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Deregulation, Financialization, Inequality, Public Policy, Gentrification Roots, Gentrification Responses, Housing, Rental



CC

In this paper, the authors suggest the financialization of housing in Toronto is partly driven by government policies. In the 1990's, Real Estate Investment Trusts (REITs) were legalized by the Canadian government, and then supported by provincial level policy changes to deregulate tenant protections, decontrol rent, and decreased funding for social housing. This environment enabled REITs to flourish, with now over 350 buildings owned by this corporation type in Toronto.

REITs who wish to maximize their profits apply different strategies to buildings based on their social location and characterized by the replacement of poorer renters with higher-income tenants. Affordable rental in the inner suburbs experience above the guideline rent increases and underinvestment in infrastructure, while buildings in areas expected to gentrify are aggressively upgraded to reposition the building to meet middle income demands. In both processes, "financialized landlords" work to "squeeze" and evict tenants so they can collect higher rents from the newer tenants.



F2

Hengels, A. (2017, March 20). How to Fight Gentrification's Real Culprit, Political Privilege *PanAmPost*.

<https://panampost.com/editor/2017/03/20/political-privilege-and-class-war-in-the-urban-housing-market/>



Urban Planning / Policy / Zoning



Inequality, Politics, Gentrification Roots, Gentrification Responses, Urban Planning



CC

This guest article was written for PanamPost by Adam Hengels, the Senior Vice President and Director of Development of PAD, a real estate development start-up that builds communities for young professionals.

In this article, the author states that higher income or wealthier residents exercise their political clout to prevent the building of new housing developments near them. As a result, development occurs in lower income areas, where the residents have a lower level of political clout. Higher income residents then move into the new development in lower income areas because this is the only available housing for them to move into.

The author suggests that higher income neighborhoods are desirable to build in, and that developers can expect stable and predictable demand there. As such, land use policies should be adapted to permit new housing development in higher income areas. With this approach, higher income residents can remain in higher income areas and lessen the displacement of lower income residents in lower income neighbourhoods.



Kramer, A. (2019). Inside and Outside: A Meditation on the Yellowbelt. In *House Divided: How the Missing Middle can Solve Toronto's Affordability Crisis* (pp. 142–153). Toronto: Coach House Books.

Urban Planning, Policy, Zoning

 Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Yellow Belt, Missing Middle, Affordability Crisis, Gentrification Roots, Housing

 FC

This book chapter examines the rationale, formation, and consequences of Toronto's "Yellow Belt".

The Yellow Belt is a term used to refer to the area of the City of Toronto where land use policy restricts the immediate permitted housing type to detached structures (as opposed to multi-family options such as semis, townhouses, or small apartments).

The Yellow Belt is described to be a central component of Toronto's planning framework. It shapes its geography and contributes to the growing affordability crises.

The Yellow Belt is large. It is approximately 1.8 times larger than the total land area of all other residential zones. Although Toronto's Yellowbelt is almost three times the size of Manhattan, there is no formal acknowledgment of its existence or size anywhere on the City website.

Kramer argues that Toronto's housing divisions and inequities are shaped by planning policy and therefore questions whether up-zoning for the missing middle will solve Toronto's housing crises. She makes the argument that the city cannot grow sustainably without adding new affordable housing in residential areas.


Throughout the chapter, Kramer addresses the rationale for protecting the "Yellow Belt" and how this has guided growth and infrastructure throughout the City. She looks at how real estate development and transactions serve as the primary avenue for municipalities to add necessary amenities, pay for services, and support the yearly population growth.

Further, Kramer addresses how condominium development has replaced any new purpose-built rental and the privilege carried by homeowners in a society that upholds and rewards property ownership. This chapter is a successful and useful outline of how planning and policies have created the current affordability crises, and what may be done about it.



Perks, G. (2019, July 9). GORD PERKS: The risks of the financialization of housing. *Spacing Toronto*. <http://spacing.ca/toronto/2019/07/09/perks-the-risks-of-the-financialization-of-housing/>

Urban Planning / Policy / Zoning

 Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Financialization, Deregulation, Income Inequality, Income Polarization, Housing, Gentrification Roots, Gentrification Ripples, Gentrification Responses

 FC

This op-ed, written by Toronto City Councilor Gord Perks, traces the financialization of housing in Canada, with a focus on the Greater Toronto to Hamilton Area. Perks acknowledges and disputes a common belief that the main cause of housing unaffordability is a lack of supply. Instead, he argues, the housing crisis is the result of policies and international speculation that have highly financialized the housing market.

Due to the high degree of financialization, Canadians pay multiple layers of investors through instruments like mortgage-backed securities and real estate investment trusts. Perk states that over the last few decades, the nature, scale and impact of land speculation has changed through financial de-regulation, the growing concentration of wealth, and light-speed digital money-movement.

His solution is to remove investors from the picture by making more housing government owned and operated. The op-ed is a useful resource to understand the financial roots that contribute to gentrification and the housing affordability crises, as well as possible solutions.



Rosen, G., & Walks, A. (2015). Castles in Toronto's Sky: Condo-Ism as Urban Transformation. *Journal of Urban Affairs*, 37(3), 289–310. <https://doi.org/10.1111/juaf.12140>

Urban Planning / Policy / Zoning

 Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Condo Development, Financialization, Deindustrialization, Housing, Gentrification Roots

 FC

This article analyzes the evolution and spatial dynamics of condominium development in Toronto. Toronto is the largest housing market in Canada and the host to a major condominium boom over the last 40 years. The article traces the policies that fostered this specific type of growth and its implications.

The authors explain how the condominium boom in Toronto has facilitated a type of urbanization linked with neoliberalism and a reduction in public spending. They coin the term “condo-ism,” to refer to the emerging nexus of economic development, finance, and consumption sector interests that intersect condominium construction and culture. Condo-sim has directed growth to the urban core, channeled capital investments and young residents, and promoted gentrification, and ultimately transformed the character of Toronto's central business district.


There are several key factors that have influenced condo-ism, including economic restructuring of the region, deindustrialization, and the rise of the service industries, decline in manufacturing, and shifting blue-collar labour into the construction on new housing.

Furthermore, provincial, and municipal legislation has also played a role in promoting intensification, urban living, and the building of condominiums. The municipal planning taxation system benefits from new construction through its collection of development charges, and Section 37 funds. It is also important to note that condos have filled the lack of new purpose-built rental housing construction, which has all but vanished since the early 1990s.



Sewell, J. (1994). *Houses and Homes: Housing for Canadians* (First Paperback Edition). Toronto: Lorimer.

Urban Planning / Policy / Zoning

 Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Condo Development, Financialization, Housing Policy, Deindustrialization, Gentrification Roots, Housing

 FC

In this book, Sewell focuses on the financial policy component of housing.

Housing policy in Canada has implemented a process called “semi-filtering” to provide affordable options to lower income Canadians. Through semi-filtering, upper income households move into more desirable housing while lower income households move into housing that has been vacated by upper income residents.

In tandem to this method, the government decided to have most of housing funded by the private sector, as opposed to through the public sector. The success of the policy is questioned.

For example, the first home ownership programs came about in the 1950s, and by 1986 only one third of suburban homes were bought by first time home buyers. Homes were traded amongst those who already own property. This helped to push up prices. Furthermore, much of the land is developed by a small handful of developers, as an oligopoly. The lack of competition in this model helps to push prices up.

To improve access to adequate and affordable housing, the author describes that housing should be understood as the accumulation of smaller problems. In this approach, people should look at institutions rather than individuals.

State-led Gentrification



Hackworth, J., & Smith, N. (2001). The changing state of gentrification. *Tijdschrift Voor Economische En Sociale Geografie*, 92(4), 464–477. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-9663.00172>



State-led Gentrification



United States, New York, Arts-led Gentrification, Gentrification Roots



MP

This academic article charts the timeline of gentrification in three New York City neighbourhoods: Clinton, Long Island City, and DUMBO.

Each neighbourhood experienced three waves of gentrification. The first wave took place prior to 1973. At this time disinvested inner-city neighbourhoods were targeted for reinvestment. To minimize risk for private investors, significant funding came from the State.

In the second wave, after the global economic recession of the early 1970s subsided, gentrification surged with leadership by private developers as governments played a relatively laissez-faire role up until the late 1980s. It was at this time in New York City that the arts community became tied to gentrification. This attracted new investment into neighbourhoods like Soho, Tribeca, and the Lower East Side.

In the Third-wave, gentrification slowed with the recession of the early 1990s but surged again post-recession as large developers built significant development projects with the State. State support is said to include deregulation, the limited community powers to oppose and resist gentrification, zoning changes, and financial subsidy.

This article shows how the State has historically encouraged gentrification in New York City. It provides a useful picture that illustrates each described wave of gentrification, and rich case studies of what gentrification looks like in practice.



McGrath, J.M. (2019, July 2). Why there's no help on the horizon for Toronto's housing crisis. *TVO*. <http://www.tvo.org/article/why-theres-no-help-on-the-horizon-for-torontos-housing-crisis>



State-led Gentrification



Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Housing, Housing Affordability, Housing Crisis, Laneway Suites, Policy, Housing, Gentrification Roots, Gentrification Ripples



MP

Even families who make more than \$100,000 a year struggle to afford homes in the city, writes John Michael McGrath in this opinion piece underlining Toronto's housing affordability crisis.

McGrath argues that all levels of governments, both Liberal and Conservative, have not done enough to tackle the affordability crisis. Their maintenance of regulatory status quo has, instead, allowed the crisis to grow.


The author argues that something "fundamental is broken in Toronto's housing market." The piece briefly outlines both sides of a debate on how to address the crisis but notes that neither side is doing enough.

More ambitious approaches to liberalizing housing rules that are taking hold in the United States, including pushes to legalize small-scale apartments, are noted in contrast to Toronto's "timid debates" regarding laneway homes—resulting in just 12 building permits since 2018. It concludes with reference to a study out of Ryerson University's Centre for Urban Research & Land Development that found Toronto lost 30,000 people per year between 2016 and 2018 to more affordable housing markets.



Moskowitz, P. (2017). *How to Kill a City: Gentrification, Inequality, and the Fight for the Neighborhood.* New York: Nation Books.

State-led Gentrification

 United States, New York, San Francisco, Detroit, New Orleans, Gentrification Roots, Gentrification Ripples


 BN

Peter Moskowitz's study is an in-depth look at four cities which have seen enormous levels of gentrification and displacement: New York, San Francisco, Detroit, and New Orleans. The book contains a profound description of gentrification mechanisms through government policies, historical context, political and economic systems. It also explores the ways these mechanisms impact people in communities that are most affected. It compiles testimonials and stories that range from low-income displaced individuals of diverse backgrounds and community members to developers, entrepreneurs, "gentrifiers", and urban planners.



Pelley, L. (2018, September 10). Small businesses "taxed out" across Toronto hoping for long-term solution. *CBC News*. <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/toronto/taxed-out-toronto-1.4809759>

State-led Gentrification

 Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Policy, Gentrification Ripples, Gentrification Roots, Small Businesses, Tax Policy, Workspaces, Venues

 MP

Why are so many small businesses across Toronto "taxed out" by property taxes? This article reports on surges in property tax rates following 2016 property reassessments. It outlines how the Municipal Property Assessment Corporation (MPAC) defines the value of commercial properties via a "highest and best use" methodology.

Through this method, a property's value is effectively ascribed to its most expensive potential use, rather than its value based on current use. Cherise Burda, Executive Director for Ryerson's City Building Institute, explains that this system affects local main streets across the city where there is rapid growth. A significant number of small businesses in these areas are unable to keep-up with rising property taxes.


Burda's team hosted an exhibition called "Taxed Out" at 401 Richmond Street West to raise awareness of this widespread trend. The City of Toronto implemented a 10 per cent tax cap in 2018 to ease some of these pressures, what Councillor Kristyn Wong-Tam calls a "band-aid solution." Wong-Tam and other critics call for more permanent solutions, like a change in the assessment process with an addition of a small business tier.

Spatial Precarity, Displacement



Boles, B. (2016). How real Estate Trends and Zoning bylaws are Threatening Canadian Nightlife. *Vice*. https://www.vice.com/en_ca/article/wnypxq/real-estate-trends-zoning-bylaws-canada-nightlife

 Spatial Precarity / Displacement

 United Kingdom, London, Canada, Toronto, Vancouver, Music, Zoning, Venues, Gentrification Ripples



This article describes the conditions that have led to a large loss in nightclubs and music venues. London is used as a severe example, which has lost 50% of its nightclubs and 40% of its music venues over the past eight years alone.


These locations close because real-estate values are high, and zoning bylaws do not support their relocation. Furthermore, areas that have traditionally contained night life spaces are entrenched upon by residential land uses. These residential land uses take up space that otherwise could have contained cultural space, increase the land value, and the residents complain about noise. These conditions put pressure on the site to close.

In Toronto, there are no plans to expand where these sites can be located. In Vancouver, additional licenses are needed on sites that already permit the use. Commentator Sean Micallef suggests that the next frontier for music venues may be abandoned strip malls in the inner suburbs, or the reuse of massive underground parking garages in the city.



CBC News. (2018, July 19). I will not be pushed out: 40-year-old Parkdale dance school faces uncertain future. *CBC News*. <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/toronto/pia-bouman-dance-school-1.4753567>

 Spatial Precarity / Displacement

 Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Parkdale, Eviction, Demoviction, Arts Space, Workspace, Venues, Performing Arts, Dance, Gentrification Ripples



This news article reports on the displacement of the Toronto's Pia Bouman School for Ballet and Creative Movement, located on near the boundary between Parkdale and Davenport just northwest of West Queen West and Dufferin. The School's displacement was triggered after the property it rented was sold to a developer and the developer was forced to revise their development application. Prior to this, the school had a 40-year history in Parkdale. This case is an example of what the process of displacement can look like for arts organizations, and sheds light on some of the challenges to the preservation of art spaces in new developments.

For example, the initial 14-storey proposal was designed to retain space for the School; however, the plan's capacity to host the School was lost when local opposition and resistance from the municipality pushed the developers to revise the application to an 8-storey building. The perspectives of Bouman, the developer, and local Councillor Gord Perks are all captured in this article. Bouman wants to stay in Parkdale. The developer said that at 8 storeys, they could not build enough units to cover the costs of housing the School. Councillor Perks argues that a key issue here is "that the city and province need to do a better job at funding mid-sized arts organizations."



Edwards, S. (2018). How Toronto landlords use renovictions to force out tenants. *NOW Toronto*.
<https://nowtoronto.com/news/renovicted-toronto-rental-housing/>



Spatial Precarity / Displacement



Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Renoviction, Rental, Housing, Gentrification Ripples



CC

This magazine article describes the unfair eviction of tenants in Toronto. In the described cases, the tenants were lied to in order to have them vacate the property. Once they vacated the property, it was relisted for rent at a much higher rate than what they had rented for. In one case, the rent was increased by \$1,000. According to the Federation of Metro Tenants, the number of renovictions (evictions where the landlord has the tenant move out to make "renovations") has increased over the last few years. The high vacancy rate is noted as a related cause of the high rate of evictions. The vacancy rate in Toronto is less than 1%.



Fullilove, M. T. (2016). *Root Shock: How Tearing Up City Neighborhoods Hurts America, And What We Can Do About It* (Reprint edition). New York: New Village Press.



Spatial Precarity / Displacement



United States, African-American, Displacement, Race Perspective, Redevelopment, Revitalization
 Gentrification Roots, Gentrification Ripples



MP

Fullilove's book is an in-depth look at the effects of displacement and community destruction on individuals and communities across the United States. In their analysis, the author applies the perspective of a psychiatrist, with a focus on black communities. Fullilove estimates that over 1,600 black communities across the United States were demolished by urban renewal policies with systemic racism and classism at their core.

These policies were developed and implemented in the interests of wealthy elites. The concept of "root shock" is used to consider the implications of such mass displacement. This term refers to the profound traumatic stress reaction that threatens the body's ability to function, ruptures bonds at a community level, and has negative ramifications far beyond neighborhood lines over an individual's lifetime and even across generations.

Fullilove proposes the "Community Burn Index" to identify neighborhoods at risk of displacement and shares several recommendations that people may undertake to heal from root shock. Specific recommendations are drawn for Black America. These concepts may help readers to better understand the negative effects of gentrification, to produce strategies to resist and/or mitigate against these negative effects, and to heal the wounds that they may create.

Fullilove draws from the French architect and urbanist Michel Cantal Dupart to propose that communities be designed and understood through what they term the "Aesthetics of Equity" so that cities may become more just for all their residents. This includes four principles:

- Respect the common life the way you would an individual life
- Treasure the buildings history has given us
- Break the cycle of disinvestment
- Ensure freedom of movement.



Howells, L. (2019, March 29). Another art gallery leaves James St. North-closing Saturday after rent soars. *CBC News*. <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/hamilton/another-art-gallery-leaves-james-st-north-closing-saturday-after-rent-soars-1.5075211>

Spatial Precarity / Displacement

 Canada, Ontario, Hamilton, Cultural Districts, Galleries, Tax Policy, Venues, Gentrification Ripples


 MP

This March 2019 story explains that another art gallery, b contemporary gallery, will be displaced from Hamilton's James St. North. The author attempts to explain why it will be displaced, and what might be done to avoid similar stories in the future. It includes the perspective of gallery owner David Brace, who notes that his own displacement is part of a pattern that sees artists drawn to a neighbourhood by cheap rents but eventually priced out as costs soar. Prices are said to spike once the neighbourhood becomes trendy, in large part because of the artists themselves. He explains that along with soaring rents, the James Street North neighbourhood has become an "entertainment district" with fewer daytime customers, and more transient clientele who are less likely to browse. Brace suggests that displacement of artists and arts spaces could be avoided if the city could incentivize building owners to maintain art spaces and/or create a new property tax bracket for cultural spaces. City staff say they are examining how other cities are addressing this issue but have yet to act.



Jones, M. (2017, September 22). 3 signs that gentrification is coming to your neighborhood. *Salon*. https://www.salon.com/2017/09/22/3-signs-that-gentrification-is-coming-to-your-neighborhood_partner/

Spatial Precarity / Displacement

 United States, California, Oakland, Bay Area, Racial Exclusion, Gentrification Ripples, Warning Signs

 AO


In this article, the author suggests gentrification in neighbourhoods that have been previously classified as poor or dangerous spots in cities, adds to social problems related to racism, violence, and poverty. People who grow up in places that have experienced urban renewal processes and development projects lose their cultural identity over time. Changes occur without any transitory period in which people can come to understand them and assimilate to these new conditions. This might mean that the urban projects within these neighbourhoods do not include the participation of its members, thus creating an environment of displacement for the original residents.

The author notes three common signs appear in gentrified low-income areas: shifts in demographics, shifts in infrastructure, and shifts in safety measures. Demographic diversity is lost as a neighbourhood's residents are forced out due to the increased cost of living. New infrastructure projects target low-income neighbourhoods while government housing projects are torn down. Safety measures that come out of the gentrification process manifest as new forms of surveillance and policing, which can make residents, especially residents of colour, feel unwelcome or unsafe.



Winter, J. (2017, December 13). Toronto development threatens to scatter artist community. The Globe and Mail. <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/news/toronto/toronto-development-threatens-to-scatter-artistcommunity/article37323583/>

 **Spatial Precarity / Displacement**

 Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Parkdale, Artists Communities, Artists Spaces, Displacement, Demoviction, Redevelopment, Gentrification Ripples, Workspaces

 **MP**

This article reports on a planned redevelopment on the site of an old warehouse on Dufferin Street near Queen Street. This would displace over 40 tenants - painters, woodworkers, filmmakers and fabricators, among other tenants. This is another example of affordable spaces for creative enterprises that are displaced with redevelopment - without much guarantee that those spaces will return at a similar cost once development is complete. It tells the story of tenants who are caught off guard by eviction notices, organizing to petition to lengthen the eviction period (with support from the local councillor and MPP), and significant challenges in losing income, moving out, and finding new space. Some of the tenants invested thousands into their spaces. The article provides a portrait of the realities and breadth of displacement.


Artwashing



Bain, A. (2016). Neighbourhood artistic disaffiliation in Hamilton, Ontario, Canada. *Urban Studies*, 54 (13), 2935-2954.

<https://journals.sagepub.com/doi/abs/10.1177/0042098016658390?journalCode=usja>

 **Artwashing**

 Canada, Ontario, Hamilton, Artists, Class, Exhibit, Middle-Income Housing, Gentrification Ripples, Gentrification Responses, Housing

 **CC**

This journal article examines how the spatial politics of cultural production can damage the social fabric of low-income neighbourhoods. A study of Lansdale, Hamilton, Ontario, is used to exemplify this. Here, culture producers align themselves more closely with the middle class, practice neighborhood artistic disaffiliation, and assert their power to control processes of neighbourhood change.

Lansdale, an otherwise lower income area, saw middle class homeowners move into the neighbourhood in 2006. Shortly afterwards, in 2009, local artists exhibited a photo piece of the sex workers caught on security cameras. The sex workers had no choice on whether their image would be used. In response, the artists were criticized for their unapproved use of their image. Years later, two new artist collectives moved into the neighbourhood. The Pearl Company owned their own space. They organized neighbourhood clean ups, conducted neighbourhood patrols, and established a neighbourhood association. The neighborhood association's agenda often centred on the removal of undesirable people from the neighborhood. Over time, the neighborhood has become wealthier, while lower income people are displaced.



Davey, M. (2017). (Davey, 2017). Gentrification, street art and the rise of the developer-sponsored block party. *The Guardian*. <https://www.theguardian.com/australia-news/2017/oct/05/gentrification-street-art-and-the-rise-of-the-bogus-block-party>



Artwashing



Australia, Melbourne, Artwashing, Graffiti, Gentrification Ripples, Housing



CC

This newspaper article describes the culture of developer/real estate-led block parties in Australia. The block party held in Brunswick East had food trucks, artisan coffee, live music, and a street artist. The invitations were dropped into mailboxes throughout the neighbourhood and its surrounding areas. At the party, attendees could pick up fliers which detailed the new 97-unit apartments for sale and speak to one of the financial advisors on hand. Information on these units were not included in the party invitation. This party was attended by between 80-100 groups of people. As an alternative to street parties, another developer in another neighbourhood distributes a quarterly local magazine. The magazine describes the neighbourhood as "eclectic" and "authentic". Dr Katrina Raynor describes these activities as exciting, and that these marketing techniques are about "creating community" and "attracting owner-occupiers". The article does not explore how these activities relate to the beliefs or lived experience of underserved residents or artists in the community.



MacPherson, S. (2017). Our Place, Our Home: Belvedere Tenants Fight to Remain in Mount Pleasant. *The Mainlander*. <http://themainlander.com/2017/09/05/the-belvedere-renters-against-evictions-in-the-wake-of-mural-fest/>



Artwashing



Canada, British Columbia, Vancouver, Culture Washing, Renoviction, Rental, Housing, Gentrification Ripples



CC

This is personal essay was written by a long-term resident of Belvedere Court. Belvedere Court is a 4-story rental apartment, in a gentrifying neighbourhood. It was one of the last bastions of affordability for lower income residents. The essay describes how the City of Vancouver's international mural program suppressed the voice of tenants and supported their later displacement.

When tenants found out that their apartment was selected to host a mural, tenants proposed that it be portraits of two endeared and long-time tenants. To overlay the portraits, they proposed the text "Our Place, Our Home". A building gifted with artists, the portraits were taken by tenants and submitted to the City. The City did not favour this text, and instead proposed "The Present is a Gift". The author writes that this text reinforces "notions of precarity for renters and forced gratitude".

The building's owner also opposed the tenant's proposed mural. In the end, the City commissioned international artists to install a mural with two residents not from the building and overlay text "The present is a gift". The depicted residents are an Indigenous woman and an old optometrist. The author notes that this choice abstractly side-steps the stories of the people who live on the site. It uses images of vulnerable residents to mask the precarious lived experience of residents whose voices were suppressed in the production of the mural.

With the building rebranded and gentrification an ongoing issue in the neighbourhood, evictions began 2 years later. Methods include making housing uncomfortable by not responding to their requests for service,

renovictions, and offering tenants \$2,000 payouts to move out. The tenants fought some of these with the support of the Vancouver Tenants Union and their NDP relationships.



Mihailiuk, A. (2017, July 4). Condos Love Culture: New Arts Development Brings “Creative Placemaking” to Chinatown. *The Mainlander*. <http://themainlander.com/2017/07/04/bc-artscape-condos-love-culture/>



Artwashing



Canada, British Columbia, Vancouver, Ontario, Toronto, Chinatown, Regent Park, Art Spaces, Artscape, Condos, Placemaking, Revitalization, Workspaces, Venues, Gentrification Ripples



FC

This article explores the development process of a community hub in Vancouver's Chinatown, led by BC Artscape. The case illustrates some significant problems with Artscape's model and consultation methods. It references the rise of Artscape in Toronto and its relationship with developers.

For example, the author describes how developers partner with Artscape to increase a project's density in exchange for some affordable studio space. The example of Daniels Spectrum in Regent Park is highlighted as a focal point for the positive spin on neighbourhood revitalization, even though the neighbourhood has gone from 100 percent social housing to approximately 25 percent.

Vancouver's Chinatown, a neighbourhood that was shaped by racism and resistance, now faces gentrification and the closure of affordable and culturally relevant retail. The author explains how the community hub process has excluded marginalized voices to realize their vision. The author uses quotes by a few community organizers. This paints a very negative depiction of the engagement process. However, the author acknowledges that Artscape developed a steering committee and consulted the residents about hiring a program developer. This article describes community members' concerns and critiques an organization that is often praised for its leadership in building affordable art spaces.



Pham, T. (2019, February 5). From Affordability to Artwashing: An Inquiry. *Canadian Art*. <https://canadianart.ca/essays/from-affordability-to-artwashing-an-inquiry/>



Artwashing



Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Affordable Spaces, Artist Communities, Artwashing,



NI

This article discusses the Mirvish Village development. Developer Westbank is creating a real estate development where Honest Ed's once stood. Westbank is known for their luxury developments. This article looks at the concepts of artwashing and how Westbank is using this tactic to seem more ethical and community focused.

Looking at the case in Vancouver's "Fight for Beauty," Westbank is facing backlash for using the arts to promote accessibility when only those who are wealthier can afford living in these developments. Mirvish Village has always been a diverse place where immigrants and low-income families called home, and many of the new murals in the development area depict that. The article makes a point that Torontonians should be aware of this case, and asks the question, would these communities still be able to live here when the new developments are complete?



Carter, A. (2018, September 11). For those left behind: Hamilton's arts renaissance isn't working for everyone. *CBC News Hamilton*. <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/hamilton/hamilton-arts-1.4811797>



Artist's Precarity



Canada, Ontario, Hamilton, Economic Development, Displacement, Gentrification Roots, Gentrification Ripples, Gentrification Responses



JA

In this article, the author shares stories that expose the challenges of urban revitalization and gentrification in the Hamilton arts community and the complexity of knowing what to do. In a city which markets itself as a cultural destination, the artists are not all thriving. Thanks in part to marketing from the City which boasts about the cultural scene, Hamilton's creative industries population has almost tripled over the course of five years, from 11,600 in 2001, to 30,000 in 2016. The arts scene grew as steel and other manufacturing sectors struggled, providing the city an alternative identity and path to prosperity. Funding from the City, however, has remained consistent, making it harder for new, emerging, or alternative artists to receive the support that they need.

Hamilton arts researcher Angela Orasch is quoted: "We're sort of being co-opted to produce this narrative that [economic development] want to produce...this revitalization narrative, when really, that kind of revitalization isn't matching up with needs in terms of housing, and security, and living wages." For example, creatives are being pushed out of their spaces as rent continues to rise and buildings continue to be sold for flipped condominiums and cafes. Artists live in fear and are working multiple jobs to survive the rising cost of living, which saps their creative drive. Supporting diversity is also a problem, where visible minorities feel excluded from all the changes. Artists' stories of precarity, displacement, and doubling of rents in six years help illustrate the challenges.

As a potential response, the article refers to Gaged Forum, a series of events occurring across the city to talk about gentrification in diverse communities. The series is hosted by the arts organization, Hamilton Artists Inc.



Communications MDR. (2016). Environmental Scan of the Culture Sector: Ontario Culture Strategy Background Document. Retrieved from https://ontariopresents.ca/sites/default/files/mtcs_environmental_scan_of_the_culture_sector_en.pdf



Artists' Precarity



Canada, Ontario, 2010s, Cultural Development, Cultural Plans



FC

Commissioned by the Ontario Ministry of Tourism, Culture and Sport, this environmental scan asks where is the culture sector headed in the next 10 years in Ontario? It provides useful analysis of global trends that shape Ontario's culture sector and common strategic responses in other jurisdictions.

Firstly, it explains the ability for the culture sector to provide individual and social benefits as well as economic returns. It then addresses the forces that shape the Future of Ontario's cultural sector. The forces are mainly globalization, fiscal restraint, digital transformation, and demographic changes. It also provides a brief sector profile of specific arts and cultural industries as well as public libraries and cultural heritage identifying the current opportunities and challenges of several different sectors.



Following this, the report outlines strategic directions including fostering inclusion, strengthening communities, enhancing the economic benefits of culture, leveraging digital technologies, investing in the culture sector workforce, and encouraging collaboration and partnerships to strengthen and support the culture sector.

While gentrification is not explicitly discussed, inferences are possible. For instance, it clearly outlines the issue of precarity and low wages among artist communities, despite the benefits arts and culture have on the local economy. This tension could have been thoroughly discussed, particularly with regards to equitable access to affordable housing and workspaces for the arts in major cities.



Kamu, I., Nguyen, P., & Paterson, R. (2016). An Overburdened Promise: Arts Funding for Social Development. In J. Pitter & J. Lorinc (Eds.), *Subdivided: City-Building in an Age of Hyper-Diversity* (First edition, pp. 142–153). Toronto: Coach House Books.

Artists' Precarity

 Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Creative Cities, Inequality, Youth, Placemaking, Policy, Gentrification Ripples
 CC

Subdivided is an anthology exploring hyper-diversity and what it means in Toronto and Mississauga. Hyper-diversity goes beyond ethnicity, to refer to power, spatial entitlement, and economic and social capital. The chapter, *An Overburdened Promise*, explores issues with youth arts funding.

A massive increase in youth arts funding was initiated in 2006, after a year of many shootings in Toronto. The goal was to combine Creative City strategies with poverty reduction strategies. This approach is highly place-based, with funding distributed to neighbourhoods who have experienced the most poverty and the most need for investment.



Three Jane-Finch culture producers – Ian Kamau, Paul Nguyen, and Ryan Paterson – give their perspectives on the direction and outcome of this funding strategy. They describe it as offloading social services onto non-profits who will hire youth at lower wages.

The issue is that many non-profits seek funding for the money and are less committed to solving the problem. They observe that programs supported by funding aims to change how 15-year old's think. Instead, they suggest, programs should aim to change how policy makers think. They describe their logic for this as follows: policy makers have influence over systemic issues, while 15- year old's do not (they cannot even vote). They note that Richard Florida's "Creative Cities" ideal is about marketing cities. What cities need however, is to solve systemic issues causing poverty.



NAVA. (n.d.). *Fair Pay for Artists.* <https://visualarts.net.au/advocacy/campaigns/artists-fees/>

Artists' Precarity

 United States, Fair Pay
 JA

This resource looks at the importance of fair pay for artists. It examines how the financial security of a professional artist compares to that of a more typical worker. For example:

- Artists are often not paid for their time, ideas, or labour; these often get written off as opportunities for exposure

- Artists typically do not have access to employment benefits and may lose the chance to get certain scholarships or grants if they do
- Artists do not typically have the means to save for retirement and require superannuation to do so.

National Association of Visual Arts (NAVA) in Australia proposes a few solutions to address these issues and ensure the creation of fair pay for artists:

- Set benchmarks for artists fees to ensure they are compensated for their work
- Implement superannuation
- Artists grants and awards to be tax exempt.



WorkInCulture. (2019, May). *MakingItWork: Pathways toward sustainable cultural careers.*

[https://www.workinculture.ca/getattachment/FYI/WorkInCulture-Connects/May-2019/WorkInCulture-Releases-Culture-Sector-Career-Susta/MakingItWork_Pathways-\(May\)-\(1\).pdf.aspx?lang=en-CA](https://www.workinculture.ca/getattachment/FYI/WorkInCulture-Connects/May-2019/WorkInCulture-Releases-Culture-Sector-Career-Susta/MakingItWork_Pathways-(May)-(1).pdf.aspx?lang=en-CA)



Artists' Precarity



Canada, Ontario, Arts, Arts Policy, Capitalism, Creative Class, Cultural Policy, Economics, Policy, Precarious Work, Precarity



MP

MakingItWork, an initiative facilitated by WorkInCulture, strives to better understand and address precarity in the arts and culture sector. This research report outlines labour market information for the cultural sector, including the cultural industries, libraries, arts, and museums and heritage. It provides detailed demographic breakdowns using Statistics Canada data, and original qualitative and quantitative data. It seeks to:

- Identify gaps and barriers in skills development and training needs and recommends ways to address them
- Provide WorkInCulture and its stakeholders with a better understanding of the issues facing the cultural workforce
- Recommend ways to improve the effectiveness of support programs and initiatives.

While it does not speak to gentrification specifically, it does go a long way to illuminate the economic realities arts workers face in Ontario. The economic vulnerabilities many artists and arts workers face in a precarious gig economy can explain, in part, why artists are negatively affected by gentrification. This includes low income, a lack of employment stability, barriers to training, and a difficulty in communicating the value of the work they produce. The report proposes four recommendations for the culture sector that can address the sector-wide challenges it identifies. This includes:

- Explore new HR tools, resources, and management models relevant to Ontario's culture sector
- Expand support for diversity and inclusion in the culture sector
- Expand support for culture sector advocacy
- Explore capacity for continuous presence in culture sectors.

These recommendations are posed to arts and culture organizations, governments, industry associations, culture sector leaders, and WorkInCulture itself.



Harrap, C. (2018, March 27). Double trouble? How big cities are gentrifying their neighbours. *The Guardian*. <https://www.theguardian.com/cities/2018/mar/27/double-trouble-how-big-cities-are-gentrifying-their-neighbours>

Social Costs

 Canada, Ontario, Hamilton, Toronto, Europe, France, Gentrification Ripples, Gentrification Advantages, Artist Housing, Workspaces

 FC

This article discusses the global phenomenon of "Double Gentrification," a process in which cities gentrify when more expensive cities are nearby.

The author provides several examples in Europe and Canada, including Bordeaux, Leipzig, Hastings, and Hamilton. These cities differ in their contexts and outcomes, and the author is careful not to label this as an entirely problematic process.

For instance, the article discusses how both Leipzig and Hamilton experienced deindustrialization, decline, and depopulation prior to their regeneration process. Meanwhile, regeneration has also brought benefits such as employment opportunities, economic growth, and new developments. The problem of congestion, displacement, and rental increases creating social unrest in several cities is also discussed, including Bordeaux where there has been a rise of anti-Parisian sentiments.

The article also describes some government actions, such as Rock House in Hastings. This is a mixed-use building that combines affordable living, capped-rent working areas, and a collaborative creative space. It is argued that one of the best ways to deal with the worst effects of gentrification is to create affordable places to live and work, and to protect them in perpetuity.



Li, W. (2019, June 17). Experts say Vancouver must prepare for a new kind of emergency — gentrification. *The Star*. <https://www.thestar.com/vancouver/2018/05/07/you-have-displacement-you-have-trauma-vancouver-needs-to-do-more-to-guard-against-gentrification-says-expert.html>

Social Costs

 Canada, British Columbia, Vancouver, Gentrification Ripples, Gentrification Responses

 FC

This article argues gentrification should be addressed in the same way that natural disasters are. Both are described as a traumatic event that leads to displacement, forced moves, and the loss of neighbourhoods. The social and health outcomes of gentrification are significant, and governments should prepare for social problems in the same way they do for environmental ones.

According to Li, the improvement of engagement policies and prioritization of neighbourhood resilience will allow governments to tackle the negative consequences of gentrification. Vancouver's resilience officer is quoted: "being tolerant, inclusive, culturally competent and supportive is going to be increasingly important in a world where global migration and geopolitical strife are really going to affect our neighbourhoods on a local level." Densification is inevitable and necessary, yet the question remains how we can ensure this does not result in the social disruption of displacement and neighbourhood change.



Rugh, P. (October 2017). Gentrification Prime. *The Independent*.

<https://independent.org/2017/10/gentrification-prime/>



Social Costs



United States, New York, Housing, Gentrification Ripples



CC

This article covers Amazon's competition to host its \$5 billion North American headquarters. One of the contenders was Brooklyn, New York. The journalist notes the irony of Brooklyn's Chamber of Commerce president celebrating the area's transit access when they previously called for an investigation of how its endemic delays produce losses in economic productivity. Aside from this project, Amazon is slated to open two new sites in New York. They will receive \$38 million in public subsidies to do so. New York is growing its supply of creative industries and tech sector workers and exploring the development of a 258,000 square new tech hub. With the new tech jobs, there has been a response of new housing developments in New York. This places pressure on working class employment sites and workers. Industrial sites are targeted for redevelopment, meaning blue collar jobs may be lost, and the price of housing will continue to go up elsewhere.



Slater, T. (2005). Toronto's South Parkdale neighbourhood: a brief history of development, disinvestment, and gentrification. *University of Toronto Centre for Urban and Community Studies*.

<http://www.urbancentre.utoronto.ca/pdfs/researchbulletins/CUCS-RB-28-Slater-Parkd.pdf>



Social Costs



Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Parkdale



MP

This research bulletin provides a brief overview of how gentrification has come to be in Toronto's South Parkdale Neighbourhood.

It offers a history of the neighbourhood, and some of the factors that made South Parkdale a neighbourhood susceptible to gentrification, including: disinvestment, slum rhetoric, the construction of the Gardiner Expressway, the conversion of housing, and the deinstitutionalization of thousands of psychiatric patients without clear policy and community care to provide said patients the help they needed.

With an abundance of affordable spaces available, artists moved to the neighbourhood, soon followed by middle-class homeowners and tenants drawn in by its perceived "edginess". The author suggests the introduction of this new population has given rise to social conflict in South Parkdale as long-time residents are threatened by displacement. In some cases, middle-class residents have advocated for the removal of permanent affordable housing (i.e., rooming houses and bachelorette buildings), further threatening the livelihoods of the area's low-income residents.

This resource illuminates one of the ripples of gentrification. It shows how gentrification may lead to social tension between a neighbourhood's long-time residents and new residents. It also charts a course through history that shows the conditions that make gentrification possible.



Sheppard, S. (n.d.). Why is Gentrification a Problem? *Centre for Creative Community Development, Williams College.*

<http://web.williams.edu/Economics/ArtsEcon/library/pdfs/WhyIsGentrificationAProbREFORM.pdf>



Social Costs



Gentrification Responses, Gentrification Ripples, Gentrification Roots, Gentrification Advantages



MP

This academic study examines how gentrification negatively effects community improvement actions in neighbourhoods where it may be observed. After providing a brief overview of debates on what gentrification is and what it does, the author proposes, and later proves, that an increase in housing turnover/displacement (based on the share of population who have moved within the last 5 years) is associated with a significant (52-72%) decrease in community improvement expenditures. This occurs because residents at risk of displacement are less likely to involve themselves in community improvement efforts and require significant time or monetary investments. Contrary to popular belief, this effects all neighbourhood residents, and can mean less programs for youth, neighbourhood cleanup, and business training opportunities. Ultimately, this study provides a holistic view of the effects of gentrification in entire communities rather than on individual households. The author suggests that governments should increase assistance for the provision of community improvement actions and ensure provision of affordable housing to limit involuntary displacement, thus encouraging residents to invest in their communities.

Creative Placemaking



Federal Reserve Bank of San Francisco. (2014). Creative Placemaking. *Community Development Investment Review*, 10(2). <https://www.frbsf.org/community-development/files/cdir-10-02-final.pdf>



Creative Placemaking



Artists/Community Collaboration, Collective Impact, Cultural Development, Displacement, Economic Development, Placemaking, Revitalization



CC

This collection of essays, curated by the Federal Reserve Bank of San Francisco, details various thoughts on creative placemaking.

In the essay, *Opportunity at the Intersection of Community development and Creative Placemaking*, author Ben Hecht notes that "creative" is an adverb used to describe the process ("making"), not the place itself. As such, a creative process is open to engagement from the arts, and its success is measured by the ability for artists, creative interventions, formal and informal art spaces, to support the achievement of community outcomes.

In a creative process, the artist's talent enables the community to express their identities and goals. The author suggests that, to increase its capacity for success, creative placemaking needs to harness private capital, manage permanent funds, build private-public partnerships, and utilize planning tools to make arts-led zones more ubiquitous.

In another essay, *Creative Placemaking: How to Do it Well*, authors Ann Markusen and Anne Gadwa Nicodemus provide a list of goals the National Endowment for the Arts (NEA) created to help creative placemaking project planners be more intentional about the generation of local outcomes. The list includes:

- Strengthen and improve the local community of artists and arts organizations

- Increase community attachment
- Improve quality of life
- Invigorate local economies.

In the essay, *Assessing a Set of Indicators for Creative Placemaking*, authors Elaine Morley and Mark Winkler introduces the livability indicators developed by NEA. This list includes 23 items that span over the categories of resident attachment to community, quality of life, arts and cultural activity, and economic conditions. Notably, the indicator list does not include any clear measurement of the affordability of art spaces or artist appropriate housing.



Pritchard, S. (2019). Place Guarding: Activist art against gentrification.

In *Creative Placemaking: Research, Theory and Practice* (pp. 140–156). London and New York: Routledge.



Creative Placemaking



Creative Class, Gentrification, Neoliberalism, Placemaking, Protesting, Resistance



FC

This essay presents a critique of the growing ideology and practice of creative placemaking. The author, Stephen Pritchard, argues that creative placemaking is a dominant vehicle for gentrification, through its pursuit of creative class models, social capital theory, and new urbanist principles.

In other words, creative placemaking is a way to prime land and communities. It is part of the process where the wealthy implement neoliberal policies. The practice does this while making use of language that signals inclusivity and creativity.

Pritchard argues that housing is the "key battleground" of this process. The focus on social capital assumes that marginalized people and communities suffer from a lack of social capital rather than wider forms of disempowerment, domination, and exploitation. This in turn enables the intervention of the third sector and the pursuit of neighborhood regeneration.

Pritchard offers "place-guarding" as an alternative, which includes those radical approaches that guard places from the forces of capital. In these instances, artistic acts of resistance "deny compliance, and invoke and embody a spirit of disobedience,".


This harnesses the power of art to claim back the city. He explores how activist art within the context of housing protests can offer potentially generative approaches to place guarding capable of resisting appropriation by policy platforms like creative placemaking. He offers three examples of radical place-guarding to illustrate examples of radical resistance: the Balfron Social Club, Southwark Notes Archive Group and Boyle Heights.

He concludes that creative placemaking is about the creative class remaking cities for wealthier residents but there are alternatives to subvert this trend.



Carter, A. (2018). 'It's a fiasco': Hamilton shuts down 'City of Music' website as criticism mounts. *CBC News*. <https://www.cbc.ca/news/canada/hamilton/hamilton-music-city-1.4798068>

Art / Artists

 Canada, Ontario, Hamilton, Branding, Music, Revitalization, Creative Cities, Municipal Funding, Gentrification Ripples, Gentrification Responses



This article describes the shutdown of Hamilton's City of Music website. The website and program had been widely criticized for its strong focus on branding in lieu of direct support to Hamilton's musicians. \$60,000 was spent in one year for marketing, merchandise, a stage, and website hosting. Several members left the funding's advisory group when the plan was first established. One former member described the funding distribution as "a fiasco". Future plans for funding include continuing the City Hall concert series, improving musician loading zones, facilitating a live music venue alliance, and curating a local music archive among other initiatives. It is not clear how much these activities cost in comparison to the \$60,000 targeted in the article.



Catherwood-Ginn, J., & Leonard, R. H. (2015). Rivers and Bridges: Theater in Regional Planning. In *Arts and Community Change: Exploring Cultural Development Policies, Practices, and Dilemmas*. New York: Routledge.

Art / Artists

 Artist-Led Social Change, Artists Roles, Development, Planning, Gentrification Responses



How might art be used as a tool in planning processes? This chapter describes the Building Home project, a collaboration between performing artists and community planners in the New River Valley of Virginia on a three-year comprehensive regional planning project called the Livability Initiative.

Artists from the Building Home project use Story Circles to collect and record personal stories and perspectives of local residents at community festivals. Additional engagement opportunities were based on two theater techniques: Forum Theater and Image Theater.

Forum Theater invites participants to solve staged conflicts through improvisation, ultimately exploring ideas for addressing community concerns. Image Theater asks participants to physically construct common issues and concerns, using their own bodies and/or those of fellow participants.

These techniques recognize that theatre can be an effective medium for the expression of community concerns and encourage deliberation amongst residents to address those issues. This resource does not speak to gentrification, but it does show how artists may be meaningfully involved in planning projects that may ultimately lead to more equitable communities.



Helguera, P. (2011). *Education for Socially Engaged Art: A Materials and Techniques Handbook*.
Lightning Source Inc.

 **Art / Artists**

 Research Methods, Community Engagement

 **CC, JA**

This book describes the benefits and challenges involved in producing socially engaged art, and the scenarios where the practice is effective. While this resource is not specific to gentrification, the application of social-engaged practices has potential to help foster more inclusive, community-led engagement in response to divisive urban development practices.


Socially engaged art is a tradition in which the process of creation is part of the artwork, unlike traditional fine arts, where the finished product is the art. As social practitioners, artist who facilitate socially engaged art are individuals whose specialty includes working with society in a professional capacity. This art is dependent on community to exist and is a community-building mechanism itself. Its emphasis is less on protest, and more on becoming a platform or network for the participation of others.

Creating a mural for a community space is a common form of socially engaged art. The process of developing the art, coordinating community, training community members on how to paint, builds social bonds, and the completion of the mural builds the community's sense of identity. The greatest strength of this style is its antagonism. As art, it is effective in teaching and posing questions, not providing answers. The author does caution that practitioners must be careful to ensure their art does not slip into just being entertainment. This slippage would overshadow other aspects of the artistic performance, such as community capacity building.



Kosut, M. (2016, September 13). *We Are the Scene: Alternative Art Economies in Bushwick*.
<http://www.metropolitiques.eu/We-Are-the-Scene-Alternative-Art.html>

 **Art / Artists**

 United States, New York, Alternative Communities, Artist Communities, Artist Space, Creative Cities, Cultural Policy, Gentrification Responses, Gentrification Ripples, Workspaces, Venues

 **FC**

This article explains how artists work in the confines of an increasingly unaffordable New York City and Brooklyn. The author challenges the notion that "New York is over". They argue that artists make do in whatever spaces they can find. It shares examples of artists who work out of their tiny apartments and display art in their windows. These practices push the boundaries of public and private. While the traditional gallery system may exclude many from participating, artists adapt to gentrification in a variety of ways.



Mclean, C. (2011). Six Families, One House and the Life of an Arts Based Research Project. In *Creative Arts in Research for Community and Cultural Change* (257-271). Brush Education.

 **Art / Artists**

 Canada, Ontario, Vancouver, Community Development, Community Engagement, Storytelling, Art, Housing



This chapter describes one artist's experience derived from their production of an artwork about a few families who lived in the same Vancouver house during different periods of time. The artist used narrative analysis and analysis of narrative to produce stories that described and analyzed the experiences of the past residents. These stories are communicated through visuals and text quotes.

The artist describes that they applied a compassionate lens to compose an account of the difference between groups (Chinese is the only ethnic group mentioned). The artwork was created to prompt observations about how meaning is built into the house, and to explore, with heritage planners, how these observations could be extracted and presented. While producing the art, the artist questioned their own bias and how their upbringing influenced their perspective.



McNiff, S. (Ed.). (2013). *Art as Research: Opportunities and Challenges*. Bristol: Intellect Ltd

 **Art / Artists**

 Arts, Research Methods



This book aims to challenge and motivate artist researchers to fire up their base to better know, problem solve, and support healing transformation. The author explains that artists bring a unique perspective to problem solving. Through their process of exploration and experimentation, artists apply art-based research as a method of artistic enquiry.


The outcomes of this enquiry can be presented aesthetically and performatively. The challenge is that this form of communication is pressured to conform to other ways of knowing. It bends to pressure to produce "evidence based" clinical outcomes and to prove knowledge through empirical data. This results in art that is less true to its form. Instead, art-based research should speak more to artistic intelligence.



More Art. (2002, February 14). *Reaction to Gentrification from the Artist Community*.

<http://moreart.org/reaction-to-gentrification-from-the-artist-community/>

 **Art / Artists**

 United States, New York, Texas, Houston, Artists/Community Collaboration, Arts Community, Community Action, Housing, Workspaces, Venues



This blog piece explores the efforts of arts communities in large US cities to enact "transformative social change" in gentrifying neighborhoods. In the investigated cities, artists collaborate with long time residents to create non-profit neighbourhood redevelopment initiatives that generate affordable workspaces for artists alongside

low-income housing and commercial spaces for the local community. These artist-community collaborative initiatives illustrate the critical intersection of socio-political expression with material social change. The author notes that these initiatives also represent “a visual narrative” of the positive change and community empowerment that is possible in the face of gentrification.

Project Row House is one example of this type of initiative. In 1990, local African American artists in Houston redeveloped a set of abandoned row houses into creative workspaces and low-income housing for residents. The community also had access to arts education and a local gallery. A similar initiative in South Side Chicago saw the renewal of abandoned buildings to create local cultural institutions and affordable residential and commercial spaces.



O'Brien, H. M. et al. (2017, June 19). An Artists' Guide to Not Being Complicit with Gentrification. *Hyperallergic*. <https://hyperallergic.com/385176/an-artists-guide-to-not-being-complicit-with-gentrification/>



Art / Artists



United States, California, Boyle Heights, Galleries, Artwashing, Artists' roles, Gentrification Roots, Gentrification Responses



NI

This article was written by Heather O'Brien, Christina Sanchez Juarez, and Betty Marin. They met at School of Echoes, an open listening process of community-based research, education, and organizing to generate experiments in political action. They reflect on the issues surrounding the working class and poor communities, including gentrification.

In 2015, this group, along with other tenants, formed the Los Angeles Tenants Union, which fights for the right to housing for all. Their mission is to strengthen tenants' political power through education, advocacy, and direct action. The authors want artists to consider what roles they play in gentrification and to challenge that complicity to create a positive change. This article examines the case of artwashing at Boyle Heights art galleries.

The authors have listed a few ways that artists can be more active in solving the issues surrounding gentrification:

- Becoming more involved in housing struggles
- Educating themselves, especially considering that we may have more privilege (important to know renters' rights)
- Find other ways of dealing with conflict, other than calling the cops (the article talks about case of galleries in Boyle Heights calling cops on protesters)
- Artists should be aware of where they set up exhibitions (interrogate them and challenge what is done with their resources. They should be aware if the locations benefit the community, or if they are used to raise value for developers)
- We need to choose whether you prioritize your individual careers or dismantle oppressive structures
- Ask about the power of art spaces to determine who or what is included in the first place (looking at how spaces show pieces of diverse artists only temporarily).



Rose, K., Hawk Daniel, M., & Liu, J. (2017). Creating Change through Arts, Culture, and Equitable Development: A Policy and Practice Primer. *PolicyLink*.

http://www.policylink.org/sites/default/files/report_arts_culture_equitable-development.pdf



Art / Artists



Untied Stats, Arts, Equitable Development, Inclusion



FC

This report examines the intersection between community development and the arts and culture sector across the United States. After an outline of some programs across the USA and a highlight of barriers to expansion, the authors put forth some recommendations to expand community development initiatives. Recommendations include restructuring public investments in the arts and culture sector to support capital projects and operations plus producing more programming that support underserved communities.

The report is based on the argument that public arts and culture have significant placemaking, economic, and social impacts. In consideration of demographic changes and political turbulence, only equity can ensure everybody has the opportunity to participate and prosper. The intersection of art, culture, and equitable development can ensure just and fair inclusion.

The authors put forth six recommendations to support "inter-connected growth of arts, culture, and equitable development". They are:

- Map the artistic and cultural assets
- Evaluate economic conditions
- Identify barriers for equity-seeking groups, work with artists
- Culture bearers, and young people to engage community
- Expand equity-focused arts and culture investments
- Ensure governance and staffing are representative.

This report draws from many sources and highlights relevant programs across the USA. It provides a good analysis and overview of various movements on community investment, anchor institutions, and transportation. Yet, gentrification and housing affordability are not referenced thoroughly in the definition of "community development" nor does the report critically examine the possible negative outcomes of some of these place-based solutions. Generally, there is a lack of attention to the issue of precarity among artist communities.



Scherabon, H. (2016, November 30). The art of gentrification: city data made beautiful. *The Guardian*.

<http://www.theguardian.com/cities/gallery/2016/nov/30/art-gentrification-patterns-data-visualisation-herwig-scherabon->



Art / Artists



United States, Illinois, Chicago, Europe, London, California, Los Angeles, San Francisco, Art, data Visualization, Evictions, Gentrification, Income Polarization, inequality, Gentrification Responses, Housing



MP

This publication is a short collection of data visualizations by graphic designer Herwig Scherabon that presents statistics and patterns that illustrate gentrification in major cities. Statistics Scherabon draws from include income inequality, segregation, and evictions. One graphic shows a positive correlation between house prices

and employment in arts and entertainment in Los Angeles. Ultimately, it is a useful example of how art can present the facts of gentrification in an aesthetically relatable and effective way.



Sherman, D. (2016). A Creative Placemaking Field Scan: Exploring the Ways Arts and Culture Intersects with Housing: Emerging Practices and Implications for Further Action. *ArtPlace America*.

https://www.artplaceamerica.org/view/pdf?f=/sites/default/files/public/pictures/artplace_field_scan_housing_sherman_apr_2016.pdf

 **Art / Artists**

 United States, Arts, Creative Placemaking, Artist Housing, Venues, Workspaces, Gentrification Responses

 **FC**

This report describes the movement of creative placemaking in the USA. It is a movement where art plays an intentional and integrated role in place-based community planning and development. Creative placemaking's view is that community development must be locally informed, human-centric, and holistic.

This field scan frames the intersection between housing and creative placemaking. It explores and outlines:

- Key goals or needs in the housing sector that arts and culture might address
- Framework to understand the ways that arts and culture has and might partner with the housing sector
- Barriers to the integration of arts and culture within the housing sector
- Strategies or tactics to advance collaborations with arts and culture in the housing sector.

The report identifies community-based practices at the intersection of arts and housing. These practices are grouped into six things that communities use the arts to accomplish:

- Articulate invisible housing challenges
- Nourish individuals and communities who have experienced trauma through housing
- Organize housing campaigns
- Bridge disparate neighbourhood residents
- Stabilize vulnerable communities
- Generate economic development for communities who are structurally barred access to capital.

Rather than gentrification as a force that threatens the arts and culture sector, this report shifts the questions towards how communities can adapt and rebuild through creative placemaking. This is a valuable and in-depth response to the housing affordability crises that is so often framed through numerical data.



Steer, E. (2019, May 17). How Can Artists Help Us Tackle Gentrification? *Elephant.art*.

<https://elephant.art/can-artists-help-us-tackle-gentrification/>

 **Art / Artists**

 Europe, United Kingdom, Gentrification Process, Photography, Gentrification Responses

 **CC**

This magazine article describes the artwork of photographers whose work is featured in the Unseen photography exhibit. The exhibit took place 2019 in London England. The wider goal of the host organization was to bring artists together with field experts and to examine the impact of artists on society and to celebrate socially engaged practice. The photographers note that they are directly affected by gentrification. They

described that through gentrification, there is social cleansing where business owners and residents are pushed out. They note that the immediacy of photography keeps record of what has happened in cities. One of the artists produces images by layering computer generated architectures onto the physical built environment. Through their work, they work with the occurring errors to visually comment on the way marketing is utopian but an incomplete representation of what the materialization of the new built development form.



Vona, V. (2016). *The role of art and artists in contesting gentrification in London and New York City* (Ph.D., King's College London). [http://kclpure.kcl.ac.uk/portal/en/theses/the-role-of-art-and-artists-in-contesting-gentrification-in-london-and-new-york-city\(b7db0c51-6276-4094-8bce-77a72bab0c92\).html](http://kclpure.kcl.ac.uk/portal/en/theses/the-role-of-art-and-artists-in-contesting-gentrification-in-london-and-new-york-city(b7db0c51-6276-4094-8bce-77a72bab0c92).html)



Art / Artists



Europe, United Kingdom, London, United States, New York City, Resistance, Gentrification Responses



CS

While artists have long been linked to gentrification, particularly as passive instigators, their agency in its resistance has yet to be thoroughly considered. This study sets out to correct the gap in urban studies literature through a series of in-depth interviews with arts practitioners based in London and New York City. In the description of artists' intentions and interventions, the author reassesses current ideas of the artist's relation to gentrification.

To overview the causes of gentrification, the author references stage models, and other theories that chart the evolution of urban neighbourhood change. The study acknowledges artists are involuntarily tied to the onset of gentrification. Artists are also victimised by these activities. Against this context, the author moves through a systematic discussion of various grassroots resistance efforts that artists have engaged in. These efforts range from those that simply enable artists to survive or mitigate the effects of gentrification to those that overtly and at times politically contest its fundamental policies and mechanisms. Along the way a number of artworks are examined, including several documentaries used to illustrate a case study of artists who cross over into anti-gentrification activism.



World Cities Culture Forum. (2017). *Making Space for Culture.*

<http://www.worldcitiescultureforum.com/news/how-can-cities-make-space-for-culture>



Art / Artists



Gentrification Responses, Workspaces, Venues, Global Cities, Toronto Artscape



CC

This report is by the World Cities Culture Forum, with advice from Tim Jones, Executive Director of Artscape. The World Cities Culture Forum has been working since 2015 to address the issue of artists being pushed out of cultural centres, and the loss of performance, exhibition, creation, production, and administrative cultural spaces. Artscape coined the term "creative placemaking" in 2006 and is a thriving non-profit developer of housing and workspaces for the arts in the Toronto region.

The report examines how to maintain and develop a dynamic mix of spaces and facilities for cultural production and consumption. Jones' portion of the report details the strategic direction for how to accomplish this goal. He acknowledges that world cities struggle to maintain their cultural amenities and affordable workspaces. He suggests that there is conflict in the need to attract investment while preserving and inventing new cultural

spaces. Cities, due to their power over land use, planning, and economic development, are described to be the tier of government best positioned to address this issue. The following are described to enable scaled solutions:

- Designing cultural facilities as a catalyst for local investment
- Utilizing arts and culture as the golden thread tying planning and economic development
- Contributing to the affordable housing and space movement
- Building knowledge, capacity, and leadership

To support the pursuit of these solutions, the World Cities Culture Forum proposes that it can create metrics to measure indicators, conduct research, create, and share toolkits to help cities and their partners develop and maintain cultural spaces.

Mapping



King, R. L. (2016, September 13). The hidden pockets in Toronto where gentrification is really happening. *The Toronto Star*. <https://www.thestar.com/news/gta/2016/09/13/the-hidden-pockets-in-toronto-where-gentrification-is-really-happening.html>



Mapping

Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Displacement, Gentrification, Income Polarization, Inequality, Mapping, Gentrification Ripples, Gentrification Roots, Gentrification Responses, Gentrification Theories, Housing



MP

This article uses a definition of gentrification to map out where gentrification has occurred in the City of Toronto. It uses a methodology that defines gentrified areas as those where the average household income increased from the bottom 40th percentile in the city to the top 60th percentile between 2006 and 2015. The most granular areas outlined at the Census level, called dissemination areas, are used in this analysis. It identifies 14 specific dissemination areas in Toronto (0.4% of the city) that were gentrified between 2006 and 2015. These areas are primarily located in Leslieville, Queen West (including the Queen West Triangle, where ArtsPond and Groundstory's founder reside), and The Junction. Under a different set of criteria, a larger portion of the City has gentrified. Between 2006 and 2015, 20.8% of the city, or 768 dissemination areas transitioned from an average household income in the bottom 40th percentile to an average income above the city-wide average. Some qualitative information into what gentrification looks like in Leslieville is provided to frame the data. It is a useful look at how data may be parsed to make gentrification visible.

Networking



Grounded Solutions Network. <https://groundedsolutions.org/>



Networking

United States, Research, Housing, Gentrification Responses



MP

Grounded Solutions Network connect experts with networks, knowledge, and support they need to understand and implement affordable housing solutions. Their mission is to cultivate affordable housing solutions that last generations in order to see that everyone has access to a home they can afford. This network was formed in 2016 after a merger of the National Community Land Trust Network and the Cornerstone Partnership. New and revised policies that result from their technical assistance between 2014 and 2018 will create thousands of new affordable units, generated \$320 million in housing trust fund dollars, and preserve and improve 20,000 units.



People United for Sustainable Housing. (2019). *PUSH Buffalo Annual Report 2018.*

<https://www.pushbuffalo.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/05/PUSH-AnnualReport2018.pdf>



Networking



United States, New York, Buffalo, Non-Profits, Gentrification Responses



CC

The 2018 Annual Report for PUSH (People United for Sustainable Housing) details the mission, actions, and funding that guide the organization. The organization's mission is to:

- Mobilize residents to create strong neighborhoods with quality, affordable housing
- Expand local hiring opportunities
- Advance economic and environmental justice in Buffalo.

To achieve this, PUSH applies actions in a variety of areas. This includes building and maintaining affordable housing, organizing door knocking, building coalitions, and advocating for affordable housing policies. The organization is funded by over 30 organizations, including foundations and government at local, state, and federal levels.

Artists were a part of the inception of PUSH. When it was just 3 members, artist, activist, and advocate Aminah Johnson collaborated with the first two founders to host community screenings. Movies watched covered Black Panthers and Martin Luther King Jr. so that people could see that, "when you show up in numbers, you get results."



P3

Ryerson City Building Institute. (2018, July 24). *Taxed Out.*

<https://www.citybuildinginstitute.ca/portfolio/taxed-out/>



Networking



Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Gentrification Responses, Workspaces



MP

Organized by the Ryerson City Building Institute, this resource is the online component to an exhibition of the same name in response to skyrocketed commercial property values and taxes in 2018. It contains several case studies, statistics, infographics, and photographs related to the impact of tax policy on main streets in Toronto.

It tells the story of independent and small businesses who are pushed out by skyrocketed property taxes tied to 2016 property reassessments and "highest and best use" methodologies used by the Municipal Property Assessment Corporation (MPAC) to determine tax rates. This practice has led to a 239% tax increase from 2016-2020 at one business, Le Select Bistro, at 432 Wellington St. W.

It briefly outlines the community organizing and resistance to these tax increases, and the municipal governments' response to implement a 10% per year tax cap on commercial properties. It also highlights the Creative Co-Location Tax Class established by Toronto City Council in 2017 that facilitated a 50% tax reduction for less than 20 properties of cultural hubs in the city. It positions Artscape as a "Golden Goose" that can play a significant role in neighbourhood regeneration while showing how Artscape properties are also susceptible to dramatic property tax increases. It is useful in that it provides a model for how research and arts can intersect and activate to create public awareness around an issue at the heart of gentrification in Toronto.



Whyte, M. (2017, February 3). Akin Collective buys artists space and time. *The Toronto Star*. <https://www.thestar.com/entertainment/visualarts/2017/02/03/akin-collective-buys-artists-space-and-time.html>



Networking

Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Placemaking, Policy, Gentrification Responses, Strategies, Meanwhile Leasing, Artists Housing, Workspaces



FC

This describes the conditions in which the Akin Collective was born and their experience with gentrification. The founding members of Akin identify two complimentary needs and deficits in the Toronto real estate market: lack of affordable studio space, and underutilized warehouses that are temporarily not ready for commercial redevelopment.

Akin now has 19,000 square feet across four buildings in Toronto and counts 160 members with a long list of demand. In a model they call meanwhile leasing, they take blocks of temporarily leasable space and rent them out to artists at affordable rates. This simultaneously creates community, activates the building, and increases property values.

This article explains how Akin provides artists a temporary landing spot while they search for something permanent. This is beneficial because many artists experience precarious employment and are vulnerable to unstable housing conditions. Akin collective is an example of the innovative models that are necessary in the rapidly gentrifying ecology of Toronto. Yet, the model itself does not guarantee artists permanent housing or working space.

Policy Change



Beattie, S. (2018, February 12). Toronto council backs 50 per cent property tax reduction for culture hubs. *The Toronto Star*. https://www.thestar.com/news/city_hall/2018/02/12/toronto-council-backs-50-per-cent-property-tax-reduction-for-culture-hubs.html



Policy Change

Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Arts Hub, Artscape, Cultural Policy, Property Tax, Public Policy, Tax Policy, Workspaces



MP

This article follows-up on earlier proposals to create a special tax class for properties housing a number of arts organizations in Toronto. It reports on a successful motion to offer "creative co-location facilities" a 50 per cent property tax reduction as significant increases in property assessments threaten to displace arts organizations.

To qualify for the new class, "buildings must have tenants that produce cultural goods and services, charge tenants below market rent, and have a minimum rentable space of 10,000 square feet, 5,000 square feet if owned by the city, or house more than 40 separate tenants, among other requirements."

This article illuminates one way Toronto legislators responded to the effects that gentrification can have in the arts sector. Regrettably, the tax class will apply to less than 20 properties.



Centre for Neighbourhood and Community Improvement. (2015). Gentrification & Neighbourhood Change: Helpful Tools for Communities. *University of Chicago.*

<https://voorheescenter.red.uic.edu/wp-content/uploads/sites/122/2017/10/Gentrification-and-Neighborhood-Change-Toolkit.pdf>



Policy Change



United States, Community Benefit Agreements, Community Land Trusts, Gentrification Stages, Inclusionary Zoning, NIMBY, Toolkits, Housing, Gentrification Responses



CC

The University of Chicago's College of Urban Planning and Public Affairs produced this toolkit as a resource to anyone interested in addressing or preventing gentrification. The toolkit describes gentrification as a process in which low-income households are displaced by the rise of housing costs. The rise is set on by higher income households who move into a neighbourhood. The toolkit organizes gentrification into three key stages: before gentrification, mid stage gentrification, and late stage gentrification. Each stage has a unique set of indicators and requires unique responses to address the immediate context of gentrification. Mid-stage gentrification builds on the activities of early stage gentrification, and late stage gentrification does the same with mid stage gentrification. The responses cover a wide variety of actions which are described in brief detail and complemented with a list of opportunities and challenges. Actions highlighted by the resource include:

Before gentrification

- Coalition building
- Right to purchase
- Community land trusts
- Inclusionary zoning
- Limited equity co-op housing
- Community benefits agreements

Late stage gentrification

- Employer assisted housing
- Affordable housing trust funds
- Housing levies
- Dealing with NIMBYism.

Mid stage gentrification

- Strengthened rental protections
- Tax abatement policies
- Protections against condominium conversion
- Rehabilitation and preservation



U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development, Office of Policy Development and Research. (2016). *Ensuring Equitable Neighborhood Change: Gentrification Pressures on Housing Affordability (Insights into Housing and Community Development Policy).*

<https://www.huduser.gov/portal/sites/default/files/pdf/Insights-Ensuring-Equitable-Growth.pdf>



Policy Change



United States, Community Building, Displacement, Gentrification, Neighbourhood Change, Tools, Housing



FC

Commissioned by the US Department of Housing and Development, this report examines the causes and consequences of gentrification and outlines policy responses.

While there is no arts focus, it is useful to see a government document recognize the problem of gentrification at a national scale and utilize data to examine its roots and ripples. The report includes a review of recent research on the causes and consequences of gentrification and identifies key steps that policy makers can take to foster neighbourhood change.

First, it describes the causes and explores urban revitalization that began in the 1970s, and then summarizes recent research on the positive and negative consequences of gentrification. Negative consequences includes displacement, poverty concentration, and poor neighbourhood conditions.

Finally, it proposes a suit of policy tools that fit into four categories: preservation of affordable housing, more housing development (not limited to affordable), engagement with current community residents, and regional rather than local strategies. The report suggests that communities harness the benefits of gentrification to address concentrated poverty, which is one of the biggest “urban challenges” the nation currently faces. Although the report argues for meaningful integration across socioeconomic and racial lines, ultimately, it is not very critical of the real estate industry and offers narrow solutions. For instance, it does not discuss the financialization of housing, which will not be solved with more supply.

Protesting, Advocating



Braganza, C. (2018, April 5). Why opponents of gentrification have taken to the streets of Hamilton.

TVO. <https://www.tvo.org/article/current-affairs/why-opponents-of-gentrification-have-taken-to-the-streets-of-hamilton>

Protesting / Advocating

 Canada, Ontario, Hamilton, Anti-Gentrification, Gentrification Responses, Protesting

 MP

Why have some protestors fighting gentrification in Hamilton vandalized cars and businesses on Locke Street? Their vandalization caused an estimated \$100,000 in damages. This article considers the motivations of protestors who practice more extreme forms of demonstration.

It finds that individuals who claim to have taken part posted anonymously to anarchist discussion blogs. In these posts, individuals voiced their deep frustrations with economic inequalities. Frustrations include increasingly higher rents for “ever shittier apartments,” increasingly exploitative work conditions, and business associations lobbying for more policing. “The rich make our lives worse...Every day we have to deal with their attacks on us, but every once in a while, we can find a way to strike back,” the anonymous poster writes.

Locke Street represents one of the most visible manifestations of gentrification in Hamilton. The author finds the local economy is fueled by “economic refugees” priced-out of the real estate market in Toronto. Those being displaced from Toronto to Hamilton contribute to the gentrification of Hamilton by increasing competition for housing. This gentrification has displaced many to nearby Brantford or St. Catharines.

One example shows how renovictions at one Hamilton property displaced several long-time tenants who struggle to find comparable housing elsewhere, and in some cases, turn to family when no affordable alternatives can be found. Retailers and car owners targeted by these more extreme forms of protest claim to understand concerns surrounding gentrification but believe that the methods of protest are not conducive to potentially effective conversation.

This article shows some of the roots and ripples of gentrification in Hamilton and illuminates how significant frustrations with growing inequality are manifesting.



Jaeger, A. (2017, May 2). A Space for Us: Resisting gentrification and artist displacement. *Electric City Magazine*. <http://www.electriccitymagazine.ca/2017/05/a-space-for-us/>

Protesting / Advocating

 Canada, Ontario, Peterborough, Displacement, Gentrification, Redevelopment, Artist Housing, Workspaces, Venues



This article sounds the alarm surrounding gentrification and how it can negatively affect the arts community in Peterborough, Ontario. The increase of real estate prices in the Toronto, Peterborough, and Vancouver regions threatens heritage and cultural spaces, while politicians fail to effectively manage development.

With a significant backlog of recommended heritage buildings, the author suggests that many developers and landlords may demolish culturally significant properties, some housing artists, in favour of unaffordable housing before their heritage status can be secured. While artists play a significant role in erasing the "stigma of ghettoization" of particular neighbourhoods initially offering cheap rent and large spaces, their economic precarity makes them susceptible when gentrification moves in. Gentrification gives rise to a monoculture by pushing artists and arts spaces away.

The article does not give any strategies artists themselves may employ to resist gentrification or the displacement of artists. Rather, the author makes several suggestions that can be implemented by governments, including utilizing the Municipal Cultural Plan to manage development, and establishing bylaws and special tax zones that can promote and preserve artists' spaces. The author does advocate for the value of the arts, and argues that arts spaces, like a dedicated arts building, should be seen as assets to the city.



Opillard, F. (2015). Resisting the Politics of Displacement in the San Francisco Bay Area: Anti-gentrification Activism in the Tech Boom 2.0. *European Journal of American Studies*, 10(3). <https://doi.org/10.4000/ejas.11322>

Protesting / Advocating

 United States, California, San Francisco, Anti-Gentrification, Gentrification, Mapping, Organizing, Protesting, Gentrification Responses



This article is based on ethnographic work undertaken in the Tenants Movement in San Francisco during 2014. The article focuses on two of the activist collectives fighting gentrification spurred by the "tech boom 2.0." It outlines practical ways organizers from Eviction Free San Francisco (EFSF) and the Anti-Eviction Mapping Project (AMP) influenced city politics and public discourse.

These groups organized direct actions like protests, rallies, and public denunciations of "greedy" landlords and speculators. They also conducted tech activism through mapping projects, investigations, and an Oral History Project which contains the stories of evicted tenants.

The author explores some of the roots of gentrification in San Francisco, starting from the dot-com boom of the late '90s, to the election of pro-business, free market advocates for Mayor and pro-tech policies from the Board

of Supervisors, and the unprecedented influx of capital. Some tools of gentrification are outlined. These tools include the Ellis Act, a sharp increase in buyouts, and condo-conversion processes.

This article provides a valuable look into activist organizations that find success in one geographical area most affected by gentrification, as well as the ways in which gentrification may be sparked.



Taylor, N. (2019, January 16). Evans Contemporary: Arts, Commerce, and the Downtown Core. *Arthur Newspaper*. <http://www.trentarthur.ca/evans-contemporary-arts-commerce-downtown-core/>

Protesting / Advocating

 Canada, Ontario, Peterborough, Anti-gentrification, Arts, Galleries, Gentrification, Venues

 **MP**

This article reports on a significant recognition that artists can play a role in gentrification from owners of galleries Evans Contemporary, Star X, Coeur Neouveau, and organizers of the First Friday Art Crawl in Peterborough. It explains that Paolo Fortin, Director of Evans Contemporary, posted a statement on their website to announce that the gallery was set to close after the building they were housed in was purchased by a real estate developer, and that the Ad Hoc Arts Committee will neither organize nor present the First Friday Art Crawl.

This decision is presented as a political one, a direct response to an ethical dilemma brought upon by increasingly apparent efforts to exploit art for commercial purposes and the recognition that the First Friday Art Crawl contributed to gentrification in the city. The statement urges patrons of the gallery to contact their representatives and voice their concern over gallery closures and the gentrification of Peterborough. The article includes local artist Karol Orzechowski's perspective, who suggests, "It's really important for artists to think about where their money is coming from and what that relationship implies."


Several recommendations for how artists might fight gentrification are made: "But the most important thing we need to do as a community, is support local artists, their autonomy, and spaces that exist to benefit them – while they're still here."



The Public Studio (n.d.). *Art, Design & Gentrification: A Primer*.

<https://thepublicstudio.ca/resources/do-it-yourself-series>

Protesting / Advocating

 Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Arts, Case Studies, Decolonization, Gentrification, Gentrification Responses, Strategies, Housing, Rental, Zine

 **FC**

Art, Design and Gentrification is a zine published by The Public, an activist design studio in Toronto's Parkdale neighbourhood specializing in changing the world. The zine is divided into three sections: an introduction to gentrification and the role of artists and designers in processes of gentrification, some examples of artful resistance to gentrification, and a toolkit with short-to long-term strategies for artists and designers to become "active members of communities organizing against gentrification."

This zine argues for a decolonial, abolitionist, and intersectional approach to both understanding and responding to gentrification. It discusses the economic processes that drive gentrification. These processes include speculation, global investment in property, and rent gaps.

Following this, the zine discusses the role of artists, and the question of how art spaces reconcile their potential symbol of gentrification. The next section addresses histories of resistance across North America / Turtle Island. In this, several initiatives and coalitions are mentioned. They include Boyle Heights (Oakland, California), Chinatown (New York City), Indigenous inner cities across Turtle Island, and Parkdale in Toronto. The zine concludes this section with ten critical tips for artists by artists for acting ethically in the City. Tips include learning the history of a neighbourhood from the people and organizations who were and are a living breathing part of it and respect the history by acting upon its many lessons.

The zine also provides a toolkit for artists and designers that offers frameworks for the development of practices and policies that honour and respect existing communities.

This resource is extremely valuable for the purpose of Groundstory. It covers roots, ripples, and responses to gentrification through an intersectional lens, and has a strong arts and culture focus that is rooted in Toronto. It is easy to read and understand, and is equally focused on policy responses and community solutions as it is on the outline of the problems. Artists are not "blamed" for gentrification, but rather called on to show more accountability to the communities they work within

Protesting, Advocating (2SLGBTQ+)



Neigh, S. (2016, February 3). Queers against gentrification. *Rabble.ca*

<http://rabble.ca/podcasts/shows/talking-radical-radio/2016/02/queers-against-gentrification>



Protesting / Advocating (2SLGBTQ+)

📍 Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Moss Park, Anti-Gentrification, Queer Communities, Gentrification Responses, Gentrification Ripples



The podcast Talking Radical Radio features two members of the Queer Trans Community Defence, Helen Lenskyj and Liisa Schofield. Lenskyj and Schofield speak about their work to oppose the LGBTQ-focused sports and recreation centre proposed for Moss Park in Toronto's Downtown East. This is one of the poorest neighbourhoods in Canada.

The activists voice their concerns about the project using the term "inclusivity" as a gateway for gentrification. They share concerns about the motivations of the anonymous donor financing up to a third of the +\$100 million project, and note that the rhetoric being used to sell the project positions the poor, homeless, and drug-involved residents of the neighbourhood as the "other,". This is contextualized within a rapidly changing Moss Park where new developments encroach on key services and resources used by poorer neighbourhood residents.



Powell-Twagirumukiza, N. (2017, May 16). *Here's How Queer and Trans People of Color Are Resisting Gentrification and Displacement.* <https://www.autostraddle.com/queering-the-land-how-queer-and-trans-people-of-color-are-resisting-gentrification-and-displacement-379320/>



Protesting / Advocating (2SLGBTQ+)

📍 United States, Washington, Seattle, Anti-Gentrification, Displacement, Gentrification, Queer Communities, Resistance, Resources, Gentrification Responses, Tools, Housing



This article looks at anti-gentrification efforts of queer and trans people of colour in the Seattle area. These efforts primarily aim to reclaim land and space. Efforts range from the purchase of entire buildings to the purchase of small plots of land for community gardens. Organizations include Queer the Land, Sustaining Ourselves Locally, Afrikatown Community Garden, Qilombo, and Displacement Stops Here. One particularly telling example is of a group of tenants who organized, raised funds, and partnered with the Oakland Community Land Trust to purchase their building after their landlord informed them it would be going to market.

The author identifies several contributing factors of gentrification in the Bay Area. These factors include: increasingly higher housing costs, an influx of high-income tech professionals, and institutional racism. The article describes that anti-gentrification organizing takes a toll on the mental and physical health of activists. The author concludes that privileged individuals who drive gentrification by commodifying housing need to learn empathy for the communities on the margins who are devastated by the process.



Pothier, M. (n.d.). Queers in the hood: How LGBTQ2SI+ folks can stand up to gentrification in Hamilton neighbourhoods. Retrieved 30 April 2019, from *BentQ.ca* (Google Web Cache).

<http://bentq.ca/queers-in-the-hood-how-lgbtq2si-folks-can-stand-up-to-gentrification-in-hamilton-neighbourhoods/>

via web.archive.org: <http://web.archive.org/web/20190502213638/http://bentq.ca/queers-in-the-hood-how-lgbtq2si-folks-can-stand-up-to-gentrification-in-hamilton-neighbourhoods/>



Protesting / Advocating (2SLGBTQ+)



Canada, Ontario, Hamilton, Anti-Gentrification, Queer Communities, Gentrification Responses, Gentrification Ripples, Tenants



MP

This article shares practical ways for 2SLGBTQI+ folks to resist gentrification in Hamilton neighbourhoods. This list includes ways to organize and engage politically, support organizations already working to fight displacement, recognize one's own role in gentrification, and acknowledge the relationship gentrification has to colonization in Canada.

The author identifies that queer and trans folks may be implicated as "leaders" in gentrification because they are often attracted to the sense of community and affordability present in downtown neighbourhoods that are prone to gentrification. Existing organizations that remain active today, like the Hamilton Tenant Solidarity Network, are included as one way queer and trans folk may support anti-displacement efforts. While no one singular effort is deemed most necessary, nearly all readers may find something in the author's suggestions that they may participate in.

Eight practical strategies to resist gentrification shared in this article include:

- Support tenant rights
- Know the history of your neighbourhood
- Recognize that people of colour are disproportionately affected by gentrification
- Acknowledge the relationship to colonization
- Support the efforts of queer and trans housing advocates (such as Cole Gately's work with Core Collaborative Learning)
- Watch use of language about spaces and people (such as words like dead or barren which are harmful)
- Be wary of the branding/marketing of neighbourhoods
- Direct energy and financial support towards organizations and social services that support marginalized people prone to displacement.



Chapple, K. (2016). Forewarned: The Use of Neighborhood Early Warning Systems for Gentrification and Displacement. *Cityscape: A Journal of Policy and Development Research*.

<https://www.huduser.gov/portal/periodicals/cityscpe/vol18num3/article5.html>



Predicting



Data, Mapping, Smart City, Gentrification Roots, Gentrification Ripples, Gentrification Responses



CC

This academic article describes the use of data to identify the roots, ripples, and responses to gentrification. Since the 1990s, there has been a wide adoption of these tools by cities and colleges to identify where gentrification is anticipated and where it has occurred. The article lists ten root variables related to gentrification. The list includes shift in tenure, increase in down payment, increase in high-income serving amenities (such as coffee shops or galleries), historic architecture and others. It also lists three predictors of vulnerability to be displaced: tenure, number of employed people per household, and occupation.

The maps produced to anticipate gentrification are imperfect. These resources are moderately accurate at predicting where gentrification will happen, but they produce an extremely high volume of false positives where gentrification is predicted but does not occur. The article describes that deeper data is required to produce better predictions. Methods to achieve this include crowd sourcing and smart cities infrastructures. The Smart City movement, perhaps the most efficient method, lacks the direction to pursue equitable outcomes and incorporate input from community organizations.



T2

Sturtevant, L. (2016, July 7). Can We Predict Gentrification? *Helping Hands Blog: Housing Association of Nonprofit Developers*. <https://www.handhousing.org/can-we-predict-gentrification/>



Predicting



United States, California, Predicting, Mapping, Gentrification Roots, Gentrification Ripples, Gentrification Responses



NI

This article considers whether researchers can predict if a neighbourhood is at risk of gentrifying. Gentrifying neighbourhoods are commonly identified through the use of Census Data to map where household incomes have risen, home values have increased, and where residents have gone to college. While this data best illustrates historic trends, the article suggests there are ways it can successfully predict future changes along with crime rates and social media.

Researchers at the Center for Community innovation at the University of California at Berkeley also examined at the relationship between transit investment and neighbourhood change. Mapped against actual data from 2010, they used data from 1990 to 200 to develop an index to successfully predict a neighborhood's susceptibility for future gentrification a decade later.

While gentrification has many negative impacts, some positives highlighted in this article include increased business investment, crime reduction, and improvements in test scores. Factors that have been shown to influence gentrification:

- Availability of public space and public transit
- Income diversity

- Places where renter (but not owner) burden is high
- Places where there are more non-family households.



Zuk, M., & Chapple, K. (2015). Case Studies on Gentrification and Displacement in the San Francisco Bay Area. *Centre for Community Innovation, University of California.*

https://www.urbandisplacement.org/sites/default/files/anti-displacement_full_report_11.15.pdf



Predicting

United States, California, San Francisco, Gentrification, Neighbourhood Change, Displacement, Predicting, Gentrification Ripples, Gentrification Responses



FC

This analysis of nine communities in the San Francisco Bay Area explores how to better understand, predict, and prevent residential displacement. The wider Bay Area experiences socio-spatial transformations that provide useful material for better understanding and modeling gentrification and displacement. The report groups the nine communities into three categories:

- Places that have been undergoing pressures of gentrification and displacement for many years and have potentially limited the magnitude due to years of strong community organizing, tenant protections, and zoning restrictions
- Places that are undergoing active redevelopment and or speculation
- Places that have anticipated gentrification and displacement for a while due to their proximity to affluence neighbourhoods but may not be experiencing it because of large supply of public housing or weaker housing markets.

The report illustrates the importance of community-engaged research and points to the need to define gentrification and displacement more accurately as a long-term regional process that involves both investment and disinvestment. It stresses the importance of regional analysis and the recognition of neighbourhood variability. This is preferred over taking a blanket approach to the assessment of diverse communities.

Lastly, the report points out five factors that mitigate the negative effects of gentrification. These factors are based on extensive research. Factors include weak housing markets, large and stable subsidized housing stock, strong community organizing, tenant protections, and restrictive zoning.

Building



Argyle Public Relationships. (2018, September 6). Parkdale Community Hub: Preliminary Feedback, Insights & Directions. *Parkdalehub.ca.* <https://parkdalehub.ca/wp-content/uploads/2018/09/preliminary.pdf>



Building

Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Parkdale, Community Benefits, Community Building, Community Engagement, Urban Development, Artist Housing, Workspaces



MP

This report summarizes feedback collected during preliminary stakeholder and community meetings held between January and June 2018. These meetings aimed to uncover what Parkdale residents, community organizations, and local City agencies desire for a future community hub proposed in Parkdale.

This opportunity is founded on existing plans to merge an existing public library, community centre, and arts and culture centre. It recognized that gentrification is a challenge in Parkdale, and that many hope the hub can provide space for agencies and community organizations currently without space or at risk of losing what now exists.

The report includes suggestions from arts organizations and artists who currently live and work at the site. Their suggestions are that the development support collaboration, and capacity-building with flexibility to support several different art forms, and that it be designed with artists and their unique needs in mind. There are many additional visions for what the hub can be.

One major challenge identified is the management of the expectation to grow and retain existing services. Such management is key to avoid community opposition. There is also concern from the community that the new development could accelerate gentrification in the area. Ultimately, it provides a valuable look into how the planning of a public facility that provides space for artists, community members, and community organizations can unfurl.



Barmak, S. (2010, November 20). The art of the (condo) deal. *The Toronto Star*.

https://www.thestar.com/amp/entertainment/2010/11/20/the_art_of_the_condo_deal.html



Building



Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Artist Communities, Artists Housing, Workspaces



MP

This article reports on the perspectives of some of the first residents of the Artscape Triangle Lofts. This is a building consisting of 68 units designated for artists and those working in the arts. The article provides a useful history of the development process.

The Triangle Lofts are Artscape's first condominium development and was, at the time, the only condo development in the city to offer dedicated affordable units to artists. Prospective residents could put as little as 5% down and obtain a 25% second mortgage from Artscape to be repaid only when they decide to sell.

Built by Urbancorp (which has since gone under bankruptcy proceedings), the Artscape Triangle Lofts allowed the developers to pacify community and city concerns that artists' space previously existing on the site would be lost along with the area's character. Artscape's President & CEO said, "We see (the project) as an antidote to the age-old problem of displacement of artists through gentrification".



CBC Radio (2019, July 11). What do we lose when spaces for artists disappear? Rosina Kazi tells us what it means for our communities. In *Q with Tom Power*. <https://www.cbc.ca/radio/q/thursday-july-11-2019-the-strumbellas-peter-frampton-and-more-1.5206778/what-do-we-lose-when-spaces-for-artists-disappear-rosina-kazi-tells-us-what-it-means-for-our-communities-1.5206823>



Building



Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Sterling Road, Artist Communities, Displacement, 2SLGBTQ+, Queer, Venues, Gentrification Ripples, Gentrification Responses



FC

In this article, musician/organizer Rosina Kazi describes the urgency of disappearing arts spaces in Toronto, particularly those that are accessible and safe for LGBTQ artists of colour. She states that artist spaces are often overlooked as cities gentrify. In response, Kazi co-created Unit 2, a shared live/workspace for concerts,

workshops, events, and practicing. She describes it as a hub for musicians and artists where they can be themselves.

Kazi discusses the need for local and city government to get involved in the displacement that is occurring and explains how, in Europe, the government plays a more supportive role. She argues that developers need to be pressured into providing affordable spaces, and they need to meet the needs of artists. For instance, she explains that there is a lack of soundproof spaces throughout Toronto and discusses what is at stake when gentrification displaces artists, and how we are at risk of losing an entire community. She concludes that art can be a ground for organizing and igniting hope in the face of hopelessness.

UNIT 2 is a LGBTQ2S/BIPOC radical arts and community space dedicated to building community and building bridges. It is a DIT (Do it Together) space tucked away on a quiet street just west of downtown Toronto's Sterling Road. It is a neighbourhood known for its bustling arts scene, industrial buildings converted into studios, affordable performance spaces and mom and pop shops. Over the last few years, big companies have moved in, rent prices have risen. As a result, artists that have lived and worked on the street for years are being forced to move. Rosina Kazi has lived on Sterling Road for more than a decade and she has been watching these changes happen in real time.



Flaxman, K. (2017). Garage becomes a working art studio. *The Toronto Star*.

<https://www.thestar.com/life/homes/2017/05/27/garage-becomes-a-working-art-studio.html>



Building



Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Artist Housing, Workspaces, Venues, Gentrification Responses



CC

This article describes the experience of an artist couple who converted their garage into a studio and exhibit space. Their home is located in Toronto's Keele and Eglinton area. It is an example of how artists' accommodations impact the lives of artists, and how artists can modify their housing to meet their needs. The couple met while living separately at the Dundas West Arts building and then moved in together to the Artscape Wychwood Barns' artists' accommodations. Improvements to their garage include ventilation, insulation, and heating. They put in sweat equity to lower costs and did not hire additional labour. As a result, this renovation cost them \$5,000. The artists are a glass blower and painter. They also hold exhibits and art classes in their garage.



Gehl, J. (2010). *Cities for People*. Island Press; First Edition.



Building



Sustainable Development, Urban Design, Urban Development, Urban Planning, Urbanization, Walkability, Public Space, Gentrification Responses



CC

This book describes the characteristics needed to facilitate vibrant public spaces. It is written by Jan Gehl, an internationally regarded architect and urban designer known for his work's impact of shaping pedestrian and cyclist friendly streets in Copenhagen. In the book, Gehl describes the role of scale, edges, facades, and diversity of uses. These components attract activity from pedestrians and can encourage them to linger longer in public space.

For example, a street with many smaller storefronts, public seating, and a busker will be more attractive to stay in longer than a street with large store fronts, no public seating, and no public performer. Gehl describes the use of public space as democratic. There are benefits of people seeing each other sharing the same space. The book concludes with a toolkit on how to build vibrant urban spaces.



Hayes, D. (2016, December 8). Inside Regent Park: Toronto's test case for public-private gentrification. *The Guardian*. <https://www.theguardian.com/cities/2016/dec/08/inside-regent-park-torontos-test-case-for-public-private-gentrification>



Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Regent park, Revitalization, Gentrification Responses



This article looks at the Regent Park redevelopment in Toronto — what it calls a "test case for public-private gentrification." A historic overview of the neighbourhood includes factors that made redevelopment seem necessary, and some of the benefits and challenges involved in this case. In reference to Regent Park prior to redevelopment, Mitchell Cohen suggests that "A community of nothing but social housing is not normal,". Mitchel Cohen is the president of Daniel's Corporation, the developer redeveloping Regent Park.

Martine August, an urban planner, and post-doctoral fellow at Rutgers University, is critical of this notion. They note that scholarly literature remains inconclusive on the benefits of "socially mixed" redevelopments on low-income tenants. They argue that adding richer residents to the area actually destabilizes political organizing efforts that community housing tenants are involved in. This is because wealthier residents with more political clout and social power take up space by engaging in neighbourhood associations.



Johnson, L., & Johnson, R. (2017). *Regent Park Redux: Reinventing Public Housing in Canada* (First edition). New York, NY: Routledge.



Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Regent Park. Displacement, Gentrification Responses, Urban planning



Regent Park Redux takes an in-depth look at the redevelopment of Regent Park in Toronto by reviewing the neighbourhood's history, the planning and design process, and the resettlement of the first cohort of displaced residents.

It evaluates the redevelopment process from the perspective of this first cohort. As part of this evaluation, the resource draws from interviews with 52 households. It critically examines and evaluates the consultation process, the effectiveness of the Right to Return, the temporary displacement of Regent Park residents and their ultimate resettlement, and shares on-the-ground experiences from the redeveloped community.

Several points of stress, frustration, and friction are highlighted and unpacked. Daniels Spectrum, an arts and culture centre built as part of the redevelopment, is generally looked upon favourably. However, the authors note that particular activities in the facility are priced beyond the means of returning low-income social housing tenants, and one resident questions how community-friendly the centre actually is as corporate events become more numerous.

The authors briefly question the effectiveness of social/tenure mix rationale in public-private partnerships and present a quick literature review on the topic. This rationale proposes that an economically mixed neighbourhood (market and rent-geared-to-income homes) possess certain advantages that an income-segregated public housing community does not. Advantages include wider social networks, better community services and amenities, and safer streets.

Critics of social/tenure mix rationale argue that the true goal of this kind of redevelopment is gentrification. These critics suggest that the government's partnership with the private sector makes all parties agents of gentrification which displaces low-income residents. Results from other North American cities where income-mix has been introduced shows that relatively little social interaction among higher and lower-income neighbour actually occurs. Other studies also find that social costs emerge over the course of several decades.

While this book does not contain sustained discussions of gentrification, it does offer key lessons that planners and/or public housing practitioners could glean from this important example of social housing redevelopment.



Lorinc, J. (2015, July 24). Rising rents, noise, and health issues: Is Artscape failing its tenants who seek affordable live-work studios? *The Globe and Mail*. <https://www.theglobeandmail.com/news/toronto/rising-rents-noise-and-health-issues-is-artscape-failing-its-tenants-who-seek-affordable-live-work-studios/article25672400/>



Building



Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Artscape, Artist Housing, Housing, Workspaces, Gentrification Responses



FC

This article asks whether Toronto Artscape remain committed to its role as a landlord as it continues to grow. The author uses Artscape's Wychwood Barns to shed light on a variety of issues that tenants and artists face. Examples include property tax hikes and increased rents, there is high lead content in the paint, and excessive noise complaints.

The article describes the acceleration of Artscape in the last decade. Artscape's events income has grown tenfold since 2004, to \$1.5 million annually, and the corporation's assets are valued at \$44 million, with several projects currently in the pipeline. The article identifies the critical issue that Artscape's focus on expanding their portfolio has compromised their ability as a landlord.

While the author does not criticize Artscape's model, they identify the detriments of rapid expansion without the stabilization of existing projects, they highlight the quality of life concerns among several tenants, and argue Artscape should not be the only entity delivering affordable, subsidized housing and workspaces for the arts.



Nickle, D. (2019, June 11). Artscape Weston Common brings artists to the community through housing. *Toronto.com*. <https://www.toronto.com/news-story/9424763-artscape-weston-common-brings-artists-to-the-community-through-housing/>



Building



Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Weston, Artscape, Artist Housing, Workspaces, Gentrification Responses



FC

This article provides a brief description of Artscape Weston Common. This development is Artscape's first property outside of downtown Toronto. The article follows one artist, Jasmyn Fyffe, who is now able to rent a two-storey unit, with two bedrooms as well as a studio space for just \$1,100 per month. The article explains that the Weston neighbourhood has a very low percentage of working artists, compared to other neighbourhoods in Toronto, which this development could help to address.

Tim Jones, CEO of Artscape, suggests that a robust network of artists improves a neighbourhood. He also states that urban affordability is the biggest threat to culture. He suggests that artists move to Weston instead of Hamilton. He views that the development of new housing is a way to increase the number of artists living in a neighbourhood. Weston Common had many supporters, including the City councillor, Frances Nunziata. Nunziata overcame some initial opposition to the development at community consultations. The article quotes the councillor who states that this development will create a draw to the community that has often been a forgotten corner of Toronto. The hub features performance and meeting space, in addition to residences. An open-air plaza connects the building to the Union-Pearson Go line. The Weston Common is home base to two arts organizations, Shakespeare in Action and UrbanArts, who both provide programming at the space. The article concludes with a quote from Jasmyn Fyffe, who recognizes that the neighbourhood has experienced trauma, and requires healing, which she hopes to support through arts-based programming.



NYU Furman Center. (2016). *Gentrification Response: A Survey of Strategies to Maintain Neighbourhood Economic Diversity.* http://furmancenter.org/files/NYUFurmanCenter_GentrificationResponse_26OCT2016.pdf



Building



United States, New York, Toolkit



FC

The NYU Furman Centre is a joint center seeking to advance research and debate on housing, neighbourhoods, and urban policy. This report provides several policy responses to protect low-income households and economic diversity of neighbourhoods in the face of soaring housing costs. Although new supply is necessary, it is not enough to protect lower income households. The tools and policies are grouped based on their ability to achieve two goals: build more affordable housing, and protect low-income households at risk of, or facing, displacement. The effectiveness of each tool is not measured, and the authors argue that local context is critical. As a U.S. based article, some tools need to be translated. For instance, "Linkage fees" is the equivalent of Ontario's Section 37. This resource could be paired well with other sources that survey US cities, particularly those that address the roots and ripples. It could also be supplemented with articles and reports on creative placemaking that attempt to apply an art and community development lens to the housing affordability crisis.



Project Row Houses. (n.d.). <https://projectrowhouses.org>



Building



United States, Texas, Houston, Artist Communities, Preservation, Workspaces, Gentrification Responses



MP

Project Row Houses was created in 1993 in Houston, Texas's Historic Third Ward. The Project began in the historic African American neighbourhood with a series of abandoned shotgun houses. Shotgun houses are a type of low-income housing often built in the American South in the late 1800s and early 1900s to house freed slaves. Founder Rick Lowe and a coalition of artists purchased the derelict houses, and hundreds of volunteers

helped to clean and renovate them. The Project has since grown to cover six blocks and include low income rental housing, free housing for single mothers, public art programs, workshops, and summer programs for youth. A group of row houses have also been converted to studios and blank canvases for art installations with gallery-like interiors. The Project protects the historic value of the neighbourhood and provides important space for artists and community members to work, learn, live, and connect.



Rayner, B. (2017, June 12). Affordable-housing project in Regent Park envisioned just for musicians. *The Toronto Star*. <https://www.thestar.com/entertainment/music/2017/06/12/affordable-housing-project-in-regent-park-envisioned-just-for-musicians.html>



Building



Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Regent Park, Co-op Housing, Music, Housing, Gentrification Responses



MP

This article reports on early plans (since abandoned) to erect a "Toronto Music City" in the Regent Park revitalization. Such a plan would provide 100 units of affordable housing to musicians. The proposal is led by entertainment lawyer Andreas Kalogiannides and Mitchel Cohen, the CEO of Daniels Corp.

Kalogiannides and Cohen are guided by a steering committee made up of members from the local music industry as well as representatives from community groups working in Regent Park. Strict guidelines govern who would be allowed to live in the building. The guidelines include measurements of financial need and artistic production.

The article highlights some of the factors pushing artists out of downtown Toronto. Factors include high costs of living driven by high costs of rent and housing. It also points to the significant barriers this proposal faces. Councillor Josh Colle supports the plan but questions its fate: "The number keeps growing every day, but there are around 90,000 people on the waiting list for affordable housing right now in this city. The need is so great, to say that artists or musicians somehow get to the top of that list when some people have been waiting a decade, that's a really tricky proposition."

This resource provides an example of how some artists organize to tackle the displacement and lack of affordable housing brought by gentrification in Toronto. It also introduces necessary and difficult questions about who gets priority access to affordable housing.



Toronto Artscape (2017). *Artscape 5.0: Strategic Plan 2018-2022*. <https://www.artscape.ca/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/Artscape-Strategic-Plan-2018-to-2022.pdf>



Building



Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Artscape, Placemaking, Gentrification Response, Strategy, Artist Housing, Workspaces



FC

The strategic plan first describes the evolution of Artscape, from an affordable studio provider in the 1990s to a community developer beginning in 2000. This transition is described in their statement, "striving to provide a broader set of enabling conditions including a platform for collaboration, proximity to services and amenities, connection to local communities and access to markets."

Artscape 5.0 was developed to respond to the challenges that artists experience. Challenges include precarious employment, digital disruption, and a growing affordability crisis. The new plan still emphasizes “creative placemaking” as a process that leverages the value that artists bring to urban and community development. The strategy also emphasizes the necessity of supporting individual artists.

For instance, the new plan has several new elements such as the Thriving Artist initiative, Artscape Daniels Launchpad, Revenue-generation opportunities, connecting Artscape Communities, and The Artscape Community Card. These elements aim to support artists to become empowered, connected, and prosperous.

The practice of creative placemaking has been critiqued for its prioritization of economic benefits of arts and culture over the artists themselves. It is not clear from this plan if Artscape acknowledges this concern. The strategy is a comprehensive plan that describes the next stage of Artscape projects, and how they will respond to the current challenges faced by artists and the wider population. The expansion of Artscape points to their rapid growth and increased scope. Rather than incubating alternative models of affordable housing for artists, Artscape continues to dominate the field.



Warren, M. (2015, December 8). Affordable housing for artists aims to keep them in Toronto.

The Toronto Star. <https://www.thestar.com/news/gta/2015/12/08/affordable-housing-for-artists-aims-to-keep-them-in-toronto.html>



Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Artist Community, Artist Housing, Artscape, Housing, Artist Roles, Policy, Workspaces, Gentrification Responses



This article profiles a jewelry designer living in an Artscape Triangle loft, who pays \$800 a month for rent. This amount is affordable based on Canadian Mortgage and Housing standards of 30% of income on rent. The author describes the Artscape model, its five locations across the city, and its growing importance as an organization considering the affordability crisis in Toronto. It outlines the few non-profit housing co-ops that provide housing for artists, including the Beaver Hall Artists' Housing Co-operative and Arcadia Housing Co-operative. Despite some efforts, the article points out that supply is not meeting demand, and more must be done to ensure the sustainability of the arts in Toronto. The article points out that Artscape has a monopoly on providing affordable spaces to artists, and the need for more models. It is also useful to see an example of how precarious and unaffordable Toronto is for one artist, rather than discussing artists as a whole.



Williams, G. (2019). As Rents rise, Artists are Reviving the Idea of the Medieval Guild. *The New York Times.* <https://www.nytimes.com/2019/04/25/t-magazine/craft-guild-la-friche-zaventem-ateliers.html>



Europe, Co-working, Collective Impact, Workspaces, Gentrification Responses



This article describes artists' co-working spaces as a revival of the medieval guild. During the medieval times, craft guilds were conceived as a way for artisans to organize themselves in skill-based communities. Through these communities, artists could control production, qualities, support apprenticeship and obtain local influence. The article details several artist co-working spaces across Europe. Each is unique but share the similarity that they make use of older abandoned buildings.



City of Toronto (2017). *King-Spadina Cultural Spaces Retention Study: Strengthening the Creative Economy in Toronto's Downtown Core.* https://www.toronto.ca/wp-content/uploads/2018/01/8e62-King-Spadina_Cultural_Spaces_Retention_Study_2017_.pdf

Research

 Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Housing, Cultural Development, Cultural Policy, Housing, Urban Planning, Workspaces



This report explores the cultural activities and spaces within Toronto's King-Spadina area. This area of the downtown is anticipated to grow by 25,000 residents between 2017 and 2028. Historically, the industrial buildings in this area have offered affordable and flexible workspaces for arts and culture producers. The demand for development has, however, led to their redevelopment into other uses. The rise of real estate prices also places pressure to displace many artists and art spaces currently housed in the neighbourhood.

Key findings indicate the neighbourhood's mix of culture, employment, and residences helps draw people to downtown Toronto. A review of activities identifies policy direction to reduce displacement. Internationally and nationally recognized cultural institutions have secured space by building partnerships in new real estate development projects. Other cities have promoted cultural spaces through grant programs, targeted outreach, and use of municipally owned properties for cultural purposes and incentives for new cultural space development.



Case, Cheryll (2018). *Housing in Focus. CP Planning.*

https://drive.google.com/file/d/1GpGyB_Z7bv0ppqXOhTzVc6X72eyPnqPgb/view

Research

 Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Etobicoke, Scarborough, Weston, Community Development, Grassroots, Human Rights, Non-Profit, Urban Planning, Housing, Gentrification Responses



This report describes the need for community planning consultations to reflect and include the interests of lower income and underserved residents. It summarizes that a reflection and response to the interests of these residents will improve the ability for land use planning to increase their access to adequate and affordable housing.

The report quotes the City of Toronto's 2015 report which states the need to expand engagement beyond the typical urban planning consultation attendee, "white, male homeowners over the age of 55". This demographic has the lowest need to see an increase in affordable housing supply. As such, they are more likely to engage in community planning consultations to support policy decisions that oppose or limit the ability to produce affordable housing.


The report also includes the four land use maps produced by the 140 residents who participated in Housing in Focus workshops. These land use maps illustrate what residents in Weston, Etobicoke Lakeshore, Danforth Village, and Maryale-Wexford believe their neighbourhoods may look like if housing was treated as a human right. These maps support the development of a wide range of housing, beyond what is currently supported, and dedicate a significant amount of land to co-op and non-profit housing.



Cobalt Connects. (n.d.). *By the Square Foot: Initial Findings Report.*

https://cobaltconnects.ca/sites/default/files/By%20the%20Square%20Foot%20-%20Initial%20Findings%20Report_2.pdf

Research

 Canada, Ontario, Hamilton, Artist Community, Arts Space

 MP, JA

This report shares findings from the research project "By the Square Foot," led by Cobalt Connects in Hamilton, Ontario. It includes responses from 17 Cultural Organizations, 42 Creative Businesses, and 167 Individual Artists & Creative Workers.

Some key findings include the fact that 93% of emerging artists, 56% of mid-career artists, and 45% of established artists earn less than \$20,000 per year. It finds that only 10% of artists without dedicated access to studio space earn over \$20,000 per year, 62% of emerging artists have no access to studio space, and 71% of artists feel their current space is limiting their success. Cost of studios for individuals ranged from \$6 to \$34 per square foot (\$300 to \$1,700 per month, average price \$700 per month, average size 600 square feet). Conversely, 43% of arts organizations rent an office or studio (21% own), and 57% of arts organizations share their office space with others.

The relatively low income of artists and additional barriers preventing many of them from accessing dedicated studio space likely explains why artists are vulnerable to the most negative aspects of gentrification. The report also asks more specific questions like, "What makes a great studio environment?", and "What kind of space would help you succeed?"

What makes a great studio environment included physical/service attributes (natural light, sound control, high quality internet), and social attributes (inspiring neighbourhood, privacy, etc.). What kind of space would help artists succeed included physical/service attributes (larger open spaces, lots of light, mix of spaces, live-work combination, computer lab, messy space, etc.) and social attributes (critical dialogue, mix of career levels and disciplines, mentorship/mentoring, easy to invite public in, etc.).

This is a valuable example of research in the Hamilton arts community that may contribute to the development of strategies aiming to mitigate against the negative effects of gentrification and/or the proposal of recommendations that may help to strengthen the arts sector. Future questions proposed include:

- Can programs be created to provide rental rate subsidies?
- Would a process like that just incent developers instead of re-evaluating the value of artists in community?
- How can more non-profit organizations move into ownership positions in key neighbourhoods?
- How do we create facilities that enable emerging artists to access the space and resources they need to grow in this sector?



Bates, L. K. (2013). Gentrification and Displacement Study: Implementing an equitable inclusive development strategy in the context of gentrification. *City of Portland, Bureau of Planning and Sustainability*. <https://www.portlandoregon.gov/bps/article/454027>



United States, Oregon, Portland, Displacement, Equitable Development, Gentrification, Inclusion, Gentrification Roots, Gentrification Ripples, Gentrification Responses



This report strives to respond to the negative consequences and outline a commitment to better understand and minimize the effects of gentrification in Portland, Oregon. Traditionally, Portland has been known for its affordability, livability, and culture. More recently, public-private investments, increasing housing prices, and changes in demographic and economic profile of residents has resulted in the displacement of small businesses and low-income residents. The report is extensive and in depth. Its coverage ranges from how to map gentrification and identify different stages of neighbourhood change to what tools might be useful depending on the stage of gentrification.

The study recommends a "market-conscious" approach to gentrification. This would allow for an inclusive development paradigm with a racial and ethnic equity lens, a recognition of how public investments affect the private market, ways to anticipate housing demand and market changes, and options to utilize the public sector to regulate and engage a range of private development and community actors to minimize effects.

The report outlines a Risk Assessment framework to assess the susceptibility or risk of gentrification using indicators based on vulnerability to displacement, recent demographic changes, and housing market conditions, plus an equity analysis to understand the specific change dynamics of a particular neighbourhood. The report also develops a policy strategy based on inclusive and equitable development and aims to match certain tools to specific stages of gentrification and the type of development being made. Five key elements of the toolkit are: community impacts policies, community benefit agreements, Inclusionary zoning, educational and technical assistance.

While this resource does not have an arts focus, it is a highly in-depth and well-researched examination of the roots, ripples, and possible responses to gentrification in a city that hosts a rich arts and culture community that is vulnerable to displacement. One of the first resources to be added to this research bibliography in 2017, it continues to provide confidence that impactful, practical solutions can be created to uncover and defy the complex, adverse forces of gentrification.



Francassa, D. (2018, May 21) SF cultural districts gain footing in preserving neighborhoods' heritage. *SF Chronicle*. <https://www.sfchronicle.com/bayarea/article/SF-cultural-districts-gain-footing-in-preserving-12929662.php>



United States, California, San Francisco, Community Benefits, Community Development, Cultural Districts, Governance, Gentrification Responses, urban Planning, Urban Policy



This article provides an overview of the cultural districts being designated in San Francisco. In the face of gentrification, these cultural district designations are an effort to preserve the heritage of neighbourhoods with

high concentrations of cultural and/or historic assets. Such a designation recognizes and promotes the cultural significance of particular neighbourhoods and provides them with funding and tools of self-determination (but not the power to slow or stop developments). This article shares a few examples of existing cultural districts, and how community organizations within its bounds have been able to play a more integral role in development because of the designation. The "cultural district" model may be one that can be applied in other cities struggling with gentrification and the need to preserve heritage.



Glow, H., Johanson, K., & Kershaw, A. (2014). 'More Yuppy Stuff Coming Soon': Gentrification, cultural policy, social inclusion and the arts. *Continuum*, 28(4), 495–508.

<https://doi.org/10.1080/10304312.2014.907870>



Governing

📄 Australia, Melbourne, Arts, Cultural Development, Cultural Policy, Gentrification Responses, Gentrification Ripples, Social Inclusion



FC

This article asks how local governments might design arts and culture policies to respond to the problems associated with gentrification. It argues that the field of cultural policy is more contested than the literature assumes. It also argues there is significant agency of local governments to be active mediators of complex problems such as gentrification, displacement, and socio-economic polarization. It suggests that local governments can carve their own path to navigate gentrification.

The authors use the case study of Maribyrnong, a Western suburb of Melbourne in Australia, to examine polarized factors that identify the impact of gentrification in Maribyrnong, the influence of gentrification on arts and cultural activities, and how the council reconciles the opportunities/challenges of gentrification.

They find that many municipalities are faced with competing agendas of gentrification and social inclusion, as the arts and culture act as both an economic generator and tool for social inclusion. They argue that local governments need strong, compelling, and well-supported arts and cultural strategies which acknowledge gentrification as an issue, demonstrate a capacity to predict and plan for change, and develop actions for cultural policies that respond to the opportunities and threats that gentrification bring.

Existing literature suggests that public cultural policy is part of the problem; however, this case study suggests that local governments are neither "hapless nor pliable" in the face of creative city development. This case demonstrates that Maribyrnong recognizes the tensions. Cultural policies are tools that support the negotiation between complex issues of gentrification, displacement, and the arts.



W4

Madden, D. (2016). *In Defense of Housing*. Verso



Governing

📄 United States, Housing Policy, Neo-Liberalism, Right to the City, Urban Planning, Housing, Gentrification Responses



CC

This book describes housing affordability as an international issue. In the USA, there is not a single state where a full-time minimum wage worker can afford the rent of a one-bedroom dwelling. Housing is an international issue because the crisis stems from the inequalities and hostility of class-based society.

The author provides an example of the antagonizing nature of housing policy. 1949 housing policy states that the redevelopment of American "slums" improves housing affordability. Higher income neighbourhoods were not targeted for redevelopment. Due to antagonized class structure, laws which direct for affordable housing are ineffective. Claims falter when they come up against the reality of class hierarchy. Thus, laws on equity only serve to disguise the truth of inequality.

To achieve housing affordability, an approach is needed to attain "right to the city". Such an approach implements transformational change, a process of de-commodifying housing, expanding public housing, supporting alternative housing forms, and democratizing housing management.



Rancic, M. (2016, April 4). Council unanimously votes to make Toronto a Music City. *NOW Toronto*. <https://nowtoronto.com/api/content/62c7e9ce-fa77-11e5-b88c-22000b078648/>



Governing



Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Music, Musicians, Policy, Gentrification Responses



MP

This article reports on the unanimous approval of the official Music Strategy for Toronto, based on input from 36 members of Toronto Music Advisory Council (including concert promoters, record labels, booking agents, tourism official, city councillors, as well as members of the public). The strategy explicitly links access to affordable housing to a strong music sector and argues that the city must mitigate the loss of artistic talent to neighbouring cities with lower costs of living. The article argues that the high cost of living in Toronto is due to gentrification and rising housing costs and encourages the establishment of a "Music Hub" to serve as the epicentre of the city's music community. The author of this piece notes that the effectiveness of the strategy rests on how much of it is implemented following the 2017 budget. Ultimately, the article shows how arts-based responses to gentrification can be moved through local governance structures. It can be a useful case study for similar groups attempting similar actions in gentrifying cities.



Tuner, J. (2009). *Housing by People*. Marion Boyars Publishers Ltd



Governing



Global South, Economics, Housing Markets, Housing, Gentrification Responses



CC

This book questions how housing should be organized. In their analysis of lower income countries, such as those in South America, the author repeats statements that housing management centralization is the key culprit causing the housing crisis.

Housing management includes regulations regarding its construction, who can construct, and where it may be constructed. Centralization helps the rich and wealthy by limiting housing management to a few powerful members: politicians, bureaucrats, architects etc. The existence of larger organizations also standardizes housing, limiting the ability for households to co-produce or find housing that meets their unique needs. To decentralize housing management is to allow housing to better reflect human values.

Strategies of decentralization include:

- Permitting more homeowners to have the power to decide what happens to their property
- Lessen regulation on what materials can be used (but make sure it is safe)

- De-packing housing (increase freedom of types, management systems, and location)
- Move away from prescriptive planning to proscriptive planning.



UNESCO: United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization. (2016). *Culture Urban Future: Global Report on Culture for Sustainable Urban Development.* Paris (France).
<http://unesdoc.unesco.org/images/0024/002459/245999e.pdf>



Governing

United Nations, Case Studies, Creative cities, Cultural Development, Cultural Policy, Cultural Plans, Global Affairs, Report, Sustainable Development, Gentrification Responses



FC

This report explores the role of culture in urban development and sustainability. Much of this report focuses on the Global South. Its guiding question is how has culture influenced urban development and how can culture make a difference to our urban future?

The report is as a policy framework that supports governments in the implementation of the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Urban Development and the New Urban Agenda. The report analyses the situation, trends, threats, and existing opportunities in different regions. It presents a global picture of urban heritage safeguarding, conservation, and management, as well as the promotion of cultural and creative industries, as resources for sustainable urban development.

It highlights the significance of culture in the support of economic development. The section on North American cities emphasizes the trend of Urban Renewal. Urban Renewal is a process which involves the widespread replacement of dense, mixed-use, and low-rise historic neighbourhoods, with new denser mid to high-rise construction. It outlines key trends in North American urbanism such as immigration, cultural diversity, and the emergence of social justice and participatory democracy movements.

The report argues that culture has been at the core of many urban regeneration strategies initiated after the 1960s, particularly as part of post-industrial decline reversal strategies. Thus, a new vision of sustainable urbanism is emerging that combines heritage, contemporary design, and environmental awareness. It briefly mentions the negative consequences of these trends, mainly gentrification, and also offers little analysis on how artists and culture workers are directly affected.



W8

Whyte, M. (2016, October 23). Skyrocketing commercial rents purge reluctant artists from Toronto's west end. *The Star*. <https://www.thestar.com/entertainment/visualarts/2016/10/23/skyrocketing-commercial-rents-purge-reluctant-artists-from-the-west-end.html>



Governing

Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Affordable Spaces, Art Spaces, Artscape, Commercial Space, Policy, Real Estate, Resistance, Gentrification Responses, Gentrification Roots, Artists Housing, Workspaces



MP

This article reports on the displacement of a several dozen artists and independent creative enterprises from 224 Wallace Ave in Toronto. The displacement occurred as a result of Ubisoft's acquisition of additional space in the building. Ubisoft is a \$2 billion video game corporation based in France. It received a \$263 million Ontario grant.

In Toronto, commercial rents have "skyrocketed," to average \$26.44 per square foot (annually) in Q3 of 2016 for spaces under 1,000 square feet, up from \$15.89 per square foot in 2006. Active 18, a community organization, is cited as an example of effective artists' organizing and advocating. With the use of Section 37 funds, they secured permanent artists' space in Artscape and Urbancorp's redevelopment of 48 Abell St.

At 224 Wallace, frustrated artists were resigned to their fate of eviction. The local city councillor faces significant challenges to halt the "trend" of displacement across Toronto's West End. They are limited by the lack of rent control and the powers of the Ontario Municipal Board to supersede City of Toronto decisions.



Wheeler, T., Fish, N., & Eudaly, C. (2018). *A Plan for Preserving and Expanding Affordable Arts Space in Portland.* <https://www.portlandoregon.gov/fish/article/667747>



Governing



United States, Oregon, Portland, Affordable Spaces, Arts Policy, Cultural Policy, Artist Housing, Workspaces, Venues, Gentrification Responses



FC

This report's policy recommendations aim to support the preservation and expansion of affordable arts space in Portland, Oregon. Portland, like Toronto, is experiencing rapid gentrification. This makes it harder for artists to live and work in the city. The ongoing housing crisis, displacement, gentrification, aggressive development, and real estate market dynamics threaten the strong and diverse creative culture in Portland. This report was created by several stakeholders and city staff. The wide coordination illustrates the depth and urgency of the problem. After its declaration that a strong creative culture is a powerful economic, equity, and community development tool, this report argues that Portland's role as a creative hub is not inevitable and will be lost unless there is immediate action. It then outlines and describes 24 recommendations that include the public, private, and non-profit involvement. Overall, the resource is valuable in that it recognizes the importance of municipal action in all areas including building, preserving, funding, zoning, advocating, and mapping.

The 24 recommendations include:

- Re-establish, expand, and empower the position of Arts Concierge in the Bureau of Development Services
- Create an inventory and map of creative spaces in Portland
- Certify creative spaces
- Expand opportunities for rooftop creative spaces
- Explore and minimize obstacles to the creation of new gallery spaces
- Explore options to incentivize creative space landlords
- Refine requirements for new "live-work" spaces
- Establish a "Creative Space" definition in the Mixed-Use Zoning Code
- Exempt creative space from FAR and height limits in certain projects
- Tailor the 2% For Art program
- Incorporate creative space into the commercial spaces of affordable housing developments
- Require creative space in public buildings of a certain size
- Create an Artist-in-Residence program in certain public buildings
- Create a system of "art pods" in public spaces
- Explore the creation of an arts-specific real estate investment model
- Priority access in the City Disposition process
- Provide short-term affordable leases for interim uses ahead of future development
- Work with community-based organizations to explore opportunities and develop a strategy for culturally-specific creative spaces

- Invest in retrofitting existing underused City property for creative space
- Work with Neighborhood Associations and Business Districts to establish Creative Districts
- Build affordable creative space into district plans
- Encourage colleges and hospitals to increase gallery spaces on campus
- Coordinate with other governmental partners on regional solutions
- Find ways to expand and organize Portland’s philanthropic community.

Community Wealth-Building



Choi, M., Van Zandt, S., & Matarrita-Cascante, D. (2017). Can community land trusts slow gentrification? *Journal of Urban Affairs*, 40(3), 394–411.



Community Wealth-Building



United States, Community Land Trusts, Gentrification Responses



FC

This research paper seeks to answer whether and how Community Land Trusts (CLTs) affect gentrification, and how they may counteract negative effects. While there is extensive research on the benefits of CLTs, there is little empirical data to confirm these claims. For instance, the primary purpose and benefit of CLTs is to preserve long-term affordable housing in neighbourhoods by removing houses, buildings, and lands from the market. Secondly, CLTs enhance neighbourhood stability by increasing length of residency, preventing displacement of low-income households, and maintaining optimal unit conditions by ensuring security of tenure. Thirdly, CLTs contribute to the building of community assets because owner-occupants interact regularly based on shared residential interests. The findings suggest that CLTs are effective tools that stabilize neighbourhoods at risk of gentrification.



Davis, J. E. (2010). Reallocating Equity: A Land Trust Model of Land Reform. In *The Community Land Trust Reader* (pp. 363–383). Cambridge, Massachusetts: Lincoln Inst of Land Policy.



Community Wealth-Building



United States, Community Land Trusts, Housing Markets, Land Value, Gentrification Responses



FC

Although slightly out-dated, this chapter offers a significant outline and analysis of the most critical roots of the housing crises. These roots are identified as the perpetuation of private property, land speculation, and financialization.

Davis argues that Community Land Trusts (CLTs) are not only a significant disruption of the capitalist housing market, but they offer an alternative model that has several key benefits for residents, communities, and society at large. CLTs extend the privileges and advantages of property to those who would be denied otherwise. They contribute to meaningful community development by allowing local groups to exercise enough control over local land and housing to promote local economic development.

The chapter is a valuable resource in understanding both the roots of unaffordability and the possibilities and promises of an alternative land ownership model. The author is a leading expert on CLTs, often cited as the international historian on this type of model. He does a great job at placing CLTs in their historical and economic context. He describes their limitations and opportunities and explains how they are successful in addressing the issue of equity, which drives the housing market and American society at large.



Galley, A. (n.d.). Community Benefits Agreements. *Mowat Centre and Atkinson Foundation*.
<http://communitybenefitsagreements.ca/>



Community Wealth-Building



Canada, Ontario, Case Studies, Collective Impact, Community Benefit Agreements, Community building, Fair Pay, Recommendations, Urban Planning, Urban Policy, Gentrification Responses



FC

This Mowat report was commissioned by the Atkinson Foundation. Although Community Benefit Agreements (CBAs) are not directly related to arts and culture, they present an opportunity to mediate the negative effects of gentrification, build community wealth, and respond to growing precarity and inequality in Ontario.

There is a potential for arts-focused CBAs through local procurement for public art or the development of arts spaces/hubs. As this article explains, CBAs are a strategic tool used in the process of building community wealth, typically applied for projects with large amounts of government spending and investment. They are negotiated agreements between private or public development agents and community-based groups. In exchange for the developer making a commitment to the delivery of benefits, the coalition often pledges to support the approval of the development.

When negotiating a community benefits agreement, a coalition seeks three elements: employment opportunities, affordable housing, community and environmental improvements. CBAs are often attached to large development projects and are highly time sensitive. Often, there are four phases: negotiation and coalition formation, development of platform for negotiation, implementation planning, focus on outcomes.

This report explains the structure of CBAs and the process for creating them. It references case studies from other cities and describes the Ontario context. Finally, it identifies next steps. This report is only one approach to CBA and could be complimented with other perspectives. It does a good job at grounding CBAs in the Ontario context and laying out the pre-existing policy framework.



Kelly, M., & McKinley, S. (2015). 7 Paths to Development That Bring Neighborhoods Wealth, Not Gentrification. *YES! Magazine*. <http://www.yesmagazine.org/new-economy/7-paths-to-development-that-bring-neighborhoods-wealth-not-gentrification-20151111>



Community Wealth-Building



Community Wealth, Gentrification, Grassroots, Inclusion, Gentrification Responses, Revitalization, Strategies



FC

In light of worsening inequality and poverty concentration across the USA, this article asks how we can reimagine, design, and implement an economic system that builds the wealth and prosperity of everyone. The rationale is the solution to widening income and wealth inequality is to increase community wealth.

Seven key drivers work together to increase community wealth:

- Place
- Ownership
- Multipliers
- Collaboration
- Inclusion
- Workforce
- System.

Ultimately, the article suggests that the local level is a critical scale to build wealth, through anchor institutions, social enterprises, and local partnerships. The author argues that localized economies are the antidote to globalization and gentrification. The centre of this argument is an inclusive focus on the needs of low-income families, people of colour, and those with barriers to employment. This resource provides a thorough framework for community ownership and wealth. Although it is US based and does not focus on the arts, the structure and clarity is useful in understanding possible responses to gentrification.



X5

MacKinnon, E., & Pellerin, C. (2018). More than Money: How social finance can build resilience in the arts sector. *Metcalf Foundation*. <https://metcalffoundation.com/stories/publications/more-than-money/>



Community Wealth-Building



Canada, Artscape, Arts, Finance, Funding, Performing arts, Social capital, Social Finance, Social Innovation, Venues, Workspaces



MP

This report proposes that social finance can build resilience into the arts sector. The authors offer a thorough explanation of social finance, and provide a useful overview of the Canadian charity, non-profit, and impact investing landscapes. While the social finance sector is still in its nascent stages in Canada, the authors note that it is growing (most recently supported with the launch of the Canada Social Finance Fund after the publication of this report). They suggest that social finance can foster relationships and activities that sustain the arts sector in the long-term.

An in-depth look at the Arts Impact fund in the UK is shared, a key example of social finance with a focus on the arts. Brief overviews of Canadian examples of social finance in the arts are also shared, including Artscape Daniels Launchpad, Centre3 for Print and Media Arts in Hamilton, and The Harbourfront Centre. While this report does not speak to gentrification, social finance can be one way to address interdependent connections between economic and spatial precarity in the arts. Three considerations for arts organizations interested in pursuing social finance are identified: Awareness and knowledge; Mindset; and, Measuring social impacts.



X6

The Parkdale People's Economy Project (2016). *Parkdale Community Planning Study: Building a foundation for decent work, shared wealth and equitable development in Parkdale.*

https://parkdalecommunityeconomies.files.wordpress.com/2016/11/20161121_pced_final.pdf



Community Wealth-Building



Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Parkdale, Urban Planning



FC

This report is part of the Parkdale Community Economic Development Planning Project, funded by the Atkinson Foundation. It is led by Toronto's Parkdale Activity and Recreation Centre, with collaboration from 25 community-based organizations.

This report is just one example of Parkdale's resilience, organizing in the face of gentrification. The aim of the report is to develop future visions for growth, change, and urban planning in Parkdale and strategies to realize them. It developed out of community action research, stakeholder engagement, and participatory planning. The goal is to create a neighbourhood plan for decent work, shared wealth building, and equitable development.

The report summarizes and synthesizes outcomes of the community planning process and research which aimed to develop a Parkdale Neighbourhood Plan. It begins with an overview of Community Economic Development (CED), and highlights market, asset, and systems approaches to CED. The report emphasizes the importance of a systems approach. This approach is emphasized because it aims to build alternative institutions that promote collective ownership and democratic control of three areas in the economy: land, money, and labour. This is the core of Parkdale's commitment to equitable development and shared wealth, which forms the basis of this report.

The report illustrates the history of neighbourhood change in Parkdale, outlines critical trends of urban decay and regeneration, and the re-branding of West Queen West and Liberty Village. It then reports on the outcomes of the Parkdale Neighbourhood Wellbeing Indicators which can be harnessed for multiple purposes. The Indicators include:

- Learning
- Accessibility & inclusion
- Housing & land use
- Economic opportunities for decent work
- Health and food security
- Social & natural infrastructure
- Participatory democracy.

Following this, the report outlines challenges, assets, directions, and policy options in seven key areas of community development. They key areas are social infrastructure, affordable housing and land use, decent work and inclusive economic opportunities, food security, community financing, participatory local democracy, and cultural development.

The research methods for this report are rooted in the community's highly engaged process. Although there is no direct reference to the arts, it does mention the necessity of multi-purpose cultural hubs. Moreover, the report highlights "Art and culture as a platform for community building" as an asset in the neighbourhood. This emphasizes community cultural development as a unique avenue that encourages dialogue, learning, community building and expressions of diverse identities and visions.

The report identifies "Making Room Community Arts" as an active and prominent group working in the neighbourhood. Considering the rapid degree of development in Parkdale and the activism and organizing taking place, this resource is highly valuable guide to engaged planning,

Protesting



Milton, J. (2016, October 31). Anti-Gentrification Groups Push for Community-Centered Spaces.

The Link. <https://thelinknewspaper.ca/article/anti-gentrification-groups-push-for-community-centred-spaces>



Protesting



Canada, Montreal, Gentrification Roots, Gentrification Ripples, Gentrification Responses, Protests, Community Engagement



HG

This article describes the effects of gentrification in the Southwest region of downtown Montreal and the response from the community members. The forces of gentrification began when the Lachine Canal and nearby factories shutdown in downtown Montreal closed in the 1970's, leaving many abandoned buildings. By 1990, the city decided to go back on its social approach to housing and take a "neo-liberal" one. This act resulted private markets taking control of neighbourhood development in the Canal. They increased rent and brought forth businesses with the purpose to draw people towards the neighbourhood, which increased stress for low-income residents.

Community protests called for the city to create a tax reserve for social housing and community development, zoning to protect small businesses from drastic tax increases, and support for reclamation of abandoned buildings like the 2012 takeover of Building 7, a former warehouse, by community organizations in Pointe-St-Charles. Through these reclaimed spaces, community organizations aim to create a new economic model where they can control the means of production by owning their land and redistributing profits to workers and the community. The goal is to increase the success of businesses that gear themselves towards locals as opposed to supporting the destination businesses.



Tianga, K. A. (2017, July 21). Art in the Face of Gentrification. *Shelterforce*.

<https://shelterforce.org/2017/07/21/art-face-gentrification/>



Protest



United States, New York, Manhattan, Bronx, Brooklyn, Displacement, Gentrification Roots, Gentrification Responses, Grassroots, Community arts, Community Building



HG

This article describes how residents and organizations can protest and face gentrification by sharing tools and information through town halls or community meetings and helping to fight landlord harassment by locating legal services. Others leave a visual legacy in their communities as well as form intergenerational bridges through art to keep their culture alive, claim space, and disrupt gentrification and displacement. Artists can help by sharing spaces and resources with the community, hiring people of color, hiring within the community, making sure that their community outreach is intentional and conscious, and looking for opportunities to co-lead programming with the community.

Toolkits



Hudson Valley Pattern for Progress (2016). *Beyond Gentrification: Finding a Balance*.

<http://www.pattern-for-progress.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/04/2016-housing-report-Gentrification-Finding-a-Balance.pdf>



Toolkits



United States, New York, Displacement, Gentrification, Gentrification Advantages, Gentrification Responses, Revitalization, Tools



FC

This report provides an analysis of gentrification in the Hudson Valley in New York. It outlines the advantages and disadvantages of the process, public perceptions through surveys and interviews, a comparison of 4 cities, and a public policy toolkit to mitigate displacement and preserve affordable housing. This article outlines how in some cases gentrification may serve as an economic development tool in distressed areas, yet it may be harmful for existing and vulnerable residents if there are not strong protections to prevent raising rents or displacement.



Lydon, M. (2015). *Tactical Urbanism: Short-term Action for Long-term Change*. Island Press

 **Toolkits**

 Smart City, Urban Design, Urban Development, Urbanism, Public Space



This book focuses on the ability for tactical urbanism, small-scale actions, to serve a larger purpose. The authors describe tactical urbanism as projects that require local work, take a short amount of time to implement, are low cost, scalable, and require little policy intervention. Tactical urbanism embraces the dynamism of cities by experimenting with public spaces to produce new, temporary, or permanent experiences. Example experimentations include use empty stores, parking lots, and parking spaces, use of public streets and posts, and use of traffic islands.

The author explains that these community driven interventions contribute to resiliency and help cities and citizens explore a more nuanced and nimble approach to city making. Many of these interventions start as a project led by common citizens but may lead to government support and formal implementation later. One chapter provides a guide of how to produce a tactical urbanism project. This may be a useful resource for artists interested in producing an intervention related to the access of affordable housing or artist space.



Place Lab. (2017). *9 Principles of Ethical Redevelopment*. University of Chicago.

https://static1.squarespace.com/static/56aa853d25981d66ccbcd2/t/5790f7c61b631be8a7a255fd/1469118407300/EthRed_9Pbooklet.pdf

 **Toolkits**

 United States, Illinois, Chicago, Equitable Development, Ethical Redevelopment



Place Lab is a Chicago team of professionals from the diverse fields of law, urban planning, architecture, design, social work, arts administration, and gender/cultural studies. Place Lab is a catalyst for mindful urban transformation and creative redevelopment. The team worked to document and demonstrate urban ethical redevelopment strategies initiated through arts and culture.

The term "Ethical Redevelopment" makes the case for mindful city-building. It utilizes cross-city networks and cross-sector innovation to encapsulate a philosophy that shifts the value system from conventional, profit-driven development practices to conscientious interventions in the urban context. Ethical Redevelopment is articulated by 9 principles that were drawn from artist-led, neighbourhood-based development work on Chicago's south side. They are:


- Repurpose and re-propose
- Engaged participation
- Pedagogical moments
- The indeterminate
- Design
- Place over time
- Stack, leverage, and access
- Constellations
- Platforms.



Toronto Artscape. (2011). *Square Feet: The Artist’s Guide to Renting and Buying Creative Space.*

http://www.artscapediy.org/ArtscapeDIY/MediaLibrary/ArtscapeDIY/ArtscapeMedia/documents/square_feet_2011.pdf

Toolkits

 Canada, Ontario, Toronto, Arts, Artscape, Placemaking, Resources, Gentrification Responses, Toolkits, Workspaces

 FC

This informational manual by Toronto Artscape provides information relevant to purchasing and leasing artist workspaces. The manual is meant to guide artists, administrators, or board members through their search for space. The manual aims to help these groups make informed decisions about whether to lease or buy, how much to spend, what is a suitable space, where to look for it, and how to cope when things go awry. Although it is Toronto specific, the manual claims that much of the information is relevant to the needs of artists across Ontario and Canada. The manual is divided into five chapters:

- Getting Ready, which helps individuals decide on live/work or studio space, how much space they need and what amenities, and what they can afford
- Leasing, outlines the rights and obligations of both landlords and tenants and offers suggestions for how to ensure that you fully understand the terms of a lease before you sign
- Buying, explains the differences in commercial and residential properties, alternative models of ownership and how to access legal help),
- The Hunt offers suggestions on how to find ideal space, tips for how to use a realtor, and explains regulations like zoning and building permits
- When things go wrong which offers advice in the case of disputes with neighbours, or what to do if you find yourself without a place to live or work.

The manual is a useful resource insofar as it stresses the importance of securing tenure for artists and offers strategies and advice on how to achieve this. The manual is designed to guide readers through the process of getting legal, securing tenure in a space that suits their needs without fear of eviction.

It also explains alternative models of ownership such as: sole ownership, joint tenancy, tenancy in common, condominium, and co-operatives. This section is very useful, as it goes in-depth about these models and provides concrete examples of each. Unlike other resources that prioritize creative placemaking, this is meant to help individual artists and outlines models that vary from Artscape.



Urban Institute. (2006). *Keeping the Neighborhood Affordable: A Handbook of Housing Strategies for Gentrifying Areas.* <https://www.urban.org/sites/default/files/publication/50796/411295-Keeping-the-Neighborhood-Affordable.PDF>

Toolkits

 Gentrification, Toolkit, Tools, Housing

 CC

This handbook separates affordable housing strategies into three categories: housing production, housing retention, and asset building. Strategies to produce affordable housing are described as an important way to mitigate the displacement of low- and moderate-income households. Tools in this category include trust funds, inclusionary zoning, and tax credits.

The handbook notes that neighbourhoods that do not appear to have space need to use creative spaces to free up land for development. Creative methods include altering zoning or converting vacant lots into developable parcels and strategies to retain affordable housing target private market and publicly subsidized rental housing. Methods include code enforcement, rent control, and tax relief.

Strategies to build resident assets aim to help low income individuals accumulate wealth. Methods include education and counseling, limited equity co-ops, and homeownership support programs.

Areas that are experiencing gentrification related displacement are unlikely to see neighbourhood level impact from asset building work. As a neighbourhood becomes more gentrified, it becomes more difficult to build affordable housing. In these cases, it is better to direct efforts towards preserving affordable housing. It is best to build affordable housing before a neighbourhood begins to gentrify.

Profile



Cultivating progressive ideas and untapped potential in the arts into exceptional, everyday shared realities for collective impact on-the-ground and in-the-cloud.

ArtsPond is a changemaker of a different sort.

Devoted to radical inclusivity, our mandate is to strengthen the potential of artistic expression to nurture healthy human ecosystems that cultivate equity and social cohesion by **boosting social, spatial, economic, and digital justice** and other urgent systemic issues in under-served communities across Canada and beyond.

Purposefully, we foster cooperative actions fusing values and practices from community-engaged arts, human-centered design, evidence-based action and applied research, social innovation, social finance, and collective impact as a means to uproot intractable systemic issues from gentrification and economic inequality to the digital divide.

Cultivating a more creative and open society, we intentionally adopt collaborative practices **crossing cultural, economic, geographic, political, social, and technological boundaries**. We actively enable and celebrate the perspectives of diverse **interdisciplinary, intergenerational, intercultural, and interability** voices. We do so with the assumption that the full spectrum of humanity is better together than we are apart, and community-engaged creativity is a crucial element to bolster and intertwine the best in us all.

Founded as a grassroots entity in 2014, and federally incorporated as a non-profit in 2016, ArtsPond's major actions currently include **I Lost My Gig Canada** (economic justice), **DigitalASO, Artse United + Hatch Open** (digital justice), and **Groundstory + Groundtrust** (spatial justice).



Groundstory is a collective impact effort to uproot the adverse effects of gentrification on the arts in the Greater Toronto to Hamilton Area. Groundstory asks the question, "What would it take for 75% of arts and culture workers to feel satisfied with their shelter, studios, and spaces of public engagement by 2030?" Phase 1 activities from 2017 to 2020 included regional focus groups and human-centered design workshops, an international literature review, national impact survey, Round the Block spatial justice podcast, and more.



Groundtrust is a youth-led initiative promoting awareness and innovation in the evolution of social purpose real estate solutions in the arts in Toronto and across Ontario through shared learning online. Phase 1 actions from 2020 to 2022 feature research and dissemination of literacy toolkits, podcasts, webinars and workshops on community land trusts and other models that prioritize public good over profit. Groundtrust's objectives are to promote the capacity of impacted youth leaders and community groups to envision and realize affordable, arts-led social purpose real estate projects rooted in their communities for public benefit.



ArtsPond.com
@ArtsPond8